

**ABUSE IN CARE ROYAL COMMISSION OF INQUIRY
FAITH-BASED INSTITUTIONAL RESPONSE HEARING**

Under The Inquiries Act 2013

In the matter of The Royal Commission of Inquiry into Historical Abuse in State Care and in the Care of Faith-based Institutions

Royal Commission: Judge Coral Shaw (Chair)
Dr Anaru Erueti
Ali'imuamua Sandra Alofivae
Paul Gibson

Counsel: Mr Simon Mount QC, Ms Kerryn Beaton QC, Ms Katherine Anderson, Ms Tania Sharkey, Mr Michael Thomas, Ms Kathy Basire and Ms Alisha Castle for the Royal Commission

Ms Rachael Schmidt-McCleave and Ms Julia White for the Crown

Ms Sally McKechnie and Ms Brooke Clifford for Te Rōpū Tautoko, the Catholic Bishops and Congregational Leaders

Ms India Shores for the Anglican Church

Ms Maria Dew, Ms Kiri Harkess and Mr Lourenzo Fernandez for the Methodist Church of New Zealand and Wesley College

Ms Lydia Oosterhoff for the Survivor Network of those Abused by Priests

Mr Brian Henry for Gloriavale Leavers' Support Trust

Mr Chris Shannon and Ms Clare Sykes for Gloriavale Christian Community

Venue: Level 2
Abuse in Care Royal Commission of Inquiry
414 Khyber Pass Road
AUCKLAND

Date: 13 October 2022

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

INDEX

OPENING STATEMENT BY THE ROYAL COMMISSION	6
OPENING STATEMENT BY THE CROWN	11
OPENING STATEMENT BY SAGE	21
OPENING STATEMENT BY SNAP	24
OPENING STATEMENT BY THE GLORIAVALE LEAVERS' SUPPORT TRUST	27
OPENING STATEMENT BY GLORIAVALE	30
HOWARD WENDELL TEMPLE Questioning by Mr Shannon	34
RACHEL STEDFAST Questioning by Ms Sykes	37
HOWARD WENDELL TEMPLE AND RACHEL STEDFAST Questioning by Ms Basire Questioning by Commissioners	40 97

Hearing opens with waiata Purea Nei and karakia tīmatanga by Ngāti Whātua Ōrākei

[9.11 am]

KAUMATUA NGATI WHĀTUA: (Waiata Purea Nei). (Karakia – Me īnoi tātou – he hōnora, he korōria ki te Atua. He maungārongo ki te whenua me te whakaaro pai ki ngā tāngata katoa. Hangaia e te Atua he ngākau hou ki roto ki tēnā, ki roto o tātou i tēnei whare, ki tēnā o tātou wairua hoki o waenganui i a koutou, He piki te ora, he piki te kaha. He piki te māramatanga me tau te rangimārie, ngā whakamoemiti, whakawhetai ki te wairua o tātou tēnei whare. Mā te wairua o tātou, o tēnei tangata katoa, me hoki koe o tātou tini aituā, āke tonu āke...)

(Let's pray. Honour and glory to God. Peace upon the land and goodwill to all men. Build for us, dear Lord, a new heart in each and every one of us here in this house and those brought here in spirit. Heal and strengthen us. Give us enlightenment and settle your peace upon us. We give thanks and are thankful for the spirit of man here amongst us in this dwelling. May your spirit be with all present, and upon those we carry in spirit for evermore... Thank you, please sit.)

Heavenly father, we thank you for this special day that we have gathered together. We have come together to understand, to talk and to deliberate about our social tikanga. We ask thee for sharing the love, the peace, the harmony and unity. We ask all these things in your name, ake tonu ake, āmine.

Āmine. Kia ora mai anō tātou e noho mai. Mea tuatahi i te mihi ana ki a koe tae mai nei o tēnei wā o tātou tēnei te kaupapa o te rā nei. Anā te taumata o te Kōmihana, tēnei te mihi aroha tae mai ana i tēnei mahi i a koutou. Huri noa i a tātou i tēnei wā. E ngā mana, e ngā reo, e ngā mātāwaka, tēnei te mihi atu ki a koe, ki a koutou, āe, nau mai haere mai, haere mai, whakatau mai rā. Haere mai ki roto tātou i tēnei whare, the pare, ko te mana o tātou tēnei whare. Te wairua hoki ki a koutou katoa me te kotahitanga i tae mai nei o tātou tēnei mahi. Nō reira, ki a koutou he poto mihi aroha tae mai i tēnei wā o Ngāti Whātua Ōrākei ki a koutou katoa, haere mai, haere mai, whakatau mai rā.

Haere mai ki roto tātou i tēnei whare, the pare, the mana o tātou tēnei whare. The wairua hoki ki a koutou katoa me te kotahitanga i tae mai nei o tātou tēnei mahi. No reira, ki a koutou e puta mihi aroha tae mai tēnei wā o Ngāti Whātua Ōrākei ki a koutou katoa, haere mai, haere mai, whakatau mai rā.

(I want to first greet all of you for being here today for what we are here for. I acknowledge the panel, in my compassion for you for what we are about to do today. I greet all of the powers, the speakers and from all walks of life, welcome, welcome,

1 welcome. Come into this house and the authority of this house. Let us be one in spirit for
 2 what we're doing today. I'm here on behalf of Ngāti Whātua Ōrākei and with that
 3 I welcome you all. Welcome, welcome.)

4 Firstly, I acknowledge to our Commissioners who – their role to serve us, the
 5 people, and the work that they do in understanding and deliberating for the benefit of us all.
 6 So I welcome you, welcome you to this marae, to this whare under the mantle of the pare,
 7 of the mana and the ihi, the wehi (the power, the inspiration and the awe) of our
 8 Commissioners, and to say that we of Ngāti Whātua support them and us all that we walk
 9 the pathway together.

10 Nā reira, i a koutou rangatira mā, tēnei te mihi atu ki a koe, ki a koutou, ā tēnā
 11 koutou, ā tēnā koutou, nō reira huri noa tātou tēnei whare, tēnā koutou, tēnā tātou, kia ora
 12 mai anō tātou. (With this, my esteemed people here today, here is my greeting to you all,
 13 each and every one of you here in the house. My greetings, acknowledgements and
 14 salutations to all present.)

15 **CHAIR:** Kia ora. Tēnā koutou, tēnā koutou, arā, tēnā rā tātou katoa. E mihi ana ki te mana
 16 whenua Ngāti Whātua Ōrākei tēnā koutou e tautoko ana i tēnei kaupapa nui. Tēnei te mihi
 17 ki a koe Matua mō tō karakia, mō tō manaaki ki a mātou. E mihi ana ki a koutou ko ngā
 18 purapura ora, koutou i rongohia te mamae kia kaha, kia manawanui. E mihi ana ki a koutou
 19 e mātakitaki mai ana e whakarongo mai ana, tēnā koutou, tēnā koutou, kia ora anā tātou
 20 katoa.

21 (My greetings to you all. I acknowledge the tribal authority, Ngāti Whātua Ōrākei.
 22 I salute you for your support of these significant proceedings today. To you, Matua thank
 23 you for your karakia and for the care you have extended to us. I acknowledge you, the
 24 survivors, for the pain you have suffered, be brave and steadfast. To those of you who are
 25 watching and listening, my greetings to each and every one.)

26 I recognise the mana whenua, Ngāti Whātua Ōrākei, and thank our kaumātua for his
 27 blessings on these proceedings. Thank you for supporting this important kaupapa.

28 I particularly want to acknowledge all of the survivors who've experienced hurt in
 29 their lives and who continue to bear the pain of what they have been through. Be strong
 30 hearted.

31 And then I greet all of you have who are here today, or who are watching and
 32 listening in on our livestream, warm greetings to you all.

33 My name is Coral Shaw, I am the Chair of the Royal Commission into Abuse in
 34 Care and for those who cannot see me as this is World Sight Day, I will describe myself as

1 an elderly Pākehā woman with white short hair, I wear glasses, otherwise I am not any way
2 disabled.

3 Just a brief introduction. The Royal Commission, for those of you who do not
4 know already, is investigating the abuse and neglect of thousands of children, young people
5 and vulnerable adults while they were in the care of the State and/or in the care of
6 faith-based institutions since the 1950s.

7 Since 2019 we have held many weeks of public hearings, mostly focusing and
8 listening to the voices of survivors to give them the best opportunity to share their accounts
9 of what they have experienced. They have told us how they were taken into care, what
10 happened to them while they were in care, and the lasting effects of the abuse and neglect
11 that they suffered. Importantly, we've heard from them their hopes for future generations.
12 These accounts have been deeply moving and deeply distressing.

13 So our final hearings are designed to give Aotearoa New Zealand the chance to hear
14 from the organisations who were responsible for that care and responsible for that abuse
15 and neglect.

16 It's also to give those organisations the chance to give their explanations of what
17 happened and their views of what should happen in the future. These hearings give the
18 Commissioners a chance to listen and examine the institutional responses of those
19 organisations.

20 In our last hearing we heard from the State organisations, from chief executives and
21 senior leaders of those; and today, starting today and going through to the end of next week,
22 we will hear from the leaders of faith institutions.

23 It's worth noting that while those two hearings were separated into State and
24 faith-based, there's considerable overlap and in the State hearing we heard a lot about the
25 role of the State in faith care and, similarly, there will be references throughout this hearing
26 towards the State's responsibility for those who were in the care of faith-based
27 organisations.

28 So, today, we start hearing from the faith-based institutions and Counsel Assist will
29 give us a full detail and run down of what is to follow. But can I just say that it's critical
30 that we find out not only what went wrong in the past, but why it went wrong and, indeed,
31 what continues to go wrong so that we can ensure that it does not keep happening.

32 I just want to end on a note for survivors. I'm conscious that particularly for
33 survivors who were abused in faith-based care, the evidence we will hear over the next few
34 days may well be upsetting to you and even triggering to you. The Royal Commission has

1 a very strong well-being assistance team available here in the room and in the building for
2 those who are attending in person. But if you are also watching on the livestream from
3 your computer or at home and you feel triggered, please feel free to contact our 0800
4 number where we have well-being assistants at the ready to assist you. Do not hesitate to
5 do that. We understand it and we want to help you if we, by any way, are causing you
6 some harm by holding this hearing.

7 So they welcome their calls but particularly I just want to welcome everybody here
8 today, it is wonderful to see the public interest in this hearing.

9 Nō reira, tēnā koutou, tēnā koutou, arā, tēnā rā tātou katoa. (My salutations to each
10 and every one of you and all here today.)

11 I now want to introduce the three other Commissioners sitting with us today.

12 Unfortunately, our fourth Commissioner, Julia Steenson, is not available, she is unwell, but
13 I'll now invite Commissioners to introduce themselves and I'll start with Dr Andrew Erueti.

14 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Tēnā koe Chair. Ko te mihi tuatahi ki te kaikarakia nānā te mana o
15 te karakia i kawē i tēnei rā. Kei te mihi ki te moana e hora nei, ko te Waitematā, e karapoti
16 ana i te Motutapu me te Rangī i toto ai te ihu. Ka whakaaro atu i a rātou kua mēne ki te pō,
17 e ngā mate haere, moe mai rā, moe mai rā. Ngāti Whātua ki Ōrākei te mana, te wehi, te ihi,
18 tēnā koutou me ngā manaakitanga. Kei te mihi atu ki ngā purapura ora, ngā mōrehu koutou
19 i whakauru mai, koutou e mātakitaki mai ana ki tēnei huihuinga. Tēnā koutou katoa. I'm
20 Anaru Erueti, nō Taranaki ko Ngāruahinerangi te iwi.

21 (Thank you, the Chair. I'd like to first acknowledge the delivery of our prayer,
22 today. I acknowledge the Waitematā which surrounds Motutapu and Rangitoto. My
23 thoughts are with those who have passed on into the night, may they go well, may they
24 sleep well. All power, authority and awe to you Ngāti Whātua, Ōrākei, for the blessings
25 you have bestowed. I acknowledge you the survivors who are watching and listening to
26 today's proceedings. I'm Andrew Erueti from Taranaki and the Ngāruahinerangi people),
27 one of the commissioners.

28 Welcome to everyone, looking forward to this hearing. I'm a Māori male wearing a
29 black suit and a kind of mustard-flavoured tie, and I've been told not to describe myself as
30 middle-aged but unfortunately that is the case, but nau mai, nau mai, welcome everyone.

31 **CHAIR:** Kia ora, Anaru. Next we'll hear from Paul Gibson.

32 **COMMISSIONER GIBSON:** Kia ora, Paul Gibson ahau, I'm Paul Gibson, a Commissioner.

33 Welcome everybody on International Sight Day, thanks to my colleagues who reminded me

1 of that. I'm a middle-aged man, I'm blind with some peripheral vision myself, I have one
2 headphone over one ear listening to some of the information I have on my computer. I'm
3 wearing a dark suit today with pounamu, kia ora.

4 **CHAIR:** Kia ora, Paul. Now, Ali'imuamua Sandra Alofivae.

5 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** Thank you. Tēnā koutou katoa, nau mai haere mai ki tēnei
6 kaupapa. (Greetings to you all, welcome to today's proceedings.) Faatalofa atu i le pa'ia
7 ma le mamalu o le aofia. O ē ua mafai na faatasi mai i lenei aso iinei i le fale, faatasi ma oe
8 na e matamata mai i luga o le livestream. (Greetings to distinguished guests. To everyone
9 who is present here and via livestream). It's always a privilege and a pleasure for
10 Commissioners to be able to receive the evidence that comes before it in various ways and
11 of course this public hearing is very important to us, it's our last one, and so we are here
12 listening, and we are here to understand and to learn. Malie lava.

13 **CHAIR:** Kia ora, Sandra.

14 So with us having introduced ourselves, I'm now going to invite counsel to make
15 appearances and we'll start with you, Ms Beaton.

16 **MS BEATON:** Madam Chair and Commissioners, Kerryn Beaton as Counsel Assisting the
17 Inquiry.

18 **CHAIR:** Kia ora.

19 **MS BASIRE:** Ms Basire, Counsel Assisting. E ngā Kaikōmihana, ko Kathy Basire tōku ingoa,
20 Counsel Assisting. (To you the Commissioners I am Kathy Basire.)

21 **CHAIR:** Kia ora Ms Basire.

22 **MS SCHMIDT-McCLEAVE:** Ki ngā Kaikōmihana tēnā koutou. Ko Ms Schmidt McCleave tōku
23 ingoa, ko māua nei ko Ms White ngā rōia mō te Karauna, tēnā koutou. (To you, the
24 Commissioners. My name is Ms Schmidt McCleave, myself and Ms White are the lawyers
25 for the Crown.)

26 **CHAIR:** Tēnā kōrua.

27 **MS DEW:** Tēnā koutou ngā rangatira mā, te huihui nei kei te kaupapa. Ko Ms Maria Dew ahau.
28 Matua nei, Ms Harkess and Mr Fernandez ngā rōia mō te Hāhi Wetiriana o Aotearoa.
29 (Greetings all, all of the chiefly people gathered here at these proceedings. I am Ms Maria
30 Dew. First, here are Ms Harkess and Mr Fernandez. We are the lawyers for the Wesleyan
31 Faith of New Zealand.)

32 Greetings to the Commissioners, I appear, together with my colleagues as counsel
33 for the Methodist Church of Aotearoa New Zealand and for Wesley College. Thank you.

1 **CHAIR:** Tēnā koutou.

2 **MS OOSTERHOFF:** Tēnā koutou katoa. May it please the Commissioners. Ms Oosterhoff on
3 behalf of the Survivor Network of those Abused by Priests Aotearoa. Ngā mihi.

4 **CHAIR:** Tēnā koe, Ms Oosterhoff

5 **MS McKECHNIE:** Mōrena, Commissioners, Sally McKechnie, I appear with my colleague,
6 Brooke Clifford. We appear for the Bishops and Congregational Leaders of the Catholic
7 Church of Aotearoa New Zealand. Ma'am, we will have other counsel appearing with us
8 on Monday and I will introduce my colleagues to the Commissioners on Monday morning
9 with your leave.

10 **CHAIR:** Tēnā kōrua.

11 **MS SHORES:** Mōrena, ko India Shores ahau (I am India Shores) and I appear on behalf of the
12 Anglican Church in Aotearoa, Polynesia and New Zealand.

13 **CHAIR:** Tēnā koe, Ms Shores.

14 Are there any other appearances? Thank you.

15 So we will begin the order -- just so everybody knows, we'll start with submissions
16 from, opening submissions from Counsel Assist for the Commissioner. That will be
17 followed by submissions from, opening submissions by the Crown, and then we will hear
18 from our Survivor Advisory Group, from SNAP, and then from the Gloriavale Leavers'
19 Trust.

20 So we will start with you, tēnā koe, Ms Beaton.

21 **OPENING STATEMENT BY THE ROYAL COMMISSION**

22 **MS BEATON:** Tēnā koe Madam Chair, tēnā koutou, tēnā koutou, tēnā tātou katoa. Talofa lava,
23 mālō e lelei.

24 My name is Kerry Beaton. I appear today at this hearing as Counsel Assisting the
25 Royal Commission of Inquiry, I am also a middle-aged non-disabled Pākehā woman with
26 long brown hair and today wearing a blue jacket.

27 I begin also by acknowledging Ngāti Whātua ki Ōrākei as mana whenua.
28 I acknowledge the survivors of abuse and neglect, including those who have passed and
29 their whānau. I acknowledge members of our Royal Commission Survivor Advisory
30 Group, our core participants and those who are granted leave to appear, and all of the many,
31 many people who have and who continue to contribute to this Inquiry's very important
32 work. Ngā mihi nui ki a koe.

1 The purpose of this opening statement is to briefly set the scene for this hearing into
2 the institutional responses of faiths to abuse in care, to explain which faiths and institutions
3 we will hear from over the next few days and the themes that will be addressed.

4 The Inquiry has the broadest terms of reference of any Royal Commission ever held
5 in New Zealand. And over the last three and a half years we have heard from literally
6 thousands of people in many different ways during private sessions, public hearings like
7 this, roundtables, wānanga, hui and fono, through formal witness statements and written
8 accounts. And this is the Inquiry's 14th and its final public hearing. And it will publicly
9 examine the responses of faith-based institutions to abuse in their care.

10 It's important to remember this hearing is just one way that we are gathering
11 evidence on these issues. During its investigations and its research and policy work, the
12 Inquiry has used its powers many times under the Inquiries Act to require people and
13 organisations, including faith-based institutions, to provide us with over – well over now –
14 a million documents containing relevant information to the issues that we are to examine.

15 And this work continues, it doesn't stop after this hearing. The Inquiry is due to
16 deliver its final report to Government by the end of June 2023.

17 Unlike most of our previous hearings, this one is not a situation where survivors of
18 abuse will be called to give evidence about what they endured in care. Instead, this hearing
19 focuses on selected faiths and their responses to the abuse that people suffered.

20 This Inquiry has heard over and over again, Commissioners, terrible stories of abuse
21 and of neglect of people in faith-based and in State care in places where they were
22 supposed to be being cared for and by people and organisations that were supposed to care
23 for them.

24 And as I said in my opening to you, Commissioners, in the August State
25 institutional response hearing, terrible abuse happened in faith and State care. And it's still
26 happening. And again, I repeat what I said then, it's not enough to say, yes, that was
27 terrible, but we shouldn't judge what happened back then by today's standards.

28 Many of the experiences of abuse and neglect in faith-based care that we've heard
29 publicly and privately were common, but they were never acceptable.

30 The whakataukī "Kia whakatōmuri te haere whakamua" (Let's look backward in
31 order to move forward) encapsulates the Inquiry's approach to these institutional hearings.
32 I walk into the future with my eyes on the past. The purpose of these last two final hearings
33 is three-fold: To seek acknowledgment and accountability, acknowledgment from the
34 faith-based institutions of the nature and extent of abuse that was suffered in their care, the

1 factors which caused or contributed to that abuse, the impacts of it, and accountability from
2 those institutions for the failures to prevent and respond to abuse.

3 Second, to hear what lessons the churches and faiths have learned from what
4 happened, what changes did they make or are they trying to make to prevent and respond to
5 the failures.

6 And third, to identify what changes are still necessary to address the harm that has
7 been caused, and what the faiths and the Crown still need to do to ensure that the factors
8 which allowed abuse to occur in faith-based care settings don't continue.

9 The challenge from this Royal Commission to the faith-based institutions and the
10 State is to participate fully and openly in this process, in this hearing, as we examine how
11 they can address the harm that was caused and how they can act to prevent further abuse in
12 the future.

13 As I said, the Royal Commission has heard from survivors from hundreds of
14 different institutions, including faith-based institutions and organisations, and it is not
15 possible to require all of those institutions to participate publicly in this hearing. But many
16 have provided written evidence to us and information to the Inquiry during the course of its
17 investigations.

18 In this hearing, the Inquiry will publicly focus on faith-based education for two
19 reasons: Because a large proportion of the survivors who have suffered abuse in
20 faith-based care and who have provided evidence to us about that, they were abused and
21 neglected in education settings. And schools are an example of the systems and the
22 structures that operate under the various faith-based institutions.

23 We heard evidence in our August State hearing from the Ministry of Education, the
24 Education Review Office and the Teaching Council, as well as other State agencies that
25 have a role in faith-based education, and many of the topics that were addressed in
26 questioning there will continue into this hearing.

27 We will hear evidence from representatives of three schools: St Patrick's College,
28 Silverstream; Wesley College; and Dilworth School which were selected because they are
29 examples of the systems that operate under the Catholic, the Methodist and the Anglican
30 institutions.

31 There will also, though, be evidence from leaders of other faith-based institutions in
32 this hearing that we haven't heard from publicly before: The Gloriavale Christian
33 Community, the Methodist Church of New Zealand, the Presbyterian church of Aotearoa
34 New Zealand, Presbyterian Support Central and Presbyterian Support Otago.

1 Questioning at this hearing will focus on a number of topics and they include the
2 following: The handling of complaints -- the Inquiry has heard from survivors about being
3 disbelieved when making complaints to the church, being belittled, and the leaders of faiths
4 viewing abuse as the fault of the survivor themselves; the culture of silence and the barriers
5 for survivors of abuse and for witnesses within the institutions from speaking out; the
6 nature and extent of the physical, sexual, psychological, cultural neglect; the failures by the
7 faiths to prevent abuse and to take responsibility for it; the autonomy of faith-based
8 institutions and whether there was and is a culture of impunity; the monitoring, the
9 oversight and safeguarding policies and practices of the faith-based institutions in caring for
10 children and adults at risk; how racism, ableism and bias has impacted on survivors,
11 including the extent to which the faiths supported or undermined the cultural continuity of
12 Māori and Pacific people, and whether they met the care needs of disabled people and
13 people with mental health conditions; Te Tiriti-based failings of the institutions; the focus
14 on the protection of church and reputation, including the use of, what's coined, the
15 "geographical cure", a response of moving individuals accused of abuse to new locations;
16 the lack of record-keeping or the destruction of records by faith-based institutions; and the
17 lessons learned by the faiths and what steps they're taking now.

18 So while questioning over the next few days of this hearing will focus on many of
19 those issues, time will not permit us to publicly question every faith or every witness on
20 each of those topics. But those issues are being addressed in other ways. The Commission
21 has and continues to receive evidence and information in many non-public ways, including
22 under these formal Notices to Produce under the Inquiries Act, and we continue to welcome
23 and encourage the survivors of abuse and neglect in both faith and State care, and witnesses
24 to abuse, to contact the Inquiry to share their experiences with us.

25 In total, during this hearing, Madam Chair, you will hear evidence from 26
26 witnesses. Some sessions will involve multiple people giving evidence together in the
27 witness box as occurred in the August hearing.

28 There is an updated hearing plan now available on the Inquiry's website, but
29 I confirm that today we will hear evidence from leaders of the Gloriavale Christian
30 Community. Tomorrow the hearing will not be sitting. But we will resume on Monday, 17
31 October with evidence from representatives of St Patrick's Silverstream School and from
32 Catholic leaders.

33 On Tuesday next week we will hear evidence from representatives of Wesley
34 College and leaders of the Methodist Church.

1 On Wednesday 19 October, Presbyterian leaders will give evidence, followed by a
2 session later that day with evidence from Dilworth School representatives which will roll
3 over into the Thursday and will be followed on the Thursday by evidence from leaders of
4 the Anglican Church.

5 As you indicated, Madam Chair, the faith-based institutions who are giving
6 evidence and other organisations who are core participants in this hearing will each have
7 the opportunity to give a short opening statement like this. You will hear some of those this
8 morning, but others will be made at the beginning of the relevant session of evidence
9 relating to that faith.

10 Each of the faiths who have witnesses appearing in this hearing have filed formal
11 briefs of evidence for those people. Those briefs of evidence will be available to the public
12 for review on the Inquiry's website after the witnesses give their evidence, but there are
13 short biographies of each of those witnesses, who will appear at the hearing, on the website
14 now.

15 At beginning of each of the evidence sessions, the faith or the school will have the
16 opportunity to give additional oral evidence, addressing topics they wish to highlight in the
17 public nature of this hearing. There will then be questioning from Counsel Assisting the
18 Commission, one of my team, and there may be questioning from core participants and, of
19 course, from Commissioners.

20 Madam Chair, in relation to the use of documents, there will be references by
21 witnesses to documents where that is necessary, but different from our previous hearings,
22 the documents themselves will not be shown, will not be livestreamed. This is because
23 they have not been redacted to protect privacy rights of people, including survivors, and so
24 they cannot be published. Instead, as we have always tried to do, the lawyer asking the
25 questions will ensure that the relevant part of the document is read out loud into the hearing
26 transcript.

27 And for similar reasons, Madam Chair, in this hearing the names of survivors, of
28 perpetrators, and witnesses will usually be anonymised in questioning to protect privacy.

29 At the end of the evidence next Thursday afternoon, you will begin to hear closing
30 statements from the faiths and from the core participants and these will likely continue into
31 the Friday morning. And then at the completion of the closing statements from participants
32 and, as is entirely fitting, we will hear from members of our Survivor Advisory Group who
33 will address you and reflect on the journey of this Commission, before Ngāti Whātua will
34 formally close the public hearing chapter of our work.

1 Finally, I confirm I appear today, Commissioners, with a team of counsel who have
2 worked across the range of our investigations, Simon Mount KC, Katherine Anderson,
3 Tania Sharkey, Michael Thomas, Kathy Basire and Alisha Castle.

4 I wish to also acknowledge the huge preparation that has gone into this hearing from
5 the Inquiry's in-house teams across the board, ably led by Rebecca Harvey-Lane, Richard
6 Roil, Amy Prentice, Alex Leulu, and Lucy Wesley-Smith.

7 Tēnā koe, Madam Chair. I understand we'll now hear from my colleague for the
8 Crown.

9 **CHAIR:** Tēnā koe, Ms Beaton, and kia ora anō, Ms Schmidt-McCleave.

10 **OPENING STATEMENT BY THE CROWN**

11 **MS SCHMIDT-McCLEAVE:** Kia ora anō. Kei aku nui, kei aku rahi, tēnā koutou katoa. Ko te
12 mihi tuatahi ki te mana whenua o tēnei rohe, Ngāti Whātua ki Ōrākei, tēnā koutou. Ki ngā
13 Kaikōmihana, tēnā koutou anō. Ki ngā mōrehu i te kaha, i te maia ki te kōrero i ngā
14 huihuinga ngā kua pahure ake nei, kei te mihi, kei te mihi, kei te mihi. Ko Ms Schmidt
15 McCleave tōku ingoa. Ko māua nei ko Ms White, ngā roia mō te Karauna. (I acknowledge
16 you all my distinguished friends. My first greeting I extend to the tribal authority of this
17 region, Ngāti Whātua, Ōrākei. To you the Commissioners, again my salutations. To the
18 survivors, for your strength and bravery for sharing your stories in the previous
19 proceedings, I acknowledge, greet and salute you all. My name is Ms Schmidt McCleave,
20 myself and Ms White are the lawyers for the Crown.)

21 For those watching who may not be familiar with the Inquiry process or the Crown
22 response, I represent all the core Government agencies involved with the Inquiry, and also
23 sitting with me is Ms White, General Counsel for the Crown Response Unit.

24 For those who can't see me, I am a middle-aged Pākehā non-disabled woman. I
25 have brown hair and brown eyes, due to a contact lens malfunction this morning I am
26 wearing glasses today, and I'm wearing a grey dress and a cream jacket.

27 Thank you, Madam Chair and Commissioners for the opportunity to present this
28 brief opening statement for this faith-based institution response hearing. The Crown, as
29 represented by the key agencies involved in State care in a range of different settings has,
30 of course, recently been part of the State institutional response hearing and in that hearing
31 responded to evidence concerning some themes and structural issues that may also relate to
32 the activity of some faith-based organisations.

33 My friend Ms Beaton has outlined what this hearing is about, and who you will be
34 hearing from in the hearing, but I note that many of these organisations referred to by my

1 friend received or continue to receive Government funding for the schools, homes and other
2 social services they operated or operate.

3 Agencies such as the Ministry of Education, the Education Review Office, Oranga
4 Tamariki and the Ministry of Social Development have different roles in the accreditation,
5 monitoring or regulation of schools, both private and State-integrated, and of care homes
6 and other contracted social services.

7 Further, agencies such as Oranga Tamariki and the Police have also been involved
8 in various ways in relation to allegations of abuse raised by people in the care of faith-based
9 organisations.

10 So, in that regard, agencies following this hearing either through representatives in
11 the room or via the livestream, include Oranga Tamariki, the Ministry of Social
12 Development, the Ministry of Education, the Ministry of Health, Whaikaha (the Ministry
13 for [of] Disabled People), the Police, and the Education Review Office.

14 I note that the duties owed by the Crown were varied through different arms of the
15 Government and evolved over time. And the Crown, consistent with its approach in this
16 Inquiry to listening and continuing to learn and respond to what it hears, is therefore
17 interested in the evidence being presented to this Inquiry -- this part of the Inquiry and
18 attends this hearing in that capacity.

19 And I emphasise to Commissioners that learnings from this faith-based hearing will
20 feed back into the delivery of care more generally.

21 I do, on behalf of the Crown, Madam Chair, seek leave to ask questions of witnesses
22 either as required through the hearing or through Counsel Assisting if matters arise in the
23 course of evidence which relates to evidence previously given by the Crown.

24 **CHAIR:** That leave is granted but subject to the usual protocols, which is generally through
25 Counsel Assisting.

26 **MS SCHMIDT-McCLEAVE:** Thank you, Madam Chair.

27 The Ministry of Education has provided this Commission with evidence setting out
28 the Department of Education's role and functions in relation to private and State-integrated
29 schools and how this has changed over the years and, as advised, and as I've submitted
30 before, the Department always had considerably less involvement in private school settings
31 by comparison to the State school system.

32 Oranga Tamariki, and to some extent the Ministry of Social Development, has
33 provided evidence about their current roles and the role of the former Department of Social

1 Welfare in relation to independent care homes and other third-party providers of social
2 services.

3 I note that while the Crown or the State is sometimes talked of and thought of as a
4 single unified entity, its statutory roles and responsibilities for people in different forms of
5 faith-based care were generally owed by particular Crown agencies and this means that the
6 Crown, through its various agencies, had a range of functions and obligations and that
7 depended on a number of factors, including the legal status of any child within any school
8 or institution, and the applicable policy and statutory schemes at the time.

9 I've set out in my submissions at paragraph 16 there a number of sources of the
10 various aspects -- and I should note there, Madam Chair, of course this will be provided in
11 its final form, so the Commission can upload it to its website after this.

12 **CHAIR:** You mean your submissions will be?

13 **MS SCHMIDT-McCLEAVE:** Yes. So I've set out there a number of sources of the various
14 aspects of Government responsibility for these children and young persons in faith-based
15 care in relation to the Ministry of Education, Oranga Tamariki, the Ministry of Social
16 Development, and the Police.

17 So I want to turn now briefly to each of these agencies and summarise the salient
18 points from the evidence provided at the State institutional response hearing as it relates to
19 faith-based care settings.

20 First, the Ministry of Education. There was a different landscape and statutory
21 framework existing between 1950 and 1989. Until the establishment of the Ministry of
22 Education in 1989 the primary and secondary school systems in New Zealand were
23 overseen through the Department of Education under the 1914 and 1964 Education Acts.

24 Different types of schools were subject to different legislative and regulatory
25 frameworks, and they can generally be distinguished as follows: Since 1877 in
26 New Zealand, State schools have been established and funded by the State. New Zealand's
27 first schools were private, they were established by missionaries to teach Māori and the
28 children of missionaries from the 1820s, and once State schools were established from
29 1877, the Catholic Church in particular began to establish its own network of schools.

30 Private schools have always been owned, run and operated by private persons and
31 organisations other than the State. They receive some funding from the State, but they are
32 not fully funded like State schools. And in addition, private schools may charge school
33 fees.

1 Private schools have considerable flexibility in choosing their own curriculum,
2 qualifications, frameworks and assessment methods and they offer education within an
3 educational environment of their own design.

4 Most State-integrated schools were originally private schools and the Private
5 Schools Conditional Integration Act in 1975 facilitated the voluntary integration of private
6 schools into the State education system. State-integrated schools receive government
7 funding, as State schools do. However, they retain their special character and although they
8 must teach the New Zealand curriculum, teaching can reflect their special character.

9 The Crown's responsibilities as they arise from the various Education Acts provide
10 for and provided for a different approach to these different schools.

11 So, first, in relation to private schools: Registration has been required since 1921.
12 There were no limits on who could apply to register a private school. The focus in
13 determining registration was on the concept of efficiency, which Commissioners have
14 heard about before. And in introducing that requirement in 1921, the Minister of the time
15 noted that:

16 "The Government feels that it is not sufficient that we should allow any person to
17 open a school in any sort of building and with any sort of instructions. To the children who
18 attend these private schools the Government owes some duty to see that the schools are
19 reasonably efficient. Just as in the case of nursing homes, private hospitals, dentists and
20 plumbers, we insist upon registration to protect the public and secure efficiency."

21 And this concept of efficiency meant that:

22 "The premises, staff, equipment and curriculum of the school are suitable, that the
23 instruction is efficient as in a public school of the same class, and that suitable provision
24 [and I'm still using the words of the Minister of the day] is made for the inculcation in the
25 minds of the pupils of sentiments of patriotism and loyalty..."

26 And a private school could then be removed from the register if the director
27 considered it was no longer efficient.

28 But as was covered in the Crown response hearing in August, there is now
29 considerable regulation of private schools and their teachers which is certainly beyond this
30 rather limited concept of efficiency that used to exist.

31 Moving now to the Education Review Office. As the Commissioners and others
32 heard in the State response hearing, the ERO is an independent Government department
33 established under the Education Act 1989. It has responsibility for qualitatively evaluating

1 and publicly reporting on the education and care of children and young people in early
2 childhood services and schools.

3 ERO also reviews school hostels to evaluate whether students are provided a safe,
4 emotional and physical environment that supports learning.

5 These reviews are mainly regular, although on occasion ERO will complete a
6 review on a particular matter of concern or as directed by the Minister of Education.

7 I note that ERO has different processes for reviewing State-integrated and private
8 schools. When it reviews registered private schools, ERO reports on whether the school is
9 meeting the criteria for registration under the 2020 Education and Training Act and these
10 criteria were amended in May 2019 to include the provision that the school is a physically
11 and emotionally safe place for students, and I note that this requirement did not exist for
12 registered private schools prior to that 2019 amendment.

13 I've set out at paragraph 28 the criteria now for registration as a private school and
14 you will see there, Commissioners, that there are a range of factors, including that
15 managers who are fit and proper persons are the managers of a private school, and that it is
16 a physically and emotionally safe place for students.

17 And prior to these criteria being inserted in 2010, ERO registered private
18 schools -- reviewed registered private schools under the 1989 Education Act and used that
19 criteria that the schools be efficient.

20 So, Commissioners, you'll see there's been a range of approaches in terms of ERO's
21 review over the years.

22 And before reviewing a private school, ERO will look at documents, including the
23 school's curriculum and delivery programme, and its relevant policies and procedures. As
24 we heard in the State response hearing, an ERO officer attends the school to observe
25 teaching and learning, and speaks with staff and students in the school environment.
26 Officers also look at information about achievement expectations, risk assessment,
27 attendance registers, records of stand downs and suspensions et cetera, and once that review
28 is completed, ERO prepares a report and it's sent to the school managers and the Ministry
29 of Education and it is published on ERO's website.

30 In regards to teachers within private schools, from 1997 – and I apologise for the
31 range of dates, Commissioners, but it is all set out in the written submissions – from 1997,
32 the 1989 Act explicitly required private schools to employ only registered or provisionally
33 registered teachers. And in granting registration, the Teaching Council must be satisfied
34 that a teacher is of good standing, fit to be a teacher, satisfactorily trained to teach and has

1 satisfactory recent teaching experience. And again, as we heard in the State hearing, the
2 Teaching Council, or the Teachers' Disciplinary Tribunal, in disciplinary proceedings can
3 cancel a teacher's registration where a teacher does not meet those requirements.

4 I want to touch briefly on the Crown's responsibilities for private schools and how
5 that compares with State schools, and as Commissioners will have seen from the regulatory
6 framework I've just outlined briefly, the Department of Education, and subsequently the
7 Ministry, has always had considerably less involvement in private school settings by
8 comparison to the State school system. While every child is required to be enrolled in and
9 attend a school, arrangements relating to the enrolment of a child in a private school are a
10 contractual matter between the school's proprietors and the child's caregivers.

11 In terms of the landscape today, the existence and operation of private schools with
12 limited interference by the State allows children and their parents a variety of education
13 options. There are currently 90 private schools in New Zealand and that represents around
14 3.5% of the total schools in the country. 39 of those 90 private schools are faith-based.

15 Of course, balanced against this is the requirement for State oversight, and over
16 time various legislative and regulatory requirements have been implemented to improve
17 students' safety in education settings including in private schools. I've set out at paragraph
18 35 what those are and in summary there's been restrictions on certain practices, including
19 the use of corporal punishment and the use of seclusion, as well as limits placed on the use
20 of physical restraint, since 2017.

21 Mandatory three-yearly Police vetting was introduced for teachers in State and
22 private schools in February 2002 and from April of that year non-registered school staff and
23 contractors were required to be Police vetted every three years. And then in 2010, that
24 requirement was added for employees of contractors. All children's workers must also be
25 safety checked under the Children's Act 2014.

26 From 1996 court registrars have had a mandatory obligation to report to the
27 Teaching Council if a person currently or previously employed as a teacher has been
28 convicted of an offence that's subject to a term of three months' imprisonment or more.
29 And from 2004 this mandatory reporting obligation was imposed on teachers themselves.

30 Since 1997 managers of private schools have also been mandatorily required to
31 report to the Teaching Council in relation to all dismissals and resignations, complaints,
32 possible serious misconduct of teachers, and matters relating to their competence.

33 In 2010 a number of changes were made to the regulation of private schools and
34 that followed some work undertaken by the New Zealand Law Commission. And

1 consistent with the Law Commission's recommendations, that efficiency standard I've
2 mentioned required of private schools was significantly expanded.

3 In the same amendments in 2010, the Secretary's powers in relation to private
4 schools were expanded, and I've set out there how they were expanded and the enforcement
5 options which became open to the Secretary of Education.

6 And a specific provision introduced at that time allowed for the suspension of a
7 private school's registration where the Secretary had reasonable grounds to believe the
8 welfare of students was at risk.

9 In 1990, new provisions were introduced into the 1989 Act giving the Ministry
10 extensive powers of entry and inspection in all registered schools, and in 1998 the Ministry
11 was given authority to enter and inspect a private school which was suspected of operating
12 whilst unregistered.

13 You heard some evidence in August about the effect of the Education Hostels
14 Regulation of 2005 and the purpose of these was to ensure the safety of students who board
15 at hostels, and that covers hostels at all registered schools including private schools and
16 residential special schools. Those regulations brought in minimum requirements for
17 pastoral care, including a code of practice and a mechanism for direct intervention when
18 serious safety concerns are identified.

19 In 1998 provisions expanding a private school principal's obligation to notify the
20 Ministry about the suspension of or expulsion of a student were introduced and, in
21 particular, the principal is now required to provide the Ministry with a written statement of
22 the reasons for the actions.

23 We heard in August about the NELPs, the adherence to statement of National
24 Education and Learning Priorities, and from 2017 the managers of a private school and that
25 school's principal and staff were required to have regard to NELP. And the NELPs set out
26 the Government priorities for all schools and that includes State, State-integrated, private,
27 kura, early learning services, me ngā Kōhanga reo and communities of learning, Kāhui
28 Ako.

29 So, in summary, the framework offers a range of different types of education
30 provision for students, giving caregivers a variety of options in relation to their children's
31 education and the level of intervention and control by the Department, and subsequently the
32 Ministry, varies to reflect this.

33 Private schools are of necessity subject to less direct State oversight and control
34 than State and State-integrated schools, reflecting Government policy at the time.

1 Historically, churches and private enterprises have been active players in the
2 provision of private education in New Zealand.

3 Moving on to Oranga Tamariki. I note that in the time period covered by the
4 Commission, 1950 to 1999, children were placed in schools and other faith-based
5 institutions for different reasons. These included special homes, training institutions,
6 residential programmes, or institutions such as children's and family homes and hostels.

7 Placement by the State to all institutions was governed by the Child Welfare Act
8 1925 which was replaced by the 1974 Children and Young Persons Act and finally the
9 1989 Children, Young Persons and their Families Act, now the Oranga Tamariki Act.

10 Other than four former industrial schools, private schools sat outside of these Acts.

11 The 1927 Child Welfare (Amendment) Act provided for the registration and
12 inspection of children's homes and to become registered the Minister of Social Welfare had
13 to be satisfied with the inspection report, which the Superintendent of Child Welfare
14 completed, and then after that registration, inspections occurred once a year by the district
15 Child Welfare Officers and that would usually include a doctor from the Department of
16 Health, interviews with the children and staff, and an inspection of the building and
17 programmes.

18 I note that the responsibilities of the agencies to those children and young persons in
19 the care of private organisations was focused on those in State care rather than the wider
20 cohort of all children and young persons placed at these locations. In 1989 the Act saw the
21 introduction of section 396 and a significantly more comprehensive regulatory framework
22 for the approval, monitoring and inspection of private institutions.

23 The Government policy was to place children and young people who needed
24 residential care within Social Welfare's own institutions, but, in some situations they could
25 be placed in private institutions if that institution met a need that the Social Welfare facility
26 could not.

27 The social work manuals, which have been provided to the Commission, set out the
28 policy and guidelines for the placement of children in faith-based institutions. Parental
29 consent had to be sought before placing a Protestant child in a Catholic institution, and vice
30 versa, and often the decision to enrol a child at a faith-based school or private care home
31 was a private arrangement made by the child's parents rather than being placed there by the
32 State.

33 There were minimum requirements for visiting children and young persons in State
34 care, once every four months, and progress reports were expected on a six-monthly or

1 annual basis. And these requirements were set out in practice manuals and social work
2 manuals rather than directly in the statutes or regulations.

3 Those visiting and monitoring responsibilities, in line with the regulatory regime at
4 the time, focused on children who had status under Child Welfare legislation rather than the
5 wider cohort of all those in the different forms of faith-based care.

6 I've also noted there that both private institutions and Oranga Tamariki both had a
7 role in relation to New Zealand's adoption history and I've set out there a report to
8 Parliament in 1974 that noted that the placement of children for adoption might be lawfully
9 arranged without the assistance of Social Welfare and detailed the agencies responsible for
10 the arranging of adoptions as including private organisations, maternity homes, doctors, and
11 other professionals including solicitors, priests, parents and grandparents, and I've noted
12 there that private organisations arranged 158 of the total 2005 placements for adoption in
13 1972 and a similar percentage in 1973.

14 The 1957 fieldwork manual clarified that in New Zealand, unlike some overseas
15 countries, there were no private adoption agencies or societies, but there were several
16 private agencies which specialised in the care of unmarried mothers and made tentative
17 arrangements for adoption placements, but they had no legal right to make the actual
18 placements; that had to be done with approval from a Child Welfare Officer or an order
19 from the court.

20 The Ministry of Social Development: I've referred there to the evidence and
21 attachments of Barry Fisk in the Crown institutional response hearing about MSD's
22 accreditation function which occurs via Te Kāhui Kāhu and how that has evolved from
23 approving and accrediting third-party providers on behalf of the Ministry and Oranga
24 Tamariki, to accrediting on behalf of six Government agencies through individual service
25 level agreements, and MSD now approves providers under section 396 under specific
26 delegation from the Chief Executive of Oranga Tamariki.

27 And I've set out there, that function has evolved and in the period before 1999 sat
28 within the Department of Social Welfare.

29 Police investigation: Aside from the various sets of obligations that various Crown
30 agencies have had in relation to faith-based institutions, the Crown has also had an
31 important role in investigations and prosecutions, and Police are committed to continuously
32 improving the existence of everyone who reports abuse to them and in the context of this
33 hearing acknowledges the particular vulnerabilities of the survivor witnesses who have
34 given evidence and the wider survivor group.

1 Before I finish I'd also like to make a brief note about the keeping of public records.
2 It is worth noting that the Public Records Act in 2005 requires every public office and local
3 authority to create and maintain records of its affairs, including the records of any matter
4 that is contracted out to an independent contractor. So where that applies to NGO [non-
5 governmental organisation] records, the statutory obligation is on the public office to
6 maintain the records and not on the NGO.

7 However, although the Act is retrospective in its application to records created or
8 received before 2005, faith-based institutions would not necessarily have previously
9 understood that they had an explicit legislative responsibility to treat records of their care
10 work done under contract to Government agencies as public records.

11 In ending these submissions, the Crown reiterates once again its commitment to the
12 work of this Commission. The Crown is committed to providing information and evidence
13 to enable fruitful recommendations, to ensure that the terrible experiences heard throughout
14 the Inquiry do not occur again. No reira, tēnā rawa atu koutou katoa. (With that, my
15 sincere thanks to you all.)

16 **CHAIR:** Thank you, Ms Schmidt-McCleave. I have a question which I don't know if you can
17 answer now. It came up in the State institutional response hearing, but it relates to the
18 extent of State oversight, which, as we have heard, has fluctuated over the years and which
19 is gradually, seems to be by process of accretion, adding more and more layers of oversight.

20 Is it possible for you to point, maybe not now but later, whether indeed there is any
21 specific obligations for the State in relation to churches and faith-based institutions to see
22 that these institutions adhere to the principles of Te Tiriti and whether they have any
23 obligation to see that these churches, these care institutions, are adhering to the human
24 rights obligations that the State imposes, either domestic or international?

25 That's a big question, I appreciate.

26 **MS SCHMIDT-McCLEAVE:** Yes, and my preliminary response, and, of course, I'd like to seek
27 instructions and provide a fuller response, is that consistent with the framework I've
28 outlined, those kinds of obligations will be fed into the specific functions and obligations of
29 each agency, and certainly there's Te Tiriti, human rights obligations throughout the
30 documents, including in the recent Oranga Tamariki care standards which apply equally to
31 faith-based institutions.

32 I will provide Commissioners, though, with a more fulsome response, but that's my
33 initial --

1 **CHAIR:** Yes, and I appreciate I've caught you on the hop, and I also appreciate there are
2 contractual documents. My question really is at the higher level, the legislative level. So
3 that's something I think that we need clarification on if you can provide that.

4 **MS SCHMIDT-McCLEAVE:** Yes, absolutely. Again, I would make the point that certainly the
5 Commissioners heard a lot, for instance, about section 7AA and the Chief Executive's
6 Te Tiriti obligations under the Oranga Tamariki Act which, of course, filtered down
7 throughout to those organisations.

8 **CHAIR:** It's one aspect --

9 **MS SCHMIDT-McCLEAVE:** One aspect of it, yes, but we're very happy to provide a fuller
10 response in relation to all the agencies.

11 **CHAIR:** Thank you very much, and thank you for your submissions.

12 **MS SCHMIDT-McCLEAVE:** Thank you, Madam Chair; thank you, Commissioners, tēnā
13 koutou katoa.

14 **CHAIR:** Ms Beaton.

15 **MS BEATON:** Now we're having Frances Tagaloa from the Survivor Advisory Group, so I invite
16 her to come forward, Madam Chair, and we also have Tu Chapman and Jim Goodwin on
17 AVL from that group.

18 **CHAIR:** Tēnā koutou katoa ngā mema o SAGE and it's very nice to see you in person, Ms
19 Tagaloa.

20 **MS TAGALOA:** Yes.

21 **CHAIR:** She has been appearing dutifully by AVL from North America and it's good to have you
22 back on home ground. So, Talofa lava.

23 **OPENING STATEMENT BY SAGE**

24 **MS TAGALOA:** Talofa lava, kia ora koutou. Ou te faatalofa atu i le pa'ia ma le mamalu ua aofia
25 i lenei aso matagofie, malo le soifua malo le lagi e mamā, talofa lava. (I extend a warm
26 welcome to distinguished guests present in this wonderful day, greetings to good health and
27 wellbeing). Warm Pacific greetings to Madam Chair and the Commissioners, to my friends
28 Jim and Tu online and to the many survivors watching in here today. I'm Moeapulu
29 Frances Tagaloa, a survivor of faith-based abuse and as many of you know, the first witness
30 in the faith-based hearing in November 2020.

31 Thank you for this opportunity to represent survivors, to give survivors a voice as
32 this Commission has continued to do through all its hearings, for listening and to encourage
33 that.

1 For those who can't see me, I'm wearing a blue dress, a black jacket, I have long
2 black hair and I have a flower in my ear as is my Samoan custom.

3 So this hearing I just believe will reveal that faith-based institutions have failed
4 survivors and failed New Zealand. They have failed to act and have failed to take
5 responsibility for the abuse that's happened. They've not put survivors first ahead of
6 perpetrators and have not put survivors ahead of their own interests.

7 They've not provided appropriate ways forward for survivors to heal and have
8 redress, and that's continued to perpetrate more harm to survivors particularly.

9 So as a survivor, I expect to hear how faith-based institutions have failed to act and
10 take responsibility in more detail. I expect to hear how difficult it has been for survivors in
11 disclosing their abuse, how they've not been believed by so many faith-based institutions,
12 how they've been belittled and also how they've been seen to be their fault somehow
13 because of this abuse.

14 I expect that we'll hear how survivors have been taken advantage of by faith-based
15 institutions because of the imbalance of power. Faith-based institutions have all the power.
16 So when survivors come forward there's a natural imbalance, they don't have power.

17 And I just expect to hear that the many orders and schools and institutions have
18 been managed without adequate supervision, without adequate accountability from the
19 churches themselves, but also from the State. I believe the State abdicated its responsibility
20 to faith-based institutions in their care and by not supervising or holding faith-based
21 institutions accountable.

22 I expect to hear how orders have managed to gain impunity from legal action
23 because often of their complex legal structures. There's no accountability because who
24 knows how -- who do you go to within a church or within an organisation with a claim?

25 I expect to hear how systemic racism was occurring in faith-based institutions and
26 that unaddressed racism pervaded some of these institutions and made them more
27 vulnerable, made children and vulnerable adults more open to abuse because of the racism.

28 I expect to hear how faiths have failed Te Tiriti o Waitangi, they've failed in their
29 partnership, they've failed in their participation of Māori and they've failed in their
30 protection of people.

31 And I expect to hear how faith organisations have lacked record-keeping. This has
32 been profound for me personally – I think I have two pieces of paper of my historic claim –
33 and we will hear, I'm sure, of the lack of record-keeping and often destruction of records,

1 and records for survivors are vital to understand the context of abuse and how this could
2 possibly happen in the historic situation.

3 And I expect to hear how protection of churches and reputation has been paramount.
4 That has been what's been lifted up, and helping survivors heal or obtain justice has taken a
5 back seat to the protection of the church institution itself.

6 And I expect to hear that that culture of silence and tolerance that protects churches
7 was pervasive and even church laity today, I believe, do not know the extent of the abuse
8 that's happened in their own churches, because churches are not disclosing that information,
9 they're not letting their laity, their congregations know what's happened.

10 And my hope is that churches will be brave enough to express support for the
11 recommendations of this Commission, and also support for an independent body that this
12 Commission's desiring to come about.

13 Churches have been quick to give apologies in the past but as I said in the State
14 response hearing, a real apology comes with action, with redress and financial support for
15 survivors, and creating an infrastructure that stops this abuse in care, holding all institutions
16 accountable.

17 Churches need transformational change, which I believe can only happen when
18 churches have this healthy accountability to an independent body.

19 I want to acknowledge the many brave and courageous survivors that have come
20 forward to the Commission, that have shared their stories. It is so difficult to do that, to
21 disclose even your story, but then to disclose it to this Commission. I want to acknowledge
22 them for their bravery and celebrate them and encourage them to keep sharing their stories,
23 to not be silenced by this culture that has come about.

24 I want to celebrate those survivors that have publicly given their story as well. It's
25 helped these difficult aspects of our history come into the light, so that we can have change,
26 so that we can make our futures better. And I want to support those who have fought for
27 standing up for this Inquiry. There are many others who have supported survivors and
28 supported this Inquiry continuing. I just want to acknowledge that we really stand on the
29 shoulders of these survivors and these survivor groups who supported that.

30 We survivors who have shared our abuse stories with the Royal Commission
31 reliving our trauma, sharing our shame and pain, risking family relationships, risking
32 reputation, we do this because we live in hope of change. Because we want justice,
33 because we want wrongs to be put right, because we know that there are other survivors
34 who can't tell their stories, because we need help, financial or otherwise, to navigate life.

1 But ultimately, as Alison Pascoe said – she passed away recently – but she said time and
2 time again, "We don't want what happened to us to ever, ever happen again to anyone else."

3 Thank you, Madam Chair; thank you, Commissioners.

4 **CHAIR:** Thank you very much, Ms Tagaloa. **[Applause]**. Thank you, Ms Beaton.

5 **MS BEATON:** Madam Chair, I think we now have Christopher Longhurst and counsel Lydia
6 Oosterhoff for SNAP.

8 **OPENING STATEMENT BY SNAP**

9 **MS OOSTERHOFF:** Tēnā koutou katoa. (Greetings to you all). May it please the Commission.
10 Counsel's name is Ms Oosterhoff and I appear on behalf of the Survivor Network for those
11 Abused by Priests, also known as SNAP. On World Sight Day, a brief visual description of
12 myself, I'm a blonde Pākehā female, much as I don't like to admit it, I am of middle age, I
13 am wearing a black jacket and a dark blue dress.

14 Commissioners, appearing before you today in person are representatives from
15 SNAP, Dr Christopher Longhurst, SNAP's national leader, and Mr John O'Malley, SNAP's
16 senior advisor.

17 Thank you for the opportunity to appear here today for this important final Royal
18 Commission of Inquiry hearing.

19 As a survivor support network, SNAP asks the Commissioners to look closely at the
20 evidence that will be put before you in the coming days. SNAP asks that the evidence is
21 viewed critically and the witnesses questioned appropriately in order to establish exactly
22 the policies and how these are applied in practice and whether this is operating as intended.

23 SNAP would like to repeat what it has asked of the Commission for its duration:
24 That the Commission focuses on making recommendations for change for those who sit at
25 the heart of this Commission. This includes ensuring that responses are tailored to
26 individual survivors' needs; that policies are put in place to prevent what has occurred in the
27 past occurring in the future; and these policies are followed. It also means ensuring that
28 those who are responsible for abuse and those who cover for them are held to account.

29 To open, Dr Longhurst would like to address you on behalf of SNAP's members.
30 Tēnā koe, Madam Chair.

31 **CHAIR:** Tēnā koe, Ms Oosterhoff and tēnā koe, Dr Longhurst. Welcome back.

32 **DR LONGHURST:** Kia ora. Ngā mihi nui, Ms Oosterhoff. Tēnā koutou katoa. Tēnei te mihi
33 manahau ki te mana whakahaere, ki ngā Kōmihana, me ā koutou mahi whakahirahira. Ki
34 ngā mōrehurehu kua puta mai, he mihi maioha. Heoi, ko ngā whakamānawatanga katoa ki a

1 SNAP me ā koutou mahi whakahirahira. Ō rātou kōrero, he tapu. Ō rātou reo, he kaha. Nō
2 reira, tēnā koutou, tēnā koutou, tēnā tātou katoa.

3 (Greetings Ms Oosterhoff and acknowledgments to all here. Here are my sincere
4 greetings to the organisers, the Commissioners and for your important work. And to all of
5 the survivors who are here, my warm greetings, my warm salutations. However, I have my
6 utmost respect to SNAP for your exceptional work, what you have shared, your stories are
7 sacred, your voices are strong, and with this I acknowledge you all.)

8 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Tēnā koe.

9 **DR LONGHURST:** Ko Chris Longhurst tōku ingoa, ko Leona tōku māmā, ko Donald tōku pāpā.
10 E te taha tōku papa nō Ingarangi ōku tīpuna, e te taha tōku māmā nō Iraini ōku tīpuna.

11 (I am Chris Longhurst. Leona is my mum and Donald is my father. On my father's
12 side, my ancestors are from England. On my mother's side my ancestors are from Ireland.)

13 I am a Pākehā male of middle age. I have long brown hair. Today it is up in a bun.
14 I am wearing a royal blue suit, a white shirt and a maroon tie today.

15 On behalf of SNAP Aotearoa New Zealand, I would like to thank you,
16 Commissioners, for granting us leave to appear at this hearing. This hearing is significant
17 for all survivors of faith-based abuse as it is for members of faith-based organisations and
18 society as a whole.

19 Through critically examining the response of faith-based institutions to abuse, this
20 hearing has the mana to shape the responses of the future. There are two main points we
21 would like you to consider while the upcoming evidence is heard.

22 The first is, it is easy to write policies. However, to be effective, those policies must
23 be implemented and monitored effectively. The second point is, accountability, integrity
24 and transparency. These are key in preventing abuse.

25 Commissioners, we have already shown you during this Commission that our
26 members have not only suffered abuse, but the process for seeking a response from
27 faith-based institutions has often been re-traumatising today. This is because the principles
28 and procedures in policy documents have not been followed today.

29 The assurances from church leaders today to do no harm and to do good, they're not
30 new. In evidence the Methodist Church advised in 1743 that its renewal movement was
31 based on the desire to, first, do no harm, second, to do good, and third, to attend to the
32 ordinances of God. Please keep this in mind when you listen to the evidence. Promises
33 have been made in the past and broken. Otherwise we wouldn't be here today.

1 We need faith-based institutions to be open, honest and transparent in order to
2 uphold their promises to God, to do no harm. Well, to do no further harm. We cannot
3 allow the institutions to continue to rely on excuses that they have used in the past, that
4 prevent exposing abuse. For example, the sanctity of the priesthood and respect for
5 privacy.

6 Commissioners, we ask you in the days that follow to look not only at the policies
7 that will be put before you, but to ask how have these been applied. Look at the evidence
8 and its validity. We must go past just hearing about policies that are considered to amount
9 to adequate self-regulation.

10 This leads to our next point. Accountability, integrity and transparency in all
11 institutions and their activities. If we are to make changes that last, changes to the systems
12 that allowed abuse to occur, then we need to ensure that people abide by the appropriate
13 policies.

14 We must lift the veil of secrecy that many faith-based institutions have operated
15 within and ensure accountability. Something that has been unfortunately lacking in the
16 past.

17 To do so we must see evidence of change in the coming days. Change not in words
18 but in action. These policies for change must be transparent. What we need to see
19 evidence of is effective policies for change that do not only safeguard for those in the
20 future, but heals for those in the past. And this needs to be supported by strong
21 mechanisms for accountability and transparency.

22 Accountability and transparency means monitoring and real-time reporting of
23 outcomes, including education and training outcomes. Accountability and transparency
24 means ensuring those who work with children and vulnerable people are adequately vetted
25 and tested to ensure they are psychologically able and mature enough to take on such
26 important roles.

27 In conclusion, Commissioners, we entirely support the representations of Frances
28 Tagaloa, we are saying the exact same thing. When you examine the evidence put before
29 you during this hearing, we ask you to examine it critically. In the end, at the centre of this
30 whole inquiry are the survivors. So we ask you to question how survivors are faring under
31 the policies and under their practices.

32 We know that our members and others across Aotearoa are watching this hearing
33 with keen interest and with hope. However, to be honest, also with apprehension. SNAP
34 needs to support our members beyond next week and beyond when this Commission is

1 over. Our efforts will continue. We, the survivors, with dignity are doing the mahi
2 whakahirahira. He tapu mātou kōrero, he kaha mātou reo. Nō reira, tēnā koutou, tēnā
3 koutou, tēnā tātou katoa. (We, the survivors, with dignity are doing the important work,
4 Our stories are sacred and our voices are strong. With this, I greet, salute and address each
5 and every one present.)

6 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Kia ora.

7 **CHAIR:** Kia ora, Dr Longhurst.

8 **MS BEATON:** Madam Chair, I invite Rosanna Overcomer on behalf of the Gloriavale Leavers'
9 Trust to speak now.

10 **CHAIR:** Thank you.

11 Good morning and welcome to the Commission.

12 **OPENING STATEMENT BY GLORIAVALE LEAVERS' SUPPORT TRUST**

13 **MS OVERCOMER:** Kia ora. My name is Rosanna Overcomer and I am, if you can't see me, a
14 tall brunette wearing a white blouse and an oatmeal-coloured blazer. I am a survivor
15 standing tall and proud of what I have overcome.

16 I am both a member of the Gloriavale Leavers' Support Trust and an ex-member of
17 Gloriavale. Today Gloriavale is part of this hearing essentially because of the dreadful lack
18 of care from Government agencies in the past. After our leader Hopeful Christian was
19 convicted and served a short prison sentence for his crimes, he was allowed back into our
20 community, the community where I, a child, lived. The people that should have cared for
21 the children and vulnerable allowed a sex offender not only into a close-knit community
22 with inadequate living quarters but back into the senior position of leadership as the
23 Shepherd of the church.

24 If the right actions had have been taken all those years ago, I believe I would not be
25 standing here today.

26 We the children and vulnerable of Gloriavale were let down by the Government
27 agencies that should have been protecting us. What was not dealt with appropriately went
28 on to become the culture I was raised in. When people in positions of power have no
29 accountability, they create a path of hurt and destruction. Systems left unchecked don't
30 improve, they deteriorate. This is what has happened at Gloriavale. What began as a
31 sharing life became "take your share". In the same way, those small symptoms of control
32 and abuse have morphed into a culture where abuse is most unfortunately normal and
33 almost okay.

1 The people have suffered emotional, physical, sexual, and racial abuse as well as
2 neglect. Neglect of their everyday needs and rights, neglect to educate and the ability to
3 function as healthy individuals in society, including the racial injustice of the Māori people
4 of Gloriavale and the Indians in the Indian community.

5 The methods Gloriavale has used in the past to deal with any issues is to character
6 assassinate, to publicly shame and this begins from as young as pre-school-aged children,
7 removing children from families, sitting them separately in a large room in school. Not
8 allowing peer interactions and meaningful friendships to form is harmful.

9 How can these deep-rooted methods change when it is the same people in
10 leadership? Where have the people been that could have made a difference? The agencies
11 that have known for over 50 years the truth of what has been happening there. Have they
12 turned a blind eye, or was it simply put in the too-hard basket?

13 Gloriavale has maintained for many years a belief that they are capable of dealing
14 with the instances of abuse that occur in their community. Should the survivors be
15 expected to trust the very people who caused the abuse, the Shepherds and Servants who
16 are in those positions of authority to conduct a thorough and appropriate investigation? We
17 need these very people to be held accountable for the damage they have caused. An
18 apology would go a long way, but a true apology comes with meaningful change.

19 We would like to see the systemic issues addressed, policies and robust systems put
20 in place to stop this level of abuse ever happening again.

21 However, one simple policy change to tick a box for the public eye will do nothing
22 to deal with the dysfunction that exists across multiple layers of the Gloriavale society, if
23 the same leaders are left to make those changes. The same leaders that have covered for
24 abusers for years, lied to protect family names, and learned that to deal with a victim is only
25 to shame and accuse them of being the offender themselves.

26 This is not about one perpetrator or one man. This is about a system that enables
27 abuse. The survivors have an understanding of what needs to change. If only someone
28 would listen. Why should the survivors be re-traumatised over and over again whilst
29 begging to be heard when they risk giving evidence only to add to the public saturation of
30 all too many similar abuse stories and the constant shame and guilt put on them by the very
31 people who should care the most?

32 Where the leaders at Gloriavale have been put almost in a position of God and held
33 in the utmost esteem, have created a culture of shifting the blame, minimising the trauma

1 and deeming the victim the offender, we know we will be mocked by our own. We know
2 we will be called bitter and angry. But we speak up for the children, the future.

3 We survivors are a forgiving group of people. We can cope with what's in the past.
4 We can hope and heal and work for a better life. But we want lasting change for our
5 families still inside. We want a safe place for our nieces and nephews to grow up in. We
6 want them to have the same liberties, opportunities, education and care any New Zealander
7 deserves. We need to know there will be significant changes to the systems and leadership
8 that brought us here today.

9 And if I can draw attention to paragraph 16 in Gloriavale's response:

10 "The child protection policy is reviewed annually. We will review the policy in
11 November. A number of our own people are making submissions to the trust which drew
12 up the original policy. The trustees will consider these submissions and modify the policy
13 as they can to make it more practical."

14 That is a lie. It is not the charitable trust that runs Gloriavale, it is the Shepherds
15 and Servants and it is these men that need to be held accountable for what they have
16 allowed to happen in Gloriavale, for the abuse that continues today, for the neglect that
17 continues today, and I'd like to see that accountability happen. Thank you.

18 **CHAIR:** Kia ora, Ms Overcomer. I must say that your name says it all. Thank you to you, thank
19 you to the other survivors who have had the courage and the fortitude to stand up. You've
20 revealed the pain beneath that and we acknowledge that and we want to assure all the
21 survivors that you are listened to and you are being heard. Thank you, please now go and
22 look after yourself. **[Applause]**

23 **MS BEATON:** Madam Chair, I think it's time for the morning break and after that we'll have --

24 **CHAIR:** Certainly. What time shall we come back?

25 **MS BEATON:** Perhaps 5 to 11.

26 **CHAIR:** All right, we will resume again at 5 to 11. Thank you.

27 **Adjournment from 10.41 am to 11.04 am**

28 **CHAIR:** Just before we commence, we discussed in the break the length of the rest of the session.

29 Can I just check with Ms Basire, is there an arrangement made with our stenographers and
30 signers that we can go through until 1?

31 **MS BASIRE:** Yes, we just need to make that break at around 12 for five minutes.

32 **CHAIR:** Is that suitable for you?

33 **STENOGRAPHER:** Yes.

1 **CHAIR:** So on the basis we will take a quick break at about 12 to allow the signers and
2 stenographer to rest up, we will continue through until about 1 o'clock, that's just for the
3 benefit of the people watching and present in the room.

4 Thank you, Ms Basire.

5 **MS BASIRE:** Thank you, Madam Chair. Tēnā koutou, tēnā koutou, tēnā koutou katoa. Counsel's
6 name is Kathy Basire and I am a non-disabled middle-aged Pākehā woman with grey
7 mid-length hair wearing a red dress and black jacket. And on the screen we have appearing
8 from Christchurch Chris Shannon who is a lawyer representing Gloriavale and Clare Sykes
9 and I also understand the two Gloriavale witnesses Howard Temple and Rachel Stedfast are
10 in Christchurch as well.

11 So what I'm going to do is hand over to Mr Shannon who I understand is going to
12 do a brief opening for and on behalf of Gloriavale and introduce his witnesses and have a
13 short evidence-in-chief.

14 **CHAIR:** Thank you, Ms Basire.

15 Tēnā koe, Mr Shannon. Thank you for your appearance today on behalf of
16 Gloriavale, and thank you to the two witnesses who will be appearing as well.
17 Mr Shannon, do you have any opening submissions?

18 **OPENING STATEMENT BY GLORIAVALE**

19 **MR SHANNON:** Yes, thank you, Madam Chair. My name's Chris Shannon, I'm a Pākehā
20 middle-aged male, brown hair, glasses and dark blue suit.

21 In terms of introductory remarks, as you know, Gloriavale's a Christian community
22 in Haupiri on the west coast of the South Island. It's home to around 600 community
23 members who live life according to their understanding of New Testament scripture and
24 under New Zealand law.

25 Now, it's not uncommon for religious organisations to have faced the blight of
26 sexual abuse and to have historically dealt with it inadequately, and Gloriavale is no
27 exception to that. However, the community has made, is making, and will continue to
28 make serious efforts to deal with abuse issues. It's done that through outside assistance
29 from outside agencies, many agencies, improved policies, education of members, and by
30 renewed focus on parents looking after their own families. Leader Howard Temple has
31 reported people to Police himself.

32 In terms of the background, the community started in the early 1970s at Springbank
33 in Canterbury. Hopeful Christian, then named Neville Cooper, was the original Shepherd
34 or spiritual leader having come over from Australia. A group purchased an original 50-acre

1 block, they built buildings and a school and the community grew over time. In about 1991
2 it moved across to Gloriavale on the West Coast.

3 It's a communal life where income and assets are pooled and shared, there's almost
4 no private property in Gloriavale. Everyone contributes according to their ability and
5 everyone is provided for according to their needs. There's a What We Believe document
6 which sets out views on scriptures held at the time and there's been a number of iterations
7 of that such that the first edition in 1989 is now well out of date.

8 In terms of how families live, they live in multi-storey hostels, several families to a
9 floor, each family has their own living quarters, there's shared bathroom facilities, and
10 there's a communal kitchen area used by the whole community. Children are educated in
11 the community at the pre-schools and school, and there are talented people in the
12 community as can be seen at the community concerts.

13 Birth control is not believed in, so there are large families. The Gloriavale
14 community consists of about 90 families. While Gloriavale has a leadership group,
15 families are at the centre of the way of life with hostel living arrangements generally trying
16 to keep families together and children under 17 being on the same floor as their parents.

17 The leadership doesn't always know what occurs in family spaces. It's expected that
18 parents will have oversight of their own children and will look out for their welfare just as
19 in the outside world. Various members do interact with the outside world through various
20 things such as teacher training, Correspondence School, holidays, work, and the Internet.

21 Now, in terms of dealing with abuse, up until the mid-1990s, Gloriavale founder
22 Hopeful Christian dealt with complaints and confessions of sexual or physical abuse. As
23 the community grew in size, a few leaders, a few men became leaders, Shepherds and
24 Servants but Hopeful was clearly the decision-maker in charge until he passed away.

25 Police prosecuted Hopeful Christian in 1994 and he was convicted of indecent
26 assault.

27 Historically, the response to allegations of abuse was to create -- try to create --
28 repentance from the offender and forgiveness from the victim, and not to go to authorities.
29 It was inadequate.

30 An example of failing to go to authorities was in relation to a former teacher, Just
31 Standfast who had indecently assaulted a student in 2012. The school principal, the then
32 school principal, on learning of that allegation, still declared that Just Standfast was fit to be
33 a teacher in 2012 and 2016. He was not, that was wrong, the former principal has since

1 accepted that before the Teaching Council, Just Standfast has been convicted and has had
2 nothing to do with the school for years.

3 Hopeful Christian passed away in 2018, Howard Temple became the new
4 overseeing Shepherd or spiritual leader. He's American with a different leadership style.
5 He reported to Police in 2020 regarding abuse that took place amongst young men in the
6 community and the Police investigation revealed that some victims of historical abuse had
7 now become alleged offenders themselves.

8 The community has been working hard with Police and Oranga Tamariki to deal
9 with abuse issues. Oranga Tamariki has interviewed every child in the community over
10 five years old and some more than once. Individual members have volunteered information
11 to Police, supported by Howard Temple and current leadership. It is recognised and
12 accepted that any form of child abuse or abuse of anyone is unacceptable and this must and
13 will be dealt with by the appropriate authorities.

14 So there have been many changes in the way the community deals with allegations
15 of abuse in the nine years since Ms Overcomer has left the community. There have been
16 changes in the areas of policies, education and providing for greater family time.

17 In relation to policies, with advice and help from outside agencies, including Police,
18 Oranga Tamariki, Safeguarding Children, and others, the community prepared a Child
19 Protection Safety and Well-Being Policy and a Bullying Harassment and Sexual
20 Harassment Policy.

21 And with help from Oranga Tamariki and Safeguarding Children there's a child
22 protection's lead group in the community. That consists of three men, four women, plus
23 two young people, and the lead is a social worker from Oranga Tamariki. There's a
24 meeting every week with the social worker who consults with the child protection leads
25 about complaints, allegations, and effectively directs traffic as to who's to report them to
26 what authority.

27 Gloriavale members are now encouraged to engage with Police and Oranga
28 Tamariki by leaders, school teachers, pre-school teachers, and to work with any agency to
29 create a safe place to live. A community police officer also visits Gloriavale each week to
30 offer assistance.

31 In terms of the updating policies, the approach is to take expert advice and to follow
32 it.

33 In terms of education for community members, this has been a focus in recent times
34 for the community through the utilisation of many agencies, including the Police youth

1 education officers, the Empowerment Trust to assist with education of adults and young
2 people, Oranga Tamariki. There have been STOP and START programmes. There's been
3 Incredible Years programmes for parents and for teachers. There are counselling rooms set
4 aside for people to talk to anyone in confidence with visiting specialists, and Safeguarding
5 Children have been involved.

6 In terms of family time, there's been a renewed focus on parents having more
7 oversight of their own children and looking out for their own welfare and there's no
8 restriction on families seeking help for their own children, and the idea behind the greater
9 family time is to improve the parent/child connection so that if there are any issues arising
10 kids can disclose to their parents what's going on.

11 Now, in terms of criticisms, the communal lifestyle and beliefs of Gloriavale are not
12 for everyone. Around 200 people have left in recent years. Some of these leavers are very
13 critical of Gloriavale or its leaders and have been waging a campaign against Gloriavale in
14 the media and in the courts. Some refer very negatively to Hopeful Christian's time as the
15 leader and tend to disparage positive changes that have been made since. Some also
16 attempt to blight any suggestion that positive change will ever occur.

17 Well, Gloriavale cannot change its history, but it can and is trying to learn from it.
18 Like any minority group, the people of Gloriavale have certain beliefs and cultural
19 traditions. But Howard Temple is committed to ensuring that past mistakes in dealing with
20 abuse do not occur again and the community wants to re-shape aspects of its culture to
21 make an obviously safe place for children, the elderly, disabled and everyone.

22 In terms of the witnesses and evidence, there are two preliminary points I'd ask you
23 to bear in mind when considering the evidence. The first, as you know, the Inquiry has
24 received statements from survivors relating to Gloriavale, four of which were prepared over
25 a year ago. We've received these in intervals over the last three and a half weeks up to
26 Monday night and while I appreciate there may be good reasons for it, it's meant that we
27 haven't had sufficient time to deal with all the details in the statements, nor is there
28 sufficient hearing time to call witnesses who may have other perspectives on some of that
29 evidence.

30 Second, there is a witness statement from a lawyer assisting the Commission that
31 will be put to our witnesses. She received training from the Gloriavale Leavers' Trust and
32 has completed some 17 witness statements for former members of Gloriavale. And while I
33 can understand the efficiency reasons behind having someone summarise other statements,
34 we have not seen many of the underlying statements, do not know who's making the

1 allegations in many cases, the timeframes referred to, or the context. She says, "I have no
2 reason to suspect that the statements are not representative." However, they are only from
3 leavers motivated enough to speak to her who are likely to be associated with the Leavers'
4 Trust.

5 So they may not represent the changes that have taken place and cannot really be
6 considered a random representative sample.

7 In any event, two witnesses will be called from Gloriavale. The first witness is
8 Howard Temple who is the overseeing Shepherd or leader. He's been in that role since
9 Hopeful Christian passed away in 2018. He's 82 years old. He'll briefly tell you about his
10 background, how Hopeful Christian historically dealt with allegations and the changes that
11 have been made under his leadership.

12 The second witness is Rachel Stedfast, she's the acting school principal, she will tell
13 you about her background as a teacher and a bit about how the school operates and changes
14 that have been made there.

15 She'll also talk about the extent that Māori culture has been incorporated in the
16 education setting.

17 The first witness will be Howard Temple. If I may just change seats so he's in the
18 middle of the screen.

19 **CHAIR:** Yes, thank you very much, Mr Shannon.

20 **MR SHANNON:** This is Howard Temple. Are the witnesses to be sworn in?

21 **CHAIR:** Yes. Good morning, Mr Temple. Welcome to the Royal Commission.

22 **MR TEMPLE:** Good morning to you.

23 **CHAIR:** Thank you. You don't have to stand when you speak, we're quite happy with you just
24 staying where you are. Before we go any further, can I ask you to take the affirmation,
25 please.

26 **HOWARD WENDELL TEMPLE (Affirmed)**

27 **CHAIR:** Thank you, Mr Temple.

28 Ms Basire.

29 **MS BASIRE:** Thank you, Madam Chair. I just wanted to check first with Mr Shannon that you
30 didn't want to do any evidence-in-chief?

31 **MR SHANNON:** Yes, I was just going to do some brief evidence-in-chief first from Mr Temple
32 and second from Rachel Stedfast for about 10 minutes in total if I could.

33 **MS BASIRE:** Yes, that's fine. I've just had a note from our technical people: "Can you ensure
34 that everyone speaks as loudly as they can."

1 **CHAIR:** Yes, please, remembering we're having to hear you from Christchurch so it's quite a long
2 way. But if you can speak up that would be much appreciated, thank you. So Mr Shannon,
3 I'll leave you just to lead your witness.

4 **QUESTIONING BY MR SHANNON:** Thank you.

5 Would you tell us your full name, please?

6 **MR TEMPLE:** My full name is Howard Wendell Temple.

7 **MR SHANNON:** You are the overseeing Shepherd of Gloriavale Christian Community at Lake
8 Haupiri?

9 **MR TEMPLE:** That's correct.

10 **MR SHANNON:** What does that mean to be the overseeing Shepherd?

11 **MR TEMPLE:** The overseeing Shepherd means overseeing the community, the operations of the
12 community and we are expecting that there will be other communities built up following
13 the pattern of the one that we are in at the present time, and the overseeing Shepherd will
14 sort of have a general oversight of all other communities as well.

15 **MR SHANNON:** I understand you're 82 years old?

16 **MR TEMPLE:** 82 years old, yes.

17 **MR SHANNON:** An American citizen by birth?

18 **MR TEMPLE:** An American citizen by birth, yes.

19 **MR SHANNON:** Just tell us a bit about your background.

20 **MR TEMPLE:** My background, I was born and raised in the southern states of United States in
21 the cotton fields. I joined the American Navy at the age of 19, on an icebreaking ship going
22 down to McMurdo Sound at Antarctica, used to stop into New Zealand quite regularly to
23 refuel and resupply. I met my wife on one of those trips, married her a little time later and
24 when my time was up in the American Navy I got discharged in New Zealand, that was
25 1964, and I've been here ever since then with my wife.

26 **MR SHANNON:** And after the Navy?

27 **MR TEMPLE:** After the Navy, yes, I went working with Christchurch, working in a motor
28 garage there, I worked there for 18 months, city life didn't agree with me, so I moved out on
29 to a farm, sheep and cropping farm in North Canterbury, and worked there for one year,
30 then moved on to another sheep and cropping farm and worked there until 1970. In
31 mid-1970 I joined up with the Christian group that I'm with at the present time.

32 That was in 1970. From then on, I worked within the church, I started a motor
33 repair and engineering workshop servicing machinery and vehicles in the community plus
34 outside business as well. And that has been my life since that time.

1 In 2008 we started to establish a Christian community on our pattern in India and
2 from that time on up until 2018 it was, I was visiting regularly in India, I spent nearly half
3 of my life over there, three months in India, three months back here, three months in India
4 and three months back here, building up that community over there.

5 **MR SHANNON:** We've obviously got limited time here --

6 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.

7 **MR SHANNON:** -- so I understand you've been overseeing Shepherd since May 2018 following
8 the passing of Hopeful Christian; is that right?

9 **MR TEMPLE:** Correct, yes.

10 **MR SHANNON:** All right. In terms of in the past and in the Hopeful Christian days, how were
11 allegations of abuse dealt with?

12 **MR TEMPLE:** In Hopeful Christian's time, in the beginning he dealt with them on his own. As
13 time went on for a number of years then as the population grew, then he took in other men,
14 both Shepherds and Servants, to help him in making decisions along those lines and how to
15 handle these accusations and so forth.

16 **MR SHANNON:** Right. And historically, he wouldn't go to authorities, is that --

17 **MR TEMPLE:** That is right, that is right. It was a scripture of Bible which was slightly
18 misinterpreted but at the time we understood that to be true. We have come, since that
19 time, to realise that no, it wasn't perfectly true, so we have changed our attitudes.

20 **MR SHANNON:** What's brought about that change?

21 **MR TEMPLE:** Well, the change is understanding of scripture plus the way things were going in
22 the whole world, in the whole country, law changes coming into place made us have a more
23 serious look at the scriptures along those lines. Now, to comply with the Bible and with the
24 civil laws, if you call it that way, the state laws, because the Bible teaches us we must
25 comply with state laws as well as with God's law. So to bring the two together, we've come
26 to see maybe the actual wording of that scripture, maybe we were taking it a little bit too far
27 one-sided.

28 **MR SHANNON:** So what changes have been made in terms of how abuse allegations are handled
29 now?

30 **MR TEMPLE:** Now we will contact the Police, we actually have a team of leads, as Chris said
31 before, comprised of three men and four ladies that came in after investigation by Oranga
32 Tamariki and the Police, it came in after that investigation. These were a number of people
33 that our members could freely go and talk to about issues, any concerns that they might
34 have about abuse of any form.

1 So at the present time now if there's anyone with any concern about abuse of any
2 sort or any concern about the people, they can go to one of these leads and report it to them
3 and then they will contact the senior lead, which is a representative from Oranga Tamariki,
4 they get together and they will discuss it and then that lead person will contact her
5 authorities and they carry it on to there in investigating and making the decision of how
6 serious the occurrence is, and if it needs to, they will take it right on to the Police, and then
7 the Police deal with it accordingly.

8 **MR SHANNON:** I think we've got limited time so I might just ask some questions now about the
9 second witness Rachel Stedfast.

10 **CHAIR:** Before we do that, I didn't realise you were going to deal with them together, but I'll just
11 quickly administer the oath to Ms Stedfast.

12 Good morning, Ms Stedfast.

13 **RACHEL STEDFAST (Affirmed)**

14 **CHAIR:** Yes, Mr Shannon.

15 **MR SHANNON:** Ms Sykes will be ...

16 **QUESTIONING BY MS SYKES:** Good morning. My name is Ms Sykes. For those who can't
17 see me, I'm a blonde Pākehā woman wearing a black jacket and white top today. Ms
18 Stedfast is next to me.

19 Could you please confirm your full name is Rachel Stedfast?

20 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yes, my full name is Rachel Stedfast.

21 **MS SYKES:** And are you the current Acting Principal of the school at Gloriavale?

22 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yes, yes, I am.

23 **MS SYKES:** So you've just seen Mr Shannon ask Mr Temple a few questions, I'll do the same
24 thing. And then Ms Basire and the Commission may have some questions for you.

25 First of all, would you also please give a short visual description of yourself?

26 **MRS STEDFAST:** I am brown haired, blue-eyed, I am wearing a pink shirt and a white jacket
27 and I have a colourful tie around my head.

28 **MS SYKES:** Thank you. And so you provided a short witness statement previously to the
29 Commission dated 12 October and you confirm that is your evidence to the Commission?

30 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yes.

31 **MS SYKES:** And hopefully they should have a copy of that document.

32 So, first of all, could you please tell us how long you've lived with the Gloriavale
33 community?

1 **MRS STEDFAST:** I was born at Springbank but when we shifted over to Gloriavale in 1991, I've
2 been there my whole life basically.

3 **MS SYKES:** What qualifications do you have?

4 **MRS STEDFAST:** So I have a diploma in teaching, I have also done further training in quite a
5 few other areas and received qualifications for that.

6 **MS SYKES:** Can you tell us a little bit about that training that you've undertaken?

7 **MRS STEDFAST:** So the training I have undertaken has -- it's kind of ongoing. But we are
8 participating in a nationwide movement, so to speak, so the nationwide movement on
9 training teachers across the country on Te Whāriki, Tātaiako [cultural competencies for
10 teachers of Māori learners], these are really important documents. Te Whāriki is the New
11 Zealand bicultural curriculum for early childhood centres.

12 I have also done multi-sensory instruction and language arts which is, yeah, it's like
13 an English programme for school, school level. The training in Tātaiako was done through
14 Massey University so they came out to Gloriavale and we also went into workshops in
15 Greymouth.

16 There's some other programmes that we've done and it required travelling into
17 Greymouth and meeting with early childhood teachers from all over the West Coast and
18 that was evenings over a long stretch of time.

19 But yeah, just met with all those different teachers, different centre managers from
20 across New Zealand. I've been up to Napier, Wellington, through our working with early
21 childhood centres up there, networking with the principals, yeah.

22 **MS SYKES:** Does that sometimes involve working with Government agencies like Ministry of
23 Education or other agencies, how are they involved in school?

24 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yeah. So Ministry of Education is quite involved in the school at the
25 moment, they come out bi-weekly just to get updates, to help us through this time. Also we
26 have had regular visits from the Education Review Office. I particularly know about early
27 childhood because that's where I've been. So just moving into the school, I don't have a lot
28 of information on the school of the past, I do have information on the current status of the
29 school, but our early childhood is quite, I'm quite into that. So yeah.

30 **MS SYKES:** Speaking about the culture of the school, then, as you've mentioned, can you tell us
31 a bit -- and the early childhood centres -- can you tell us a bit about how disabled students
32 are supported or assisted in their learning?

33 **MRS STEDFAST:** So early childhood I would say would be slightly more advanced in this area
34 than the school, just from being in both, but the school is making major changes and

1 training teachers, individual teachers can actually identify and provide for those children
2 with neurodiversity or -- so we have some students with Down syndrome, we have a
3 student enrolled in our school at the moment with severe cerebral palsy. So we get outside
4 agencies, SES [specialist education services] workers from the Ministry, occupational
5 therapists, workers from BLENNZ [Blind and Low Vision Education Network NZ] who
6 come out on a regular basis, they help to train our teachers, they also do teaching sessions
7 with those students.

8 We have a number of students with neurodiversity and different learnings needs at
9 the moment that have occupational therapists coming out and working with them on a
10 regular basis, sometimes bi-weekly and yeah, so our knowledge for the teachers
11 themselves, all our teachers participated in a Providing for Neurodiverse Learners in a
12 workshop, was provided at Shantytown, so we're definitely up-skilling there.

13 Yeah, so it's getting better and better.

14 **MS SYKES:** Thank you. And then speaking about the school culture again and the education
15 programme, can you talk a bit about how the school incorporates Māori culture, te reo
16 Māori, tikanga into the education of its pupils?

17 **MRS STEDFAST:** Te reo Māori is actually -- has been in early childhood centres since we took
18 on the curriculum, the Te Whāriki curriculum, so our early childhood teachers are more
19 advanced in this area. It's generally part of their professional growth cycles, which used to
20 be called appraisal. We also have done a lot of training on the Tātaiako, the five principles
21 in Tātaiako, which is a -- it's cultural competencies for teachers of Māori learners.

22 So even getting an understanding on that, I feel we matched a lot of other early
23 childhood centres, New Zealand wide. I did get a document from the Education Review
24 Office, and it was called Te Whāriki 2017, (inaudible), it was about implementing Te
25 Whāriki and they did -- they kind of analysed and did a lot of research on how early
26 childhood centres were incorporating Te Whāriki and when I actually analysed ours,
27 because I was centre manager at the time and I was doing some professional development
28 on it, I was pleasantly surprised to actually see that we were not in the lowest bracket in
29 New Zealand, we were about just above average. So I thought yeah, okay, we've done that,
30 so we can go further.

31 So yeah, the school at the moment is definitely working on up-skilling, training
32 teachers, and incorporating that whole Tātaiako into the teaching practice of every teacher,
33 and making sure that those students who do identify as Māori learners are actually provided

1 for and that our teachers can deliver curriculum content, teaching strategies, and a whole
2 culture that is -- fits with those learners.

3 **MS SYKES:** Thank you. Then my final question about training at the school for teachers and
4 also for parents, is: What sort of training do teachers receive, or all people receive relating
5 to supporting children who make complaints of abuse and any training to do with
6 developing healthy relationships that are safe for the people involved?

7 **MRS STEDFAST:** So all our teachers and parents, managers, leaders, everyone has done training
8 with the STOP and START Programme. We have also done --

9 **MS SYKES:** Do you want to briefly explain what those programmes involve, please?

10 **MRS STEDFAST:** So the STOP and START, they're kind of two different organisations that
11 work together. So we have parents' evenings where professionals from STOP and START
12 both come out and work with all the parents, do training -- yeah, training on how to identify
13 abuse in children, training on how to identify traumatised children, and what's needed for
14 those children, you know, from thereon.

15 So our teachers have also done training with the Empowerment Trust. We have
16 also done training with members from the Police, so we have an assigned PC [Police
17 constable] who comes out for the school and who does lots of programmes with the
18 children like Keeping Ourselves Safe, yeah, just actually training on what actual
19 traumatised children, what abuse looks like in victims and how to actually move them and
20 support them going forward.

21 **MS SYKES:** Thank you.

22 Those are all of my questions. So now I think we hand over to Ms Basire to ask
23 questions of you and Howard.

24 **CHAIR:** Thank you, counsel.

25 **QUESTIONING BY MS BASIRE:** Thank you.

26 Good morning, Mr Temple and Ms Stedfast. Mr Temple, I'll direct my questions at
27 you first and that will probably take us, we're going to have a short break at about 12
28 because somebody's typing everything up and then we'll come back and go through to 1 and
29 then have a lunch break.

30 Now, you've just told us that you are 82 years of age; is that right?

31 **MR TEMPLE:** Correct, yes.

32 **MS BASIRE:** And you joined the Christian community that's now called the Gloriavale Christian
33 Community in the mid-1970s?

34 **MR TEMPLE:** That is right, yes.

- 1 **MS BASIRE:** Where was the community in the mid-1970s?
- 2 **MR TEMPLE:** That was on the east coast of the South Island out of Christchurch a ways, a little
3 place called Springbank.
- 4 **MS BASIRE:** Right. So I understand that initially the community was in Rangiora, is that right?
- 5 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, it started in a church in Rangiora.
- 6 **MS BASIRE:** Yeah. And at that time members of the church would live in their own family
7 homes and go to their own jobs but just come together for church, is that right?
- 8 **MR TEMPLE:** That is right. That is right, yes.
- 9 **MS BASIRE:** Then there was this move to Springbank which I understand was in about 1979, is
10 that right?
- 11 **MR TEMPLE:** '79 -- I'm working on my memory now, ma'am, I would have thought it would
12 have been earlier than that.
- 13 **MS BASIRE:** I'm just following the responses that you gave in your written document, but it
14 probably doesn't matter which year of the '70s, we both agree that there was some land
15 purchased at Springbank which was about 17 kilometres inland from Rangiora, is that
16 right?
- 17 **MR TEMPLE:** Correct, yes.
- 18 **MS BASIRE:** And it was at that stage the communal living started to happen, is that right?
- 19 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, that is right. It happened gradually over a number of years, before it became
20 an actual community.
- 21 **MS BASIRE:** So how many people roughly were in the community in the 1970s, living
22 communally?
- 23 **MR TEMPLE:** Approximately, in the beginning, about 30 people (inaudible), in 1970 it could
24 have been 75. I don't really remember that far, but probably 75 people at that time.
- 25 **MS BASIRE:** So initially it was quite a small group of people?
- 26 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, very small, I want to say about 35, 40 people.
- 27 **MS BASIRE:** Now, Neville Cooper essentially founded the community, didn't he?
- 28 **MR TEMPLE:** That is right, yes.
- 29 **MS BASIRE:** And he'd come to New Zealand in 1967 and he had tried to do something similar in
30 Queensland but he'd fallen out with the group he was with over doctrinal issues; is that
31 correct?
- 32 **MR TEMPLE:** I would have said that was in New Zealand in the North Island. When he came to
33 New Zealand he went into the North Island to a church group there. There was a division
34 there because of doctrinal issues, and he came down to the South Island then.

- 1 **MS BASIRE:** So he came down to the South Island and started his church group in Rangiora and
2 that's when you met him?
- 3 **MR TEMPLE:** That's correct, yes.
- 4 **MS BASIRE:** After living communally in Springbank for a number of years, your community
5 purchased some land in Haupiri in the West Coast, is that right?
- 6 **MR TEMPLE:** That's right, yes.
- 7 **MS BASIRE:** And this is remote valley about 60 kilometres inland from Greymouth?
- 8 **MR TEMPLE:** That's right, yes.
- 9 **MS BASIRE:** What prompted the move to the West Coast?
- 10 **MR TEMPLE:** We needed a larger property, we had outgrown the property that we had on the
11 East Coast at Springbank, we were looking for a bigger property and a property on the
12 West Coast was up for sale. We had a look at it, it looked acceptable to us, so we shifted
13 there.
- 14 **MS BASIRE:** What was the size of the community in the early '90s?
- 15 **MR TEMPLE:** I'm sorry, I have to do a bit of guessing along that line. About 200 people when
16 we left the East Coast and came to the West Coast, it would probably be 200 people.
- 17 **MS BASIRE:** Thank you. And I understand you're currently around 600, are you?
- 18 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, we're just under 600. More exactly, 585 would be a more exact number.
- 19 **MS BASIRE:** And that's less than what you've had previously. Do I understand from what your
20 counsel said, that there might have been up to 700 or 800 people at one stage?
- 21 **MR TEMPLE:** No, no, sorry, there would never have been that many. There's never been that
22 many number of us together there. 600 would be the maximum. I don't remember that
23 number being an exact number of the members there.
- 24 **MS BASIRE:** That's fine.
25 Now, your lawyer in his opening, Mr Shannon, briefly explained to us the living
26 arrangements. I understand you have a number of buildings on that site?
- 27 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.
- 28 **MS BASIRE:** And there's also businesses run from the site; is that correct?
- 29 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, that's right. Yes, correct.
- 30 **MS BASIRE:** So in terms of the living arrangement, you have a central dining room, kitchen, sort
31 of gathering area; is that correct?
- 32 **MR TEMPLE:** That's correct, yes.
- 33 **MS BASIRE:** And then four hostels where the families live?
- 34 **MR TEMPLE:** That's correct, yes.

- 1 **MS BASIRE:** I understand that in those hostels the families live on the first two floors?
- 2 **MR TEMPLE:** That's correct, yes.
- 3 **MS BASIRE:** And there's about 11 families per floor?
- 4 **MR TEMPLE:** About that, it may vary from floor to floor.
- 5 **MS BASIRE:** And we know that you have large families, so each family could have around 10
6 children; is that right?
- 7 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, the largest one has 13 children.
- 8 **MS BASIRE:** Right. The living quarters that you talk about, in effect a family would have two
9 bedrooms perhaps for them and their children?
- 10 **MR TEMPLE:** There are some have three bedrooms.
- 11 **MS BASIRE:** But predominantly just a normal-sized bedroom for perhaps up to 10, 12 people?
- 12 **MR TEMPLE:** I just have to think for a minute, sorry.
- 13 **MS BASIRE:** That's okay.
- 14 **MR TEMPLE:** Three-bedroom for 12 people, I'm getting a little bit of cooperation here with
15 Rachel.
- 16 **MS BASIRE:** Right. And that's their only private area in the hostel, isn't it, those bedrooms?
- 17 **MR TEMPLE:** That would be right, yes, that's right, those bedrooms.
- 18 **MS BASIRE:** And when you talk of having family time and meal times, that would be in a
19 communal area with the 11 families, wouldn't it?
- 20 **MR TEMPLE:** That would be, we have breakfast and lunch in the communal dining room. Tea,
21 we have that at home now.
- 22 **MS BASIRE:** But that's what I mean, when I'm talking about "home", the hostel, each floor has a
23 communal room.
- 24 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, that's correct, yes.
- 25 **MS BASIRE:** Right. They don't have their own lounge rooms or kitchens per family, do they?
- 26 **MR TEMPLE:** No, they don't. They have a large lounge room and then they have a smaller
27 kitchen room.
- 28 **MS BASIRE:** Thank you. Just a bit later I'm going to be asking you some questions about the
29 changes you've made and I just wanted to -- everybody to understand the sort of
30 environment that we're talking about. So you've told us in the written response to the
31 Notice to Produce that your leaders are called "Shepherds" and "Servants"?
- 32 **MR TEMPLE:** That's correct, yes.
- 33 **MS BASIRE:** You are the overseeing Shepherd, so you are the overall leader?
- 34 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, that's correct.

- 1 **MS BASIRE:** And a Shepherd sees to the spiritual needs of the people?
- 2 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, that's correct.
- 3 **MS BASIRE:** And each floor of the accommodation has a Shepherd in charge?
- 4 **MR TEMPLE:** No, not at the present time, it did have earlier on, but not at the present time.
- 5 **MS BASIRE:** Why is that?
- 6 **MR TEMPLE:** One has died, one has died, a couple have resigned.
- 7 **MS BASIRE:** Right. So some floors of the accommodation wouldn't have a Shepherd but they'd
- 8 have a Servant?
- 9 **MR TEMPLE:** No, not altogether, but that would be a person that has been appointed to sort of
- 10 take a bit of responsibility for that floor.
- 11 **MS BASIRE:** Can you tell us what Servants in your organisation do?
- 12 **MR TEMPLE:** They work alongside the Shepherds, assisting the Shepherds in sort of overseeing
- 13 the community, the people and so forth.
- 14 **MS BASIRE:** In terms of hierarchy, are Shepherds higher up in the hierarchy than Servants?
- 15 **MR TEMPLE:** They would -- I don't go along that line too much. In comparison with, say, a
- 16 Shepherd would be something equal to a Bishop in a church, the Servant would be
- 17 something like a deacon in the church. But in my looking at it, we're all equal there, it's
- 18 just the Shepherd and Servants are delegated to have a general oversight of the people in
- 19 the community.
- 20 I'm not too concerned about the hierarchy, the qualifications or anything like that,
- 21 I'm not overly concerned about that, as long as the people are getting looked after properly.
- 22 **MS BASIRE:** Historically I understand the Shepherds were in a position of leadership over the
- 23 Servants and therefore over the people, so there was a hierarchy traditionally?
- 24 **MR TEMPLE:** That's right, correct, yes.
- 25 **MS BASIRE:** I understand, Mr Temple, that you were appointed a Shepherd in 1985.
- 26 **MR TEMPLE:** That's right, correct, yes.
- 27 **MS BASIRE:** And at that time, in 1985, it was just you and Hopeful Christian and David Courage
- 28 as Shepherds?
- 29 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, correct.
- 30 **MS BASIRE:** And then David Courage left in 1995?
- 31 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, correct.
- 32 **MS BASIRE:** And just before that a man called Fervent Stedfast was appointed as a Shepherd as
- 33 well?
- 34 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, correct.

1 **MS BASIRE:** So from 1985 to 1995 there were only three Shepherds, all of which were male; is
2 that correct?

3 **MR TEMPLE:** That's correct, yes.

4 **MS BASIRE:** In your Notice to Produce response, it's document 147 in our bundle, you've talked
5 about gender roles and I just want to read something out to you. You've said:

6 "Gender roles in the Gloriavale community are defined along biblical lines with
7 specific roles for men and women as outlined in the New Testament. Men have
8 traditionally been the decision-makers, and bread-earners while women have taken their
9 place as mothers, running household areas, in later years in paid work as teachers in the
10 early childhood centres caring for children."

11 Now, you'd agree that that is the current position still, that the community is
12 structured along biblical lines and you don't have any female Shepherds or Servants?

13 **MR TEMPLE:** That's correct, yes.

14 **MS BASIRE:** It's fair to say that the community, both at Springbank and at Gloriavale,
15 intertwined spirituality, education, business and family altogether?

16 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, that's correct.

17 **MS BASIRE:** None is independent of each other due to the goals of the community to live your
18 life separate from the outside world in accordance with the New Testament?

19 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, that's correct.

20 **MS BASIRE:** Now this Inquiry is concerned with abuse in care that happened in the years 1950
21 to 1999 primarily and you have made some acknowledgments in your written responses
22 that some of your doctrinal beliefs have contributed to abuse and lack of reporting. So my
23 next set of questioning is, I'm going to ask you about the doctrine in the document What
24 We Believe and the Declaration of Commitment pertaining to the 1989 version, but I see
25 we've got to 12 o'clock, so we'll just have a short five-minute break and then come back.

26 **CHAIR:** Yes, you can take a breath and we will be back shortly to resume, thank you.

27 **Adjournment from 11.59 am to 12.08 pm**

28 **CHAIR:** Thank you very much. Yes, Ms Basire, you can carry on.

29 **QUESTIONING BY MS BASIRE CONTINUED:** Thank you.

30 Mr Temple, before the break I had made reference to the document What We
31 Believe. Who was the author of What We Believe?

32 **MR TEMPLE:** Hopeful Christian and Fervent Stedfast, it would have been the two of them.

33 **MS BASIRE:** Right. So Hopeful Christian and David Stedfast?

34 **MR TEMPLE:** Fervent Stedfast.

1 **MS BASIRE:** Oh, sorry, Fervent Stedfast.

2 **MR TEMPLE:** They would discuss it to a degree.

3 **MS BASIRE:** Right. Now, I understand they began working on that in the mid-1980s and the
4 first sort of printed copy was in 1989; would that be about right?

5 **MR TEMPLE:** That would be about right. I can't comment on the beginning of it, but it was
6 finished and made public to the community in '89.

7 **MS BASIRE:** Right. And that document had a corresponding document which was called a
8 Declaration of Commitment; is that correct?

9 **MR TEMPLE:** That's correct, yes.

10 **MS BASIRE:** And effectively What We Believe and the Declaration of Commitment were
11 summaries of what your church saw as the main principles of New Testament Christianity?

12 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, yes, that's correct.

13 **MS BASIRE:** And what was required of an adult to live in the community?

14 **MR TEMPLE:** No, not to live in the community, not to live in the community, to become a
15 partner in a partnership that was required. But we have members or people living in the
16 community now who have not made that commitment.

17 **MS BASIRE:** Right. But you agree --

18 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** Ms Basire, could we just clarify, Mr Temple, when you say
19 "community", like in the Gloriavale community or community as in out in public and
20 people come into their community?

21 **MS BASIRE:** I think, Mr Temple, you are saying that there are people who lived in the
22 Springbank or Gloriavale communities, Christian community, who did not sign the
23 Declaration of Commitment; is that what you meant?

24 **MR TEMPLE:** That's correct. That's correct, yes.

25 **MS BASIRE:** However, you would agree that the document What We Believe was the doctrine of
26 the community as of 1989?

27 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, that was what we believed, that's our interpretation of scripture, yes, what
28 the scriptures meant.

29 **MS BASIRE:** So I just want to take you to the wording, and this, I believe, came from the
30 Declaration of Commitment, but it's the doctrine that you and your lawyer have already
31 mentioned that did cause a problem, and it was the doctrine that led to people not going to
32 the Police.

33 So I'll read it out. This is in, for Mr Shannon's reference, the GLT document ended
34 03 on page 25:

1 "I will never take this Christian community or any person in it or the church at
2 Springbank Trust or any of its board members to any law courts or any other state
3 authority, local body authority or anybody outside this church over any matter but will
4 settle any dispute of any kind with any member of this church only before the leaders and
5 brethren of this church."

6 Do you recall that?

7 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, yes, that's correct.

8 **MS BASIRE:** And it went on to say:

9 "I will never betray any confidence about any person in this community to any
10 person outside this community, nor share with any person outside this community any
11 details about anyone's life here if to do so could, in the judgment of the leaders of the
12 church, be used unjustly against the church or any of its members."

13 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, that's correct.

14 **MS BASIRE:** Now, would you agree that having that doctrine meant that you were effectively
15 preventing the reporting of crime?

16 **MR TEMPLE:** That was written for anyone in the church, all right, in the church, not outside the
17 church, it didn't cover those, only the ones in the church because it refers to our brother.
18 But, looking at it like that, it must say yes, we would not report a crime to the outside.

19 **MS BASIRE:** Right. So you had a policy that prevented community members from reporting
20 crimes to outside authorities?

21 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, according to that word, yes, that is correct.

22 **MS BASIRE:** And everybody in the community knew of this policy, didn't they?

23 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, that's right.

24 **MS BASIRE:** So children would have known about this policy?

25 **MR TEMPLE:** Children that -- they would know that book, What We Believe, they would know
26 it was in the community, I presume, I presume, I would say not everybody in the
27 community had a copy of that book. They wouldn't have. And children not expecting, I'm
28 going to try to word this to make it clear enough to you, sorry, like, children, there's no
29 requirement for them to know that book, because it doesn't really apply to children. I'm
30 trying to put it to you the way I believe it myself.

31 In the church we talk about the -- it refers to the commitment and What We Believe,
32 but we have children there that get baptised right on down to seven, eight years old, that get
33 baptised and once they're baptised they're a member of the community, but then they're not
34 expected to know all of this detail like this.

- 1 **MS BASIRE:** Yes, I understand that. I understand that the children probably wouldn't be able to
2 quote the exact wording of the statement --
- 3 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.
- 4 **MS BASIRE:** -- but do you agree that if this was a wide-held belief in the community that you
5 keep everything that happens in the community inside the community, that children and
6 young people would be well aware of that policy?
- 7 **MR TEMPLE:** I'd say some of them could, but this was never a book -- there was quotes from
8 this book spoken out publicly, but the whole detail of the book was never just taught
9 publicly.
- 10 **MS BASIRE:** Right, so it was taught among the adults?
- 11 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes. Yes, inasmuch as becoming a partner, you can become a partner at 18 years
12 old, they would have to have read What We Believe to make a commitment. They come
13 forth and say, "I would like to make my commitment to the church", one of the
14 requirements is they would have read that book.
- 15 **MS BASIRE:** And when they made the commitment, was that made in a public, was it a
16 public-type celebration when they made the commitment?
- 17 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, it was.
- 18 **MS BASIRE:** In front of the whole community?
- 19 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, normally it is, yes.
- 20 **MS BASIRE:** Do you agree that having a policy that effectively prevented people from reporting
21 crime meant that the types of policies that government agencies applied to your community
22 such as Police vetting were always bound to fail?
- 23 **MR TEMPLE:** No, no, definitely not now. That was written in 2000 -- I mean '89, that was a
24 long time ago, that book has been rewritten a number of times.
- 25 **MS BASIRE:** Well, Mr Temple, I've seen a copy of the 2015 version --
- 26 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.
- 27 **MS BASIRE:** -- and it still had the commitment that you would never take anyone in the
28 community to the authorities. That was as late as 2015?
- 29 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, okay. There's been another one written because we have seen these things,
30 there's another volume written in 2022.
- 31 **MS BASIRE:** Yes, I understand that you got rid of it in 2022, but I'm just trying to establish --
- 32 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.
- 33 **MS BASIRE:** -- that that was a policy and we have government agencies that required, for
34 example, your school to -- and early childhood centres, to have Police vetting of people in

1 charge of children and vulnerable adults, and if no offending has ever been taken to the
2 Police, would you agree that there was no way of the State to know who or who is not an
3 appropriate adult to be in charge of children at Gloriavale?

4 **MR TEMPLE:** Not at this time, no, we would not believe that at all. I've taken -- I took a man to
5 the Police myself.

6 **MS BASIRE:** If we just go back, what I'm saying is that up until when you changed your policy
7 of going to the Police about abuse, would you agree that having the policy in place meant
8 that when government agencies were requiring, for example, Police vets, if abuse had never
9 been taken to the Police, then that process of checking somebody's character was
10 prevented?

11 **MR TEMPLE:** I'm just -- I have to think here for a minute, if you'll forgive me. I'm trying to
12 think about when Police vetting came in. Would you tell me what year that came in, can
13 anybody, what year did the Police vetting come in?

14 **CHAIR:** Mr Temple, this is Coral Shaw here. Just to make it a little bit easier for you, I think the
15 suggestion is being made to you that for the length of time that existed in the community
16 when people did not have any offences revealed to the Police or other agencies, they could
17 remain working there as teachers, or whatever, without anybody knowing, without any
18 authority knowing. Do you agree with that?

19 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, they could, that could have happened, could have been, yes.

20 **CHAIR:** And just to clarify, when did you remove these provisions that stopped people being
21 reported? Was it in 2022?

22 **MR TEMPLE:** No, it was earlier than that. Thinking back, we had a meeting and we had a
23 discussion there over -- about this verse of scripture and reporting to the Police, we had a
24 discussion about it, we said if a person -- this is the gist of it -- if a person committed a
25 crime, it would pertain mainly to abuse I would think, committed a crime but then we -- it
26 was not acceptable to the community, he was going to be put out, we would ask him to go
27 to the Police, report yourself to the Police, give him the opportunity first, but if he would
28 not report it to the Police then we would report it.

29 **CHAIR:** Yes, I get that. But just one more question on that. Does that mean that it was up to the
30 community to decide what should be reported to the Police?

31 **MR TEMPLE:** At that time it was, yes.

32 **CHAIR:** Thank you very much. I'll let Ms Basire carry on.

33 **MS BASIRE:** Thank you, Madam Chair.

1 I'll just move on because we do have some questions, probably this afternoon, about
2 the 2017 policy, so it looks like your policy changed in about 2017.

3 But I just want to look at some other doctrinal beliefs that were in the 1989 version.
4 And this relates to a person in Gloriavale's contact with their family outside Gloriavale:

5 "I forsake any family members or relatives or friends or any persons who would in
6 any way influence me contrary to the commands of Christ and his apostles and contrary to
7 the way of life of the church at Springbank."

8 So would you agree that there was a policy that a person who is in your community
9 has to forsake any of their family or friends or relatives who might say anything against the
10 teachings of your community?

11 **MR TEMPLE:** It would not be an immediate -- there would be talking and discussion and
12 encouragement, but after that, if they refused to receive the teachings of the church, or to
13 continue on with something that was contrary to what the Bible says to do, well then, they
14 would cease to be a member of the church. Seeing family members, there's verses of
15 scripture, one I will quote if I may, "If any person walks not after the traditions that you
16 have received of us then withdraw yourself from that person."

17 Another scripture, "If anyone teaches contrary to the teachings of the church, will
18 then reject that person." Another one, "A heretic, after the first and second admonition, to
19 reject that person."

20 **MS BASIRE:** So I take it that your doctrine was that you -- everybody in the community was
21 required to reject family, friends, relatives who did not follow your way of life?

22 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, I would have to say that, yes, because our way of life was to do what the
23 Bible says to do, keep the commandments of God.

24 **MS BASIRE:** Okay. Because in What We Believe it went on to say:

25 "I will always accept and abide by the standards and judgments of this church in all
26 things. If any person is put out of the church, be he or she even a member of my own
27 family, I will keep no company with that person nor eat with him."

28 **Now, do you agree that this doctrine has ensured that community members are**
29 **effectively forbidden from contact with their wider family outside Gloriavale and**
30 **were encouraged not to reach out to those people?**

31 **MR TEMPLE:** That was at that time. There is a difference now. There's a difference now, if
32 someone that has been put out of the church, if they want to meet their family, members of
33 their family, well, then, that decision is left up to the family themselves.

1 **MS BASIRE:** Right. We'll talk about what's happening now a bit later, but you'd agree that you
2 had a community first of all that was not allowed to report any crimes happening in the
3 community, and was effectively told that they weren't to contact people, even family
4 members, outside the community; that's right?

5 **MR TEMPLE:** That's right, yes.

6 **MS BASIRE:** Now, another doctrine was the Doctrine of Unity, which you still have, and it's an
7 important doctrine to the church, and I'll just read out what the 1989 version said:

8 "All true Christians should seek in every area of their lives to think and speak and
9 act in perfect unity with every other Christian. This applies very especially to all the
10 Christians within each local church. This applies to all the practical issues of life as well as
11 to the beliefs and doctrines."

12 Now, I understand from that that the goal of everybody in your community is to be
13 in perfect unity with each other?

14 **MR TEMPLE:** That is correct.

15 **MS BASIRE:** And doesn't the Doctrine of Unity make it very difficult to raise concerns because
16 if you're in conflict with a person you're not in unity with a person?

17 **MR TEMPLE:** That is correct.

18 **MS BASIRE:** I just want to talk to you about submission. And this is a doctrine you've
19 acknowledged may have been a part of the culture that allowed abuse to happen in your
20 community. So submission was:

21 "Not only should Christians willingly submit themselves to their leaders, but those
22 who are younger should willingly submit unto those who are older. This applies to every
23 area of life and every Christian in the church."

24 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, correct.

25 **MS BASIRE:** Christians were required to keep the Christian order of the home in which husbands
26 love wives, wives obey husbands and children obey parents.

27 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, correct.

28 **MS BASIRE:** And:

29 "The women at all times should be in subjection to the men and if they show
30 outwardly, particularly when they pray, they must cover their head with a simple scarf. As
31 regarding the preaching of the word, the passing of judgment, the teaching of doctrine or
32 freely discussing, adding to or questioning what a brother has said, they are commanded to
33 keep silent in the church. If they have questions about such matters, they would ask their

1 husbands at home. If a leader of the church asks a question of a woman in the church, she
2 is free to answer him for doing so she confirms she's in subjection to him?"

3 So you have said that the doctrine of submission may have been misinterpreted by
4 children and young people in your community. Would you agree that your doctrine of
5 subjection of children to adults, women to men and men to leaders has created a belief
6 system where it was almost impossible for a child or young person to raise concerns?

7 **MR TEMPLE:** It was never meant to. It was never meant to, and I'm just trying to think of what
8 situation, of my knowledge of it happening or being taken to that degree, because I'm
9 speaking and I speak publicly, if anyone has a problem come and talk to me about it. I've
10 stated that publicly. And the Bible does say if there are women to keep silence in the
11 church and have any questions to ask their husbands at home, but -- I'm just trying to think
12 just how that is applied. I can't remember it being taught that way in the church, if I'm
13 understanding you correctly.

14 **MS BASIRE:** Well, I'm reading from your document. You do agree, though, and you've said this
15 in your written notice, that you now realise in the minds of a child that that would create a
16 power imbalance?

17 **MR TEMPLE:** Create a power imbalance? There is a power imbalance without anything
18 creating it between an adult and a young person. There is a power imbalance there
19 automatically without anything being said.

20 **MS BASIRE:** There is, isn't there? And if you live in a community where you know that your
21 mother's not even allowed to speak out in church, and that she should just dutifully ask her
22 husband at home, would you agree that the children of that community may not feel
23 comfortable with raising issues such as sexual abuse to leaders of that community?

24 **MR TEMPLE:** That could be possible, yes, that could be possible.

25 **MS BASIRE:** Thank you.

26 **MR TEMPLE:** Children in their thinking, it could happen. "My mother is not allowed to speak
27 in the church, so am I allowed to speak in the church?" They could interpret it that way
28 very much so.

29 **MS BASIRE:** One more belief from that 1989 document was about travel and this is on page 109
30 of the original document:

31 "No decision should be made about travel away from the church by any member of
32 the church without reference to the leaders and brethren of the church. No Christian should
33 travel away from the church for any purpose whatsoever, whether it be on some spiritual

1 commission, on a commercial business activity, or some private matter or for any other
2 reason unless he goes with the full approval and blessing of the leaders of the church."

3 So you and Mr Christian and Mr Courage set up this doctrine that gave almost total
4 control to the leaders over the community to the extent that you had to ask to leave the
5 community? Would you agree?

6 **MR TEMPLE:** I'm trying to think of the context in which that was written. Yeah, I can agree
7 with that at that time, yes, that was written there.

8 **MS BASIRE:** Because that doesn't seem to be based on anything in the Bible, does it?

9 **MR TEMPLE:** Only submitting yourself one to another in the fear of God.

10 **MS BASIRE:** I can't imagine, and maybe you can help me, any reason why a person in your
11 community would have to have the full approval or blessing to physically leave the place
12 that they were living?

13 **MR TEMPLE:** Our interpretation of that one is why, what is the problem with talking about what
14 you are doing? Is there a reason why you don't want the leadership to know what you were
15 doing or where you were going? And being open, open before our brethren, sharing,
16 communicating with one another.

17 **MS BASIRE:** Well, the policy doesn't say if you leave -- and this was written in the times of
18 Springbank -- if you leave the Springbank premises it would be good to write a note so we
19 know where you are. The policy says that no travel from any member of the church may
20 happen, whether it's on spiritual, commercial or private or any reason without the full
21 approval and blessing of the leaders of the church. So it's not about communication, is it,
22 about where you are; it's about control, isn't it?

23 **MR TEMPLE:** Okay, yes, from what is written there, yes. It's not about full control though, it's
24 about communication. What is your aim? Why were you going?

25 **MS BASIRE:** Now, this is only -- sorry, I'll let you finish.

26 **MR TEMPLE:** Sorry. It's just a matter of why you're going, and if you look at it this way, we're
27 members there together, we're a community of people, we're one big family. That is the
28 way we look at it, we're one big family. And what's going on in the church, in the
29 community there, is everybody's business, not just my business, but it's everybody's
30 business what I do, where I go.

31 **MS BASIRE:** Well, in a normal family -- sorry, carry on.

32 **MR TEMPLE:** What's being said and written there, what is the problem with somebody or
33 everybody, what is the problem with them knowing where I'm going and why I'm going
34 there? It was the spirit of the thing, a spirit of unity, of bringing people together, becoming

1 one body, becoming of one mind and one judgment, unity and so forth and so on, it was the
2 spirit of the thing.

3 **MS BASIRE:** Well, would you agree as it reads it shows a control and power structure from
4 leaders to the people?

5 **MR TEMPLE:** To a degree, yes, to a degree.

6 **MS BASIRE:** So this is a small snapshot of the 118 pages that I have highlighted. There's one
7 other that I want to highlight which is about leaders.

8 Now, I understand, and this is a quote:

9 "It's not God's plan that the leaders in the Christian church should be chosen or
10 elected by the people, but they should be called and chosen by the Lord Jesus Christ."

11 So I understand from that there's never been any elected leaders in your Christian
12 church?

13 **MR TEMPLE:** That's correct, yes.

14 **MS BASIRE:** And Hopeful Christian effectively appointed himself as the leader chosen by the
15 Lord?

16 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.

17 **MS BASIRE:** And in the document he wrote, and this is about leaders, this is on page 51, he said:

18 "A leader in the church of Jesus Christ, whether he be a bishop, a pastor or teacher
19 in a local church, or a prophet or an apostle must be blameless as the steward of God."

20 And it goes on to say:

21 "The principal leader must give account to God for the state of every soul in the
22 church and for all the affairs of the church. He must be given authority by everyone he
23 oversees in every aspect of life and he may make any decision on his own and involve as
24 few or as many people as he chooses in making his decision."

25 So effectively the leader is chosen by God, they're answerable to God, and
26 everybody in the community must give that person the authority because he's been given
27 the responsibility of looking after everybody on behalf of God. Have I sort of summarised
28 that properly?

29 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, I think so, yes.

30 **MS BASIRE:** So there's this community that has been set up by Mr Christian, he's set himself up
31 as the leader?

32 **MR TEMPLE:** Sorry.

33 **MS BASIRE:** So he sets up the community and he sets himself up as leader; is that correct?

34 **MR TEMPLE:** He was invited to take the leadership of that church.

1 **MS BASIRE:** So there was a type of election?

2 **MR TEMPLE:** I suppose you could put it that way. He was invited to take the leadership of that
3 church, yes.

4 **MS BASIRE:** And then -- but after that point he wrote a document that said that what we believe
5 is that leaders aren't elected and then from then on there's never been any elected leaders,
6 have there?

7 **MR TEMPLE:** That's correct, yes.

8 **MS BASIRE:** So would you agree that the doctrine that Hopeful Christian wrote and you fully
9 took on board set the scene for the sexual abuse and physical abuse that has happened in
10 your community that we're about to talk about?

11 **MR TEMPLE:** No, I don't believe that.

12 **MS BASIRE:** You do not accept that by having a policy which prevented people reporting
13 matters to the Police, that that policy didn't in any way impact the level of abuse that's
14 happened in Gloriavale?

15 **MR TEMPLE:** I don't think that one did, I've misunderstood you what you meant; you asked me
16 about the preventing people, opened the door, or whatever the exact words you said,
17 opened it up for abuse happening, we're talking about the election of leaders, and I can't
18 connect the two.

19 **MS BASIRE:** Right, but I was just, and perhaps I need to be a bit clearer, there's a group of
20 doctrines that I've highlighted. One, it is the first one we talked about, is never take anyone
21 to the law?

22 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.

23 **MS BASIRE:** The second one is the doctrine of not communicating with family members or
24 friends outside the Christian church?

25 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, yes, correct.

26 **MS BASIRE:** The third one is the doctrine of unity where all Christians need to speak together?

27 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.

28 **MS BASIRE:** And then the fourth one was the lack of -- the having to ask for permission to go
29 away from the church?

30 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.

31 **MS BASIRE:** And then the fifth one was fact that the leaders from the time of Hopeful Christian
32 have never been elected.

33 So when you look at those doctrines together, do you agree that the effect of those
34 doctrines allowed abuse to occur and continue at Gloriavale?

- 1 **MR TEMPLE:** No, no, I don't believe that, I don't believe that, I'm looking at our whole way of
2 life and I don't think that it's the cause of it.
- 3 **MS BASIRE:** So you don't believe that your doctrines were the cause of the abuse?
- 4 **MR TEMPLE:** No, I don't. I don't -- a way of life more so than doctrine would have helped that
5 one.
- 6 **MS BASIRE:** Just on that policy about not going to the Police, what age were you when you first
7 joined Gloriavale? You must have been, what, 40, something like that?
- 8 **MR TEMPLE:** Only 30.
- 9 **MS BASIRE:** 30?
- 10 **MR TEMPLE:** 30 years old, yes.
- 11 **MS BASIRE:** But you had had experience of life outside the Christian community church, hadn't
12 you?
- 13 **MR TEMPLE:** I had, I'm sorry, could you repeat that, I'm sorry?
- 14 **MS BASIRE:** You had experience of life outside the church?
- 15 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, that's correct.
- 16 **MS BASIRE:** Why didn't you question this doctrine of not taking people to the authorities?
- 17 **MR TEMPLE:** Because of verses, scriptures there in the Bible, and I took that as not taking a
18 brother, not taking a brother to the authorities, and I just took it the way it read. Why do
19 you take a brother to the authorities? Why don't you allow him to be judged among the
20 brethren of the church? And that's where we were doing things at that time. We were
21 making judgments and decisions in the church, a group of people, a group of men sitting
22 and making those judgments.
- 23 **MS BASIRE:** Right. So it was a group of men making judgments --
- 24 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.
- 25 **MS BASIRE:** -- about other people's behaviour in the church?
- 26 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, that's correct. According to the Bible.
- 27 **MS BASIRE:** According to the Bible. Now, I understand that when matters of abuse were raised,
28 you and this other group of men, including Mr Christian, would seek for the offender to
29 repent?
- 30 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, that's correct.
- 31 **MS BASIRE:** And the victim to forgive?
- 32 **MR TEMPLE:** That's correct, yes.
- 33 **MS BASIRE:** I understand that for victims, that meant they had to appear in a room in front of
34 perhaps five leaders and be told to forgive their offender?

1 **MR TEMPLE:** I'm trying to think of an example of that. I remember -- I remember in one case
2 the congregation was the people, I'm trying to think, was it -- I'm sorry, my memory, I'm
3 trying to remember this, whether it was the whole congregation or just the adults, married
4 people. But anyway that group and they were just asked if they could forgive this person
5 for what he had done.

6 **MS BASIRE:** So it's possibly in front of the whole congregation?

7 **MR TEMPLE:** Possibly, yes, possibly yes.

8 **MS BASIRE:** Looking back, can you understand what impact that that may have had on a victim?

9 **MR TEMPLE:** I do now, yes, I do. I've learned a little bit since that time.

10 **MS BASIRE:** And then the offender, was he made to repent in front of the congregation?

11 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, he stood up and spoke himself before the congregation.

12 **MS BASIRE:** And then what would happen to him?

13 **MR TEMPLE:** He was put aside outside of the community.

14 **MS BASIRE:** I understand that that would be for a short period only?

15 **MR TEMPLE:** I think it was twice he was put outside the community. The second time, he's still
16 outside of the community. This particular instance I think might have been the second
17 time.

18 **MS BASIRE:** And that particular instance, was that sexual abuse that we're talking about?

19 **MR TEMPLE:** It was presumed, you could presume it to be sexual abuse, there was nothing
20 actually happened, he says he never touched the girl, she said that he did. But it was in the
21 building, it was not a place that person would have (inaudible) -- well, I suppose you could
22 call it sexual abuse. He said his intentions were wrong but nothing ever happened. And
23 under the circumstances I could agree with him nothing happened in that situation
24 physically.

25 **MS BASIRE:** Right. So, concentrating on that example, that's an example where you and the
26 other leaders decided, sort of investigated yourself and figured out what you thought might
27 have happened or not happened, rather than go to the Police?

28 **MR TEMPLE:** That's correct, yes.

29 **MS BASIRE:** And then you required the victim to forgive him and he was required to repent and
30 he was stood aside for a short time?

31 **MR TEMPLE:** That was expected, yes.

32 **MS BASIRE:** And only when the second time he was put out again, and he hasn't come back; is
33 that right?

1 **MR TEMPLE:** That's right. The Police came in on that one, the Police come in on that one and
2 they put a safety plan on him and that safety plan is still on him, that he's not to come back
3 to the community.

4 **MS BASIRE:** In your response to Notice to Produce which was dated 4 July, for everyone's
5 reference this is document ended 144, at paragraph 5 in that response you've said, and I
6 believe your counsel repeated it in his opening:

7 "Until the mid-1990s Hopeful Christian dealt with complaints and confessions of
8 sexual abuse or physical abuse. He kept this information to himself and it died with him
9 when he passed away in 2018. When the large leadership team was set up in 1990s, a few
10 other men were included in this discussion about how to handle these issues, but no written
11 records were ever kept. The greatest limitation to the extent of the knowledge was the
12 reluctance of victims to speak up."

13 Just before we go to the lunch break, you would agree that you were part of that
14 large leadership team?

15 **MR TEMPLE:** I would have been, yes.

16 **MS BASIRE:** And in fact, you were one of three leaders from 1985, weren't you?

17 **MR TEMPLE:** That's correct, yes.

18 **MS BASIRE:** And isn't it true that Hopeful Christian would have told you about complaints and
19 confessions of sexual and physical abuse in that time before he was convicted?

20 **MR TEMPLE:** Not particularly, not particularly, no. Because he, back at that time he dealt with
21 a lot of issues just on his own.

22 **MS BASIRE:** You would have been aware at least that he was dealing with them on his own; is
23 that correct?

24 **MR TEMPLE:** Not particularly, no. He could know of something that I knew nothing about.

25 **MS BASIRE:** So how do you know that up until the mid-90s he dealt with them himself? If there
26 was no written records kept and he never told you, how do you know that information?

27 **MR TEMPLE:** I don't know that he did, I know that he would have, if it arose he would have, or
28 he would have or he could have done it without my knowledge, that's what I'm saying. I
29 don't know that he did, but I just know that it's the way things worked because
30 I knew -- I know of him dealing with other things without including me, things that could
31 be discussed, could be discussed among the congregation.

32 **MS BASIRE:** After the break we're going to talk about the extent of sexual and physical abuse
33 that have happened in your community. But Mr Temple, you must have been aware that
34 things were happening in your community before Mr Christian got sent to prison?

1 **MR TEMPLE:** Sexual abuse, I can't remember, I can't remember anything, any sexual abuse
2 happening at that time. I can't say it didn't happen, because doing this sort of thing, they
3 don't do it in public, but I don't remember knowing of anything happening.

4 **MS BASIRE:** What about physical abuse?

5 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, physical abuse, yes.

6 **MS BASIRE:** So you knew about physical abuse?

7 **MR TEMPLE:** This was more talk -- more people knew about it, like with sexual abuse, it can be
8 kept pretty well quiet, it could happen only between the two people and neither one of them
9 broadcast it out, that's quite possible, but other things like physical abuse, yes, if somebody
10 do it in front of somebody, or give a child a hiding or something like that, it would be done
11 out in the open.

12 **MS BASIRE:** We're going to talk about that after the break, but you've said the greatest limitation
13 to the extent of the knowledge was the reluctance of victims to speak up. Would you agree
14 that that is actually victim blaming?

15 **MR TEMPLE:** It could be interpreted that way, yes, because the victim hasn't spoken up, that
16 could be interpreted that way, but not particularly meant that way. If the victim had spoken
17 up -- I'm sorry, carry on.

18 **MS BASIRE:** I'm sorry, I cut across you. You finish.

19 **MR TEMPLE:** The victim could not have spoken up and out of fear or some reason like that,
20 I wouldn't blame her for not speaking up.

21 **MS BASIRE:** Wasn't the greatest limitation to the extent of knowledge the behaviour of the
22 leadership by not reporting matters to the Police and involving authorities right from the
23 start?

24 **MR TEMPLE:** I think you're correct, that would have prevented a lot of it happening, because
25 when the Police got a hold of it -- now, we were more casual in our investigation -- but the
26 Police came in and they got right into it and dug right down to the roots of the thing and
27 discovered things that we would never have imagined, never thought had been happening.

28 **MS BASIRE:** Well, with respect, Hopeful Christian was investigated for sexual offending in
29 1993, he went to trial twice in 1995, was in prison for four years for sexual offending and
30 you continued to have a policy of not reporting matters to the Police?

31 **MR TEMPLE:** I'm trying to -- yes, yes, that policy would have still been in force at that time, I'm
32 trying to think, because we had a discussion that would have been after that, yes. That's
33 correct.

1 **MS BASIRE:** I think now is a good time to take the break. We'll take a break, Madam Chair,
2 until 2 o'clock?

3 **CHAIR:** Yes, thank you, everybody. Thank you, Mr Temple and Ms Stedfast, we will take a
4 break now and if you could be available again at 2 o'clock. Thank you.

5 **MR TEMPLE:** Thank you.

6 **Lunch adjournment from 1.04 pm to 2.03 pm**

7 **CHAIR:** Nau mai hoki mai ki a koutou katoa. Thank you for returning, and thank you to you,
8 Mr Temple and Ms Stedfast, for being available this afternoon.
9 Ms Basire.

10 **QUESTIONING BY MS BASIRE CONTINUED:** Thank you, Madam Chair.

11 Mr Temple, these next questions are around the sexual and physical abuse that has
12 happened in Gloriavale during the time that both you and Mr Christian were leaders.

13 First of all, I want to talk about the Police Operation Minneapolis.

14 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.

15 **MS BASIRE:** Now, I understand that was prompted by an incident that happened in 2020; is that
16 right?

17 **MR TEMPLE:** That's correct, yes.

18 **MS BASIRE:** And the Police investigated and you, as leader, cooperated with their investigation,
19 didn't you?

20 **MR TEMPLE:** That's correct, yes.

21 **MS BASIRE:** You gave us a document that was a briefing paper between the Police and a
22 meeting of the leaders in August 2020, and I'm just going to summarise some of that for
23 those who are listening.

24 The Police advised that 61 young people were identified as involved in what they
25 called harmful sexual behaviour, either as offenders, peers or victims. 20%, approximately,
26 of those 61 young people had been involved with one other person, 75% had been involved
27 with two to four other people, and the remaining 20% had been involved with five or more
28 young people; and what the Police said was the top tier of identified offenders had very
29 large numbers of victims, for example the most serious having 27 victims.

30 They noted that many offenders began as victims to older boys and they noted that
31 there was a spate of offending in 2015 and then there'd been another peak in 2020 during
32 the lockdown period.

33 Is that a fairly accurate description of what you recall?

1 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, yes, the one in 2015, I can't particularly recall that one, but I don't deny that
2 at all, I don't deny that at all.

3 **MS BASIRE:** The Police in that document went on to say under the heading "Intergenerational":
4 "The Police have identified that the offending is a practice that has not begun with
5 this generation. There is evidence of it occurring at least at the level of indecent acts and
6 oral sex in the mid-20s generation and older males in their 30s. During the course of this
7 investigation it has become clear that a number of parents, both male and female, who are
8 trying to support their own children are victims of sexual offending. This is impacting on
9 their own ability to support the children and causing stress to those parents.

10 Do you accept there has been intergenerational sexual abuse in your community?

11 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, I accept that on the Police's report, I do.

12 **MS BASIRE:** We received a number of witness statements for our hearing. One of those witness
13 statements was a lawyer, Louise Taylor, who'd interviewed 20 former members of the
14 community and what she said, and this is paragraph 5.3.3 of her statement:

15 "Most girls and women reported to me that they had been sexually abused in the
16 community and they knew of others that had been sexually abused. Some said that they'd
17 been abused by multiple men and others by the same man on multiple occasions over a
18 period of time."

19 She goes on to say:

20 "Most of the men said that they knew of women who had been sexually abused in
21 the community and a few stated they had been sexually abused themselves and were aware
22 of men sexually abusing boys in the community."

23 Louise Taylor said she did not speak to anyone who said that he or she was not
24 aware of sexual abuse in the community.

25 So do you accept that the statements of the survivors who, in the most part, are
26 leavers of Gloriavale, is consistent with the Police investigation in 2020 into your own
27 community?

28 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, I can accept it. Details, the Police didn't convey to me, because they operate
29 under a confidential clause and they couldn't pass too much on to me, but going through
30 what bit did I do, or I did get hold of, that report that you're reading from there, as well, it
31 had been going on for quite a period of time.

32 **MS BASIRE:** Yes, and I do understand that neither you nor I have the details. The point I was
33 making was whether you accepted Operation Minneapolis was an investigation into people
34 currently living in Gloriavale and --

1 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.

2 **MS BASIRE:** -- the survivor statements we took were from people who have left Gloriavale, and
3 there seems to be a consistent theme between what the Police found and what our survivors
4 are telling us. Would you agree?

5 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, I agree. I cannot deny any accusations there because I know and I accept
6 from their report that it was quite an ongoing thing going back for a period of time.

7 I accept what you're saying there at the present time, yes.

8 **MS BASIRE:** Thank you. The survivors who have spoken to the Commission talk about a
9 sexualised culture both in Springbank and Gloriavale which was brought about by Hopeful
10 Christian. Do you accept that there was a sexualised culture amongst your community?

11 **MR TEMPLE:** I'm not sure just what -- how broad a sexualised culture, just what all of that
12 covers, I'm not sure what -- gay sex, as well as sex, talk of sex, yes, had been carried on
13 from the beginning to one degree or the other, teachings on sex, discussions on sex and so
14 forth and so on. The culture, I don't know of the any actual acts going back that far, I don't
15 know of them. I can't say they never happened, I can only say I don't know of them.

16 **MS BASIRE:** I'll break it down for you because that was a really broad question, I accept.

17 So survivors have told us at meal times, and I'll just stop there, up until very
18 recently all meals were communal; is that right?

19 **MR TEMPLE:** Up until recent times, yes, they were.

20 **MS BASIRE:** So survivors have told us:

21 "At meals where members weren't allowed to speak, I was told that Hopeful and
22 other leaders would often take the microphone and talk about their own sexual exploits and
23 this was seen as a way of honouring their wives."

24 Do you recall that happening in your community?

25 **MR TEMPLE:** Honestly I don't, but that doesn't mean it didn't happen either, so you're going on
26 my memory and it's not excellent at the present time. Anyway, I can't say it didn't happen,
27 I can only say I don't remember it happening. And I'm being honest with you.

28 **MS BASIRE:** Yes. The survivors go on to say:

29 "Hopeful would take this opportunity to remind members that men had a higher
30 sexual drive than women so it was up to women to prevent sexual assaults. They were to
31 do this by controlling their -- meaning the women's -- behaviour, their location and their
32 presentation in order to prevent sexual reactions from men and boys."

33 Do you recall that?

34 **MR TEMPLE:** I recall that type -- that kind of talk being -- going on, yes, I recall that.

1 **MS BASIRE:** Yes.

2 **MR TEMPLE:** Because that was carried on, not going back too far, beyond my memory.

3 **MS BASIRE:** So you recall, for example, girls being told that they should run in such a way that
4 their skirts didn't flick up?

5 **MR TEMPLE:** Not particularly that, but it could have been said, maybe not even in my presence,
6 but still have been said, and other things that convey that girls, if you did this or if did you
7 that, or don't do this or don't do that. Because that was -- that was spoken of, yes.

8 **MS BASIRE:** And that is one of the reasons why the women at Gloriavale wear the iconic blue
9 dress that goes down to their ankles, is that right, to cover their body?

10 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, yes, the Bible speaks of modest, dress with modesty, and going back -- and
11 that was considered a modest way to dress going back quite a period of time, and it was a
12 hangover, or however you put it, a result of the dress in those days with the mini skirt being
13 a very short skirt, a result of -- and that mode of dress is what brought about our going to
14 modest apparel, that was discussed for quite a long time and in more than one discussion:
15 What is modesty? And we come to a conclusion, well, okay, if we go down to ankle length
16 anyway, we can't say it's not modest, could we.

17 And along --

18 **MS BASIRE:** So you're saying -- sorry.

19 **MR TEMPLE:** Along with that, the same applied to men, men would not wear short trousers and
20 they would keep their shirts down and buttoned up.

21 **MS BASIRE:** So you're saying that the culture that you were living in in the 1960s where women
22 were wearing miniskirts prompted this discussion about what the Bible meant about
23 modesty?

24 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, yes, that would be the Bible speaking, definitely that the women would be in
25 modest apparel --

26 **MS BASIRE:** Do you --

27 **MR TEMPLE:** I'm sorry.

28 **MS BASIRE:** No, it's okay. Do you accept that women bore the responsibility to prevent being a
29 victim by being fully covered?

30 **MR TEMPLE:** I don't think that the women have to bear all responsibility for it at all, definitely
31 not.

32 **MS BASIRE:** Do you accept that for those young women in particular they may have felt, due to
33 this belief about modesty, that it was their fault if they were sexually assaulted?

1 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, that could be conveyed but not just because of the modesty, but other things.
2 There's actions that a girl could take, that action could attract the attention of a boy. Now,
3 that type of teaching was done. And it was brought forth that a girl should be careful how
4 she handled herself.

5 **MS BASIRE:** Right. Just going back to Hopeful Christian, we've also been told by a number of
6 people that Mr Christian didn't confine himself to speaking about sexual practices in the
7 community, he also involved himself in members' lives on a far more personal level. We
8 have been told that he required to be present in the room when married couples first
9 consummated their marriage; is that correct?

10 **MR TEMPLE:** I don't know, I don't know of that one at all, I don't know, honestly, I don't know
11 of that, if that happened. And of course I wasn't in the room myself so what happened
12 there, honestly, I'm sorry I can't say one way or the other. All I can say is I never saw it.

13 **MS BASIRE:** Did you hear people talking about it in your community?

14 **MR TEMPLE:** No, not to that extent, not of that actually happening.

15 **MS BASIRE:** Well, we're told that not only was he in the room when young couples
16 consummated their marriage, if he couldn't make it, he would ask them to videotape
17 themselves so he could review it later. Had you heard of that practice?

18 **MR TEMPLE:** I heard of the practice of videoing it themselves, but it was conveyed in a
19 personal manner, that it was between husband and the wife. Now, about him reviewing it
20 later on, I never heard anything like that.

21 **MS BASIRE:** We know in 1993 the Police started investigating Hopeful Christian for sexual
22 offending against a number of complainants. You would recall that?

23 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, I do.

24 **MS BASIRE:** This coincided with the community's move to Haupiri on the West Coast. Looking
25 back, was there any link between the move of the community and the Police investigating
26 him?

27 **MR TEMPLE:** I don't know of any, I don't know of any.

28 **MS BASIRE:** He was tried in 1995 against a number of complainants, found guilty, successfully
29 appealed to the Court of Appeal and on the retrial the Crown decided to go ahead with only
30 one of the victims. He was found guilty and sentenced to four years imprisonment. I
31 understand that he served approximately 11 months in prison; is that correct?

32 **MR TEMPLE:** Approximately, I can't give you an exact length of time now. It wasn't the four
33 years anyway.

1 **MS BASIRE:** Who was the leader of the community when he was in prison; was it you,
2 Mr Temple?

3 **MR TEMPLE:** It was David Courage.

4 **MS BASIRE:** Right. I just want to read out what one of the witnesses, and this is witness number
5 2 in her supplementary statement, what she says about that time:

6 "The Gloriavale community were never told about the true nature of Hopeful's
7 convictions. Right from the start when the court case was still happening they began
8 feeding us lies. The leaders told us that Hopeful was being persecuted for his faith, that the
9 outside world didn't like him because he was a Christian preacher and that's why they were
10 putting him in jail. It wasn't just one or two people saying this, it was all the leaders,
11 Howard Temple, Fervent Stedfast and Faithful Pilgrim. They even included it in preaching
12 on Sundays. We were always warned not to believe any stories we heard about why
13 Hopeful was in jail because they were all lies. They were conditioning the community not
14 to believe it even if they did hear something. People in the community still believe this.

15 As a child I remember visiting hopeful in prison. I was about 9 or 10 years old.
16 Every Sunday one or two families would be taken to visit him. Eventually as an adult
17 I started asking questions. My husband asked to speak to Hopeful Christian about
18 questions we had, including whether it was true he went to jail for sexual offences.
19 Hopeful said nothing much and that night they made my husband leave Gloriavale."

20 I just want to ask you some questions about that statement. What was the
21 community told about Hopeful Christian's trials and his imprisonment?

22 **MR TEMPLE:** I'm just trying to -- going back on my memory. I mean, I know using my
23 memory can be a good excuse for not answering the question, isn't it? It could be, but it's
24 not an excuse, it's not a reason, it's not my reason. Honestly, I'm a bit weak in my memory
25 now, it could be to do with my age, but I remember very little being said about it, very little
26 being said -- in the statement that you just made, excuse me. But I don't remember
27 anybody being put out because of that. I think I would remember that because that would
28 be a case of the person being brought before a meeting and the issue being discussed, that
29 was our normal procedure. Before anybody was put out, we'd go through quite a process of
30 talking with them and many times it would be giving them a warning and then -- there was
31 quite a process, it wasn't, "Oh, you did this so out you go." It wasn't that simple and
32 straightforward. In any (inaudible) that I was ever involved in, in anything I can remember,
33 it wasn't that short and straightforward.

1 **MS BASIRE:** Mr Temple, if we had more time I could give you some more detail around that that
2 would prompt your memory, because as I understand, you did have some involvement in
3 that case. I think the more important point that I want to talk about is --

4 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.

5 **MS BASIRE:** -- what did you tell people in your community as to why Hopeful Christian was in
6 prison? Did you tell your community that he had been convicted for sexually offending
7 against a Gloriavale young woman in 1984?

8 **MR TEMPLE:** Not to those details, but I don't doubt, and I would most certainly want to believe
9 and believe that I would have told them the truth, that he was convicted on sexual abuse.

10 **MS BASIRE:** Is it possible that you --

11 **MR TEMPLE:** Now, what and who -- I'm sorry, carry on.

12 **MS BASIRE:** Is it possible that you did tell the community at the time that he was being
13 persecuted for his religious beliefs?

14 **MR TEMPLE:** It would be very unlikely, very unlikely, because I don't think that way.

15 I wouldn't think that way. I know it comes out, even today, somebody will say all these
16 court cases is because of our beliefs, we're being persecuted, but I don't think that way. All
17 these court cases are because of actions, things that have happened in the community, that's
18 why we're going through these court cases and so forth, not because of a persecution
19 because of our beliefs, and I can't remember ever thinking that way, I don't know why I
20 would say that to a person.

21 **MS BASIRE:** Do you recall any of the other leaders telling the community that Hopeful Christian
22 was in prison because of his religious beliefs?

23 **MR TEMPLE:** I can't remember that one, hearing that type of thing said. Now, I don't doubt that
24 it was said, I don't doubt it was because other people could think that way and they could
25 speak that way. I can't remember hearing it, but this is just going on my understanding of
26 people, and our people.

27 **MS BASIRE:** So you accept that that could have been said, that people in Gloriavale, both then
28 and now, may still -- may have believed and may still believe that he was in prison for
29 religious persecution, not for being a sex offender?

30 **MR TEMPLE:** I would think he could have been involved in both. It doesn't fit that he
31 would -- knowing that he was in prison because of sexual abuse and he's in prison because
32 of persecution, I don't see things that way, I don't see all the happenings today is because of
33 being persecuted because of our faith. I can't comment a lot on that one, I'm sorry.

- 1 **MS BASIRE:** Well, what we do know is that he served a third of his sentence and came back to
2 Gloriavale on parole. Do you remember that bit?
- 3 **MR TEMPLE:** I remember him coming back to Gloriavale, I don't remember on parole though. I
4 would stand corrected, if Rachel here could help me on it.
5 You were a young girl at that time, weren't you? I don't remember a parole.
- 6 **MS BASIRE:** Do you agree that he wasn't away from the community for four years, was he?
- 7 **MR TEMPLE:** No, he wasn't.
- 8 **MS BASIRE:** No, and so he was given a four-year sentence, so what that means is he would have
9 been on parole for the length of his sentence. You may not have understood that, but --
- 10 **MR TEMPLE:** That's possible. But there's a report on the case when he came up for parole, and
11 the parole officer was reported to have said he should have never been in prison and the
12 parole officer says, "You will go home today", and he was brought home that day.
- 13 **MS BASIRE:** So your memory is that a person from the Department of Corrections -- is that
14 something that was told to you? Do you remember the parole officer, or is that something
15 that's been told to you?
- 16 **MR TEMPLE:** I'm sorry, I don't remember anything, I've got a paper written by a person that was
17 there. Now, whether he told a bunch of lies or not, I don't think so, I don't have any reason
18 to believe that he would be lying about the matter.
- 19 **MS BASIRE:** Right. So this is of interest to the Commission, because one of the things that we're
20 interested in is how abuse in care happens and the intersection with State authorities. Now,
21 we don't have that document, but you would agree that there was no opposition from the
22 Department of Corrections letting a convicted sex offender go to an isolated rural
23 community and take over its leadership?
- 24 **MR TEMPLE:** I don't know of any opposition at all to it.
- 25 **MS BASIRE:** Was there any --
- 26 **MR TEMPLE:** I've got nothing written, I do have a report written about it from a person that was
27 there at the time of the parole. I wasn't there, but I've got confidence in what this person
28 wrote was what was said there in the room.
- 29 **MS BASIRE:** Was there any opposition from David Courage or yourself as leaders to Hopeful
30 Christian coming back and resuming his leadership of the community?
- 31 **MR TEMPLE:** No, there wasn't any opposition.
- 32 **MS BASIRE:** And you have already told us that that policy of not reporting abuse to outside
33 authorities continued until very recent times; isn't that right?
- 34 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.

1 **MS BASIRE:** Effectively until his death?

2 **MR TEMPLE:** I can't remember the date, it was well after that prison sentence anyway. It was
3 well after that.

4 **MS BASIRE:** I just want to turn to talk about physical abuse. We have received a number of
5 witness statements that talk about physical abuse, and before the break you said that you
6 were aware of physical abuse because it would often happen in public; is that correct?

7 **MR TEMPLE:** This goes back to smacking children.

8 **MS BASIRE:** Yeah. So I just want to talk to you about what some of our survivors have said
9 about smacking children.

10 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.

11 **MS BASIRE:** This comes initially from Louise Taylor's statement and she's summarising what
12 the 20 people she interviewed have said:

13 "Most survivors describe physical punishment as being the first choice of parents in
14 the community until fairly recently. One survivor stated every home in Gloriavale had an
15 instrument that would be used for beating children. We were beaten with whatever was
16 close at hand. The beatings could happen anywhere in private or in public. It was unusual
17 for a child at Gloriavale to go a week without a hiding."

18 Do you recall those years?

19 **MR TEMPLE:** No, I can recall children getting a hiding, that definitely happened. There was a
20 time come when that ceased to happen, but before that, yes, it was common for -- I mean,
21 I gave my own children a hiding. But going on back years ago, What We Believe was
22 written in '89, the anti-smacking bill came in after that one, but now there's other --

23 **MS BASIRE:** I'll just stop you there. What's your definition of giving a child a hiding?

24 **MR TEMPLE:** Well, when they've done something wrong, they were disobedient or whatever
25 the case might be, somebody might take a strap and give them a hiding with a strap, it
26 might be with their hand or, say, a switch or something like that.

27 **MS BASIRE:** All right. So with weapons?

28 **MR TEMPLE:** Weapons, yes.

29 **MS BASIRE:** We don't have time to go into it, but even before 2007 there was a limit to parental
30 discipline or corporal punishment. So you would agree with the survivors' statements that
31 the children would be beaten with a strap or a stick?

32 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, I would say it could happen. I'm trying to remember actually seeing it
33 happen, but it could have happened.

34 **MS BASIRE:** Louise Taylor's statement goes on with another example:

1 "They, the parents, would hit us with their hands or whatever they could reach,
2 including electrical cords, hairbrushes, knitting needles, and this always left bruises on my
3 bottom, legs and back."

4 Then that witness went on to say:

5 "For example, when I was 16 years old I was talking to a person..."

6 Whose name is deleted in the statement. Clearly her father didn't want her speaking
7 to this person who I assume was a young male:

8 "...my father took me to the bin of electrical cords and made me choose one. He
9 then whipped me with it until I fainted. I was bruised and swollen for months because of
10 this. After the beating, my father threatened to whip my younger brother if I was observed
11 talking to that person again."

12 Another survivor says:

13 "There was a normalisation of physical abuse in the community."

14 She said:

15 "As an example of how the process of normalisation occurs, I never considered my
16 father to be an abusive man, but there was an occasion when he entered the room of a
17 family whose baby was crying. He belted their eight- or nine-month-old baby very hard
18 about five times and the baby went straight to sleep, so my siblings and I internalised this as
19 an example of good parenting. Of course now I realise it was abusive."

20 So prior to the 2007 anti-smacking law, would you agree that this was widespread
21 in your community?

22 **MR TEMPLE:** No, I wouldn't agree that it was widespread, but I wouldn't disagree that it never
23 happened. I wouldn't say that at all, in the cases that you've read, and I read those in the
24 paper as well, but I don't know, that does sound like a -- a man going into somebody else's
25 room and smacking a child that young, that sounds so foreign and so unlikely, and how
26 could anybody do that? That's all I can say, because I haven't got cameras or anything in
27 every room in the hostels there. I don't see everything that goes on in every room. But it's
28 so foreign that somebody would do that to a child that young, and to somebody else's child.

29 I mean, we've had some people in there that have given children beatings,
30 unmerciful beatings, a number of them, many of them are not in the community anymore or
31 now. And I know I've been told about things after, in recent times, but going back, there
32 was a period of time when young men, children did get some terrible hidings.

33 It's totally unacceptable, that sort of thing was never condoned, was never condoned
34 in the community, by Hopeful Christian or me or any of the leadership.

1 **MS BASIRE:** Okay. Well, I'll just ask you some more about that, because Ms Taylor's statement
2 goes on to say:

3 "Several survivors spoke of Hopeful's hatred for the sound of babies crying. To
4 prevent this he taught parents to cover their babies' and children's mouths and noses with
5 their hand until the child was struggling to breathe when they cried. Several survivors said
6 they'd seen children turn blue while their parents were doing this."

7 Do you recall that occurring in the community?

8 **MR TEMPLE:** No, I didn't. I definitely don't.

9 **MS BASIRE:** Again, survivors have spoke of the role of leaders in encouraging physical abuse.
10 One survivor said:

11 "Put it this way, far from condemning this behaviour, the leaders of the community
12 condoned and encouraged this degree of violence and the discipline of children because
13 submissive wives and children were the sign of a well-managed family and a family of a
14 well-managed family could rise in the social hierarchy of Gloriavale."

15 **MR TEMPLE:** No, I would deny the last part of that statement, I would deny that.

16 **MS BASIRE:** Another survivor said:

17 "Far from being something that happened in private, one survivor spoke of a father
18 beating their children in an arranged public setting in the community. He said physical
19 punishment of children was sufficiently ingrained in the community that teenage boys were
20 sometimes beaten by their fathers on the stage in the hall while the entire community was
21 eating their meals."

22 Do you recall that, Mr Temple?

23 **MR TEMPLE:** It wouldn't have been when the entire community was there because I never saw
24 it.

25 **MS BASIRE:** You've told us that you did go to India for times.

26 **MR TEMPLE:** That's right.

27 **MS BASIRE:** Is it possible it happened while you were away from Gloriavale?

28 **MR TEMPLE:** That is possible, I can't deny that.

29 **MS BASIRE:** Survivors also talked about physical punishment being used in the schools and
30 perhaps Mrs Stedfast you can reply to this question.

31 "Prior to the anti-smacking legislation in 2007, the survivors have said that each of
32 the teachers had a number of bats in a filing cabinet that he or she could use to beat the
33 children. They were blue or yellow, larger than table tennis bats, made up of some rough
34 plastic about an inch thick. Depending on the offence we'd be hit on the bridge of the

1 knuckles, palm of the hand, bottom or thighs while bending down. This almost always left
2 marks and bruises but we got used to this as a way of life."

3 Do you recall when you were at school prior to 2007 the, witnessing or
4 experiencing punishment like that?

5 **MRS STEDFAST:** No, I never witnessed or experienced that.

6 **MS BASIRE:** Did you hear other people talking about that?

7 **MRS STEDFAST:** I've heard of it recently but I never heard of it when I was a teenager. When I
8 was very young, this was back in 1989, basically at the start of my school years, I heard of
9 it then, but -- then, yeah, I didn't hear of it for years until just recently.

10 **MS BASIRE:** You started teaching in the pre-school when you were about 19, is that right?

11 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yes, yes, I started full-time teaching when I was 19.

12 **MS BASIRE:** One of the survivors' statements says that after the anti-smacking legislation in
13 2007, so this is when you would have been teaching, that:

14 "If a child acted out during the day, the pre-school teacher would make the child
15 wait until the school day was finished. Possibly the child would be denied lunch, made to
16 sit under a desk during that time and then after school the teacher would call the child's
17 parents over. The parents would take the child into the bathroom in the school and beat
18 him or her for the offence. The parents knew they had to make the punishment sound bad
19 enough to satisfy the pre-school teacher because she listened outside the door and if she
20 was not satisfied with the severity of the beatings she would beat the child herself until she
21 was satisfied."

22 Do you deny that that sort of thing happened in the pre-school?

23 **MRS STEDFAST:** That never happened when I was there. I don't know about that instance or
24 the instances. I did shift over to another centre early in those years, so I was not at the
25 pre-school centre. I was down at the under 2s centre. But I didn't know of that happening,
26 sorry.

27 **MS BASIRE:** One other example was a child or a survivor who remembers as a child being put in
28 the middle of a stack of mattresses and the early childhood teacher sitting on top of the
29 mattress until the child felt they could not breathe. Have you ever seen or heard of that
30 practice?

31 **MRS STEDFAST:** I have never, ever seen it, I had never heard of it until this case when I read
32 the documents.

33 **MS BASIRE:** Mr Temple, you in your response to the Commission have said that now victims
34 are believed when they raise matters of abuse; is that correct.

1 **MR TEMPLE:** I'm sorry, the victims of -- what was that again, sorry?

2 **MS BASIRE:** There was a document, which I'm sure your lawyers helped you write, and in it said
3 that the policy now is that victims are believed. The exact sentence didn't say victims of
4 what, it just says, "We now believe all victims."

5 Is that your current policy?

6 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes. That is a current policy that we do listen to people and it's written up in our
7 Child Protection and Well-Being Policy, it's written into that one too, I believe it's that
8 policy it's written into, that we will always believe a child if a child comes to us with an
9 accusation, we will believe the child but then there will be an investigation into it.

10 **MS BASIRE:** Right. In 2017 you had a policy, this was just a few months before Mr Christian
11 had died, and that policy, I'm just flicking through my notes, in that policy it was still the
12 position that you would investigate and only if the offender repeated the offending would
13 you go to the Police. Can you recall that?

14 **MR TEMPLE:** Okay, thank you. "How the Trust deals with complaints of sexual assault within
15 the community."

16 **MS BASIRE:** Can you see that on the screen "How the Trust deals with complaints"?

17 **MR TEMPLE:** I can see that. Chris has given me a paper here, thank you.

18 This one, yes, this was brought to my attention recently, between paragraph 4 and 5,
19 bringing the children to repentance, the person to repentance, and then at paragraph 5, "if
20 the offender nevertheless continues to physically assault one or more people within the
21 community and will not cease to do so and does not (inaudible) and so forth, and breaks our
22 community declaration to keep the clause of the Crimes Act and thus continues to break the
23 law."

24 **CHAIR:** It sounds as though what Mr Temple has and what is on the screen, which the public, I'm
25 sorry, can't see, is slightly different.

26 **MS BASIRE:** No, it should be the same.

27 **MR TEMPLE:** We've got the same thing, I think.

28 **CHAIR:** You do? Okay, you're just paraphrasing then.

29 **MS BASIRE:** Yeah.

30 **MR TEMPLE:** You carry on with your question.

31 **MS BASIRE:** So, this was a 2017 document?

32 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.

1 **MS BASIRE:** So, my question is, you agree as recently as 2017 you still wanted to keep the issue
2 in-house unless the person effectively re-offended; is that correct? That's what paragraph 5
3 says.

4 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, yes. What paragraph 5 says, that would be true, that would be true in 2017,
5 yes.

6 **MS BASIRE:** So, what happened between 2017 and now that has changed your policy that you
7 will, at the first instance, report to Police?

8 **MR TEMPLE:** A number of things, we come to a bit more knowledge, and now since the Police
9 investigation it has opened our eyes completely and utterly as to what was happening in the
10 community as far as abuse goes, and what was happening between these boys. We saw that
11 our way and our investigation was not thorough enough and we were not, our way was not
12 sufficient to bring the thing to a stop.

13 So this here could go in the rubbish tin because now, no, the authorities will be
14 notified, we've got systems in place, procedures in place, any act that Oranga Tamariki will
15 hear about it first through the leads, all right, the leads will get a hold of it. If the leads
16 don't get a hold of it, anybody else can make a case known to the leads, the leads will pass
17 it on to Oranga Tamariki, Oranga Tamariki will either deal with it themselves if they feel
18 it's in their area; if not, they will pass it on to the Police.

19 So there's been a totally different attitude and way of thinking since that 2017.

20 **MS BASIRE:** Do you agree that the leadership, apart from Hopeful Christian dying in 2018,
21 hasn't changed?

22 **MR TEMPLE:** The leadership has changed, its whole attitude has changed, its way of seeing
23 things has changed.

24 **MS BASIRE:** But the people themselves, Mr Temple, have not changed, have they?

25 **MR TEMPLE:** The people --

26 **MS BASIRE:** The same people --

27 **MR TEMPLE:** Are you talking about the congregation or the leadership?

28 **MS BASIRE:** No. What I'm saying is the physical people who are leaders, there's been no change
29 in the leadership physically. For example, you haven't stood down, other leaders haven't
30 stood down, it's not like the leaders that people are supposed to report this abuse to are
31 different people; they're the same people, aren't they?

32 **MR TEMPLE:** The leads we're talking about they're supposed to report to?

33 **MS BASIRE:** Yeah.

34 **MR TEMPLE:** Or you're talking about leadership? I am sorry --

1 **MS BASIRE:** The leadership hasn't changed, has it? So yes, two questions: The leadership hasn't
2 changed, has it?

3 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, the leadership has changed since 2017, yes, it has.

4 **MS BASIRE:** Have the people changed?

5 **MR TEMPLE:** There's four of them that are not there any longer.

6 **MS BASIRE:** So there's four that have stood down?

7 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.

8 **MS BASIRE:** How many of the leadership are still there, that were there in 2017?

9 **MR TEMPLE:** It would be seven still there, am I right? Seven or nine. Five and four is nine.
10 There's nine still there.

11 **MS BASIRE:** Nine still there?

12 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.

13 **MS BASIRE:** I just want to talk to you about the internal change that you've said that you've
14 made and the other leaders who are still in place have made. In May this year you
15 issued -- before I go on to that, the document number that I was referring to, just for the
16 record, is GLO0000003.

17 Sorry, Mr Temple, that's just for our purposes.

18 Now, I just want to talk about GLO0000149. I understand this was a public
19 apology that you authored and was sent to the Greymouth Star. Do you recall that?

20 **MR TEMPLE:** Okay, okay, we did send an apology to the news media. We did send an apology
21 there.

22 **MS BASIRE:** You said:

23 "We are deeply saddened by the harm members of our community have
24 experienced. We apologise for our role in failing to prevent and protect victims of abuse.
25 We are seeking to reach out to those who are no longer in our community and encourage
26 them along with our current members to speak to us openly if they've experienced harm in
27 any way."

28 I just want to question you about the reaching out to people no longer in the
29 community. What have you actually done to reach out to those people?

30 **MR TEMPLE:** I'm just thinking, excuse me a minute, let me think. Some of them locally around
31 us, we have contacted. What we intend to do, I'm sorry, what we intend to do, and it should
32 have been done, I'm trying to think of why hasn't it been done yet, is to try and contact a lot
33 of them before we -- we intend to contact them and make a statement to them. Now that

1 hasn't been done as of yet, I'm trying to think of why. You probably think I'm making
2 promises but not keeping them. That's not the intention of it at all.

3 **MS BASIRE:** Well, it is interesting that you sent apologies to a newspaper in May and it's now
4 October.

5 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, right.

6 **MS BASIRE:** And in the first instance you haven't reached out to the community that you told the
7 public that you were going to reach out to?

8 **MR TEMPLE:** You're correct, you're correct.

9 **MS BASIRE:** You say in the press release:

10 "Gloriavale remains the only home that most of us who live here have ever known,
11 so any commercial boycott of Gloriavale's operations will have a significant impact on
12 hundreds of lives. Gloriavale also indirectly supports the livelihood of employees and
13 families of a great many service businesses throughout the West Coast region."

14 Do you accept that this press release seems more designed to avoid harm to your
15 businesses than genuinely apologising, reach out to the victims of abuse at Gloriavale?

16 **MR TEMPLE:** No, it was an honest apology. I stand by that. It was an honest apology to the
17 public.

18 **MS BASIRE:** Okay. So you're apologising to the public -- why apologise to the public?

19 **MR TEMPLE:** Because it involves the public. Gloriavale is known all over the whole of
20 New Zealand, and for the wrongdoing that has happened to it, so we make an apology to
21 the people, because it does concern people outside of the community and it does belong or
22 needs to be made to the entire public, because of all the publicity that Gloriavale has
23 received about these wrongdoings that's happened in the community. There are people
24 outside of the community that are concerned about it, people that know us, people that have
25 done business with us and the whole works.

26 So the apology needed to be made to them, but there's another apology that should
27 be sent out by now, I'll check up on that one, that should go to these individuals as far as
28 the ones that we know and we can contact anyway, and that will be done.

29 **MS BASIRE:** Well, with respect, Mr Temple, that apology was issued only in Greymouth, not to
30 the public of New Zealand. Greymouth is where you do business. Isn't that apology just --

31 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, but not -- no, we do business -- sorry, carry on, I'm sorry.

32 **MS BASIRE:** Wasn't that apology just designed to get the businesses that you have contracted
33 with back on side?

1 **MR TEMPLE:** Definitely not, definitely not, it was a sincere apology to the public and I haven't
2 collected a newspaper from different areas to see if it went into there, but I assumed it went
3 to other newspapers because it normally does. If we put something in one newspaper it will
4 end up in a number of them. I can apologise for a lack there. I should have checked up on
5 it to make sure it had gone out to other papers in other parts of the country, because it was
6 meant for other parts of the country and it was not just for our personal benefit, it was
7 because an apology has to be made.

8 **MS BASIRE:** You haven't given an apology to the victims, have you?

9 **MR TEMPLE:** Well, apparently not. I haven't checked up, but okay, but it will be. It will be.
10 I'm saying it to you and you can say it to the whole public if you want to. It will be done.

11 **MS BASIRE:** Well, you conclude the press release by asking the public for forgiveness and to
12 accept your open commitment and willingness to make significant changes. You say:

13 "We hope this letter provides assurance that we're doing everything in our power to
14 ensure the transgressions of the past are never repeated."

15 So are you doing everything in your power for the victims of Gloriavale? For
16 example, what compensation and redress package has been offered to the people who have
17 left Gloriavale and have suffered abuse at Gloriavale?

18 **MR TEMPLE:** There has been help given to people that have left Gloriavale. That's all I can say
19 at the present time. There has been help going out to people, leavers from Gloriavale.
20 They have made requests to us and we have helped them in that request. There is a limited
21 amount of money in Gloriavale, regardless of this \$40 million you hear of, that \$40 million
22 is tied up in a trust and we cannot touch it. We only have the money that we make from our
23 labours to work with, and now legal bills are gobbling that up like crazy, so we have very
24 little money in our hands to do anything with.

25 **MS BASIRE:** So, Mr Temple, I'll just stop you there. I acknowledge that the survivors have told
26 us that at times when they left they'd be given \$1,000 or maybe \$5,000, the highest I'd
27 heard was \$10,000. As they understand and as I understand, that is a small amount of
28 financial assistance because they are leaving behind all the fruits of their labour in
29 Gloriavale. There has never, from what I understand, been a redress and compensation
30 package for people who were sexually abused or physically abused or psychologically
31 abused in Gloriavale.

32 Would you agree that you have not set up a redress and compensation package for
33 victims of abuse?

1 **MR TEMPLE:** We have not up to the present time, we have talked about it, we have discussed it,
2 but we just don't have the means of doing it at the present time. We're only working
3 people. We work for a wage like everybody else working for, we work for a below
4 minimum wage, so we are limited, very much so now because of legal expenses that we're
5 suffering, which we have to comply with.

6 But our heart is to help people and we have helped people, even people that are
7 taking us to court now. We have helped them and in the meantime while we're being taken
8 to court, we're passing it on to them.

9 **MS BASIRE:** I just want to spend the last few minutes before the -- yeah, 3.15 is our break -- just
10 talking about that. Because in your written responses and in your counsel's opening
11 statement today, you've told us that you've put in policies and procedures that will mean
12 that children and vulnerable people are safe in Gloriavale now, and you said that "We have
13 changed".

14 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.

15 **MS BASIRE:** But there is a lot of people who do not believe that you've changed and I just want
16 to put one example to you which is a recent case this year.

17 Now, this is witness number 5. She says:

18 "Less well-documented but still very effective methods of control used by
19 community leaders, social shunning, public and private attacks on character, food
20 deprivation and harassing visits from leaders to members' rooms. A useful recent example
21 of this was -- and I won't name the leader -- a leader's frequent and lengthy visits to me as
22 he attempted to dissuade me from being a witness in the recent Employment Court
23 litigation. This person visited me three times over little more than a week for up to seven
24 hours in one time in his efforts to dissuade me from telling the truth. He chose times where
25 he knew that -- a certain named person -- wasn't around, to ensure I had no support, but he
26 did not count on my will to know -- to do what I know is right. During these one way
27 discussions he shamed myself and my family, accused me of fighting against the church
28 and told me my salvation was at risk due to my involvement in legal cases. The recency of
29 this example will hopefully show the Royal Commission how little has changed in the
30 community despite Gloriavale's public apology to the businesses that they connect to."

31 Are you aware of that leader's visits to that person?

32 **MR TEMPLE:** To GRO-A the name here; is that correct?

- 1 **MS BASIRE:** Yes, we're not naming her in the hearing, although she has allowed her witness
2 statement to go to you unanonymised so that you knew who was being spoken about.
- 3 **MR TEMPLE:** I've been under the conclusion, if I'm correct, that that person is no longer a
4 leader.
- 5 **MS BASIRE:** Is that a discipline that you have put on that person since learning about this?
- 6 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, correct.
- 7 **MS BASIRE:** In terms of change, would you accept that your community has had 50 years of
8 indoctrination of the beliefs of what you believe that we've talked about? You say that you
9 haven't --
- 10 **MR TEMPLE:** No, not altogether what we believe -- you're talking about the book What We
11 Believe?
- 12 **MS BASIRE:** Yeah.
- 13 **MR TEMPLE:** Well, it wasn't written until nigh on 20 years after we started, and now we have,
14 how would we say, said that thing needs to be rewritten so we haven't followed that one
15 100% for a number of years. We're not bound by that book (inaudible).
- 16 **MS BASIRE:** Well, I've seen copies of that book dated 2015 and 2018, both were updates. Why
17 would you bother to update it in 2000 -- or reprint it in 2018 if you, as recently as 2018,
18 weren't using it?
- 19 **MR TEMPLE:** Because trying to bring it up-to-date, only because of public opinion, because the
20 original one, the '89 volume was never meant for the public, it was a private thing, and it
21 would be amended from time to time. It has not been amended from time to time, as you're
22 saying, it's well out of date, there's many things that we have not followed for a number of
23 years.
- 24 **MS BASIRE:** You still follow --
- 25 **MR TEMPLE:** Sorry, carry on.
- 26 **MS BASIRE:** One of your doctrines is about the only people who can be saved, whose souls can
27 be saved, are true Christians. So my soul can't be saved because I'm not a member of your
28 community. Many survivors spoke to us about their fear of leaving the community, or their
29 fear of speaking up and being made to leave the community because their souls would not
30 be saved if they were put out of the community. That is still a practice that you believe in,
31 isn't it?
- 32 **MR TEMPLE:** No. No, it is not. We have never taught Gloriavale was the only place for good
33 Christians, that there was no Christians outside of Gloriavale, that has never been taught
34 from the beginning. Now, the Bible teaches us that he that does the will of God will go to

1 heaven. That's up to every individual to work out what the will of God for them is in their
2 situation.

3 Now, there are verses of scripture, I believe if you leave Gloriavale and go out from
4 Gloriavale's teachings, why did you leave Gloriavale, not the fact that you left but why did
5 you leave, was it God's will for you to leave, so forth and so on, but not that Gloriavale is
6 the only place you can find salvation, that's never been taught here, and it never will be
7 taught if I have any say in the matter. Because I know that to be a stupid way of thinking,
8 regardless of what anybody, who says, the Bible doesn't say that.

9 **MS BASIRE:** You still believe in the doctrine of unity?

10 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, unity is spoken of many times in the Bible.

11 **MS BASIRE:** Do you agree that people still feel internally guilty if they report because they're
12 going against unity?

13 **MR TEMPLE:** I will not say anybody will not go to heaven, I will say what the Bible says, but
14 me personally, 'you're not going to heaven', that's God's business, that's God's place. The
15 Bible does make some definite statements of who will go to heaven and who will not go to
16 heaven, it makes some definite statements there, and I will continue to teach the Bible.

17 But every individual has to make that -- make up their own mind whether they're
18 going to be in Gloriavale or they're not going to be in Gloriavale. Once a person goes out
19 of Gloriavale, they're out of my jurisdiction, that's something between them and God. I
20 have no place of judgment on somebody that's outside of Gloriavale, they come under
21 God's judgment out there, it's up to God, them and God.

22 **MS BASIRE:** I take it you are not going to do any deprogramming conditioning in your
23 community.

24 **MR TEMPLE:** Deprogramming? I'm -- could you --

25 **MS BASIRE:** You've accepted that there are some doctrines that are out of date that have led to
26 people behaving in certain ways. So what I'm saying to you is it's going to be a challenge
27 for the 600 people in Gloriavale to start acting differently, isn't it?

28 **MR TEMPLE:** It will be a challenge, yes, we're faced with that challenge because of things like
29 this abuse because it's been going on not only in Gloriavale, Gloriavale (inaudible) but also
30 in world history, New Zealand history, it goes on all over the country, okay? Now, a way
31 of life, but now abuse has never been condoned in the community. People have done it,
32 people have committed it, but it has never been condoned, it has never been approved in
33 that community; all right?

1 Now -- but if we have come and gotten a hold of it, this is where the problem is,
2 now we say we won't do this anymore, now there's 600 people, we've got to get this 600
3 people to say we won't do this anymore. That doesn't always happen just like that.

4 **MS BASIRE:** Yeah. It doesn't, does it.

5 **MR TEMPLE:** It's almost like changing a culture. But that doesn't mean we will not work on it, I
6 will push and I will teach and I will expect it of these people in Gloriavale, there will be no
7 more abuse in Gloriavale. (Inaudible).

8 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** Ms Basire, can I just ask a question of clarity before we just go
9 to the break.

10 So Mr Temple, talofa, my name is Sandra Alofivae and I'm one of the
11 Commissioners here.

12 **MR TEMPLE:** How are you?

13 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** I'm good thank you. Your document, What We Believe was
14 originally written in 1989.

15 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.

16 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** And we've heard that it has been updated twice in 2015 and
17 again in 2018, was that just simply a reprint as opposed to amendments.

18 **MR TEMPLE:** It had some minor changes in it, or some of it was taken out, it was, some minor
19 ones but not complete enough, I'll admit that. We finally, in the 2022 one, it takes a lot of
20 that stuff out.

21 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** So, essentially, your theology as documented remains the
22 same, so any outsider who would be looking at your document who didn't know anything
23 but what they read about Gloriavale would understand that that was how they practised,
24 that's how the Gloriavale community practised their faith?

25 **MR TEMPLE:** They could do that, but that What We Believe was never to replace the Bible, it
26 was never intended to, but it's written in there and stated time and again, as amended from
27 time to time. You can't amend the Bible from time to time. So that book does not override
28 the Bible, the Bible is the highest authority that we have and we will always go to the Bible.
29 What does the Bible say.

30 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** Yes, but it certainly set the culture of your community, hasn't
31 it, and that's been the driving social fabric of your community.

32 **MR TEMPLE:** It has -- sorry. It has had some effect on our culture but it is not the final
33 authority.

34 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** Thank you very much.

1 **MR TEMPLE:** Thank you.

2 **MS BASIRE:** Just one quick question before we have a break. That document, What You
3 Believe, we know that the Education Review Office had access to that document. Do you
4 know when Hopeful Christian was first investigated whether Police ever had access to that
5 document?

6 **MR TEMPLE:** First investigated? That's when he went to prison, is that the time you're talking
7 about?

8 **MS BASIRE:** Yeah.

9 **MR TEMPLE:** I don't know if they had access to it or not. I can't say, I'm sorry, I just don't
10 know.

11 **MS BASIRE:** And in recent years when the Police have been coming in over recent years, have
12 they read the document, do you know?

13 **MR TEMPLE:** I don't know. They do have a copy of it. I gave them one of the copies of 2015
14 or '18, one of the two, I gave them that copy.

15 **MS BASIRE:** Do you recall either the Education Review Office, the Police or any other
16 government authority questioning you on that doctrine that nobody was allowed to take a
17 brother to the authority or the law?

18 **MR TEMPLE:** I can't remember anybody questioning on that one. We questioned it among
19 ourselves. I can't remember anybody questioning it, nobody's questioned me on it outside
20 of the community. Now, whether they questioned Hopeful or not, I don't know, I'm sorry.

21 **MS BASIRE:** Thank you. I think it's time for a break.

22 **CHAIR:** We'll take 15 minutes and resume again at, let's give us generously an extra two minutes.
23 We'll come back at 20 to 4, thank you.

24 **Adjournment from 3.22 pm to 3.43 pm**

25 **CHAIR:** Welcome back, everybody, for our final session of the day.

26 Thank you, Ms Basire.

27 **QUESTIONING BY MS BASIRE CONTINUED:** Thank you, Madam Chair.

28 In this next section of questioning I understand that you, Mrs Stedfast, will answer
29 regarding education, Treaty, disability issues.

30 **MRS STEDFAST:** As best I can, yes.

31 **MS BASIRE:** And I will be asking some questions about the past and I appreciate that you may
32 not know and so I can also ask Mr Temple, feel free to join in.

33 So you've told us that you're aged 39 and that you were born in Springbank.

34 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yes, I was.

- 1 **MS BASIRE:** How old were you when you moved to Haupiri?
- 2 **MRS STEDFAST:** I was eight, pretty sure I was eight, yeah.
- 3 **MS BASIRE:** You've told us you have a diploma in teaching from The Open Polytech.
- 4 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yeah.
- 5 **MS BASIRE:** I'm not that familiar with teaching qualifications, so can you tell us what age
6 groups does that qualify you to teach?
- 7 **MRS STEDFAST:** So the diploma that I did was from, I think it's from zero to eight, zero to
8 eight-year-olds.
- 9 **MS BASIRE:** And you have said that you predominantly have worked in the early childhood
10 education side of things at Gloriavale.
- 11 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yes, I have.
- 12 **MS BASIRE:** Just briefly, can you tell us how the early childhood centres are set up? Is it what
13 we can imagine in the rest of New Zealand where there's one centre and it's quite separate
14 to a school or a house, or is it attached to hostels?
- 15 **MRS STEDFAST:** So over the years we have had our centres in different buildings. In the main,
16 what we call the main building, the whole -- one of the whole wings on the side is a
17 pre-school centre, multiple rooms and a playground out the front. In the past we have had,
18 to start, we had some centres, two centres located in the bottom floor, two of our hostel
19 buildings. So they were for the exclusive use of the centre, so it was like what we call a
20 shared premise.
- 21 So out of centre hours it went back to being, you know, a hostel, a personal hostel
22 but during centre hours it was for the exclusive use of the centres during those hours. But
23 we don't have those centres anymore. One has shut down and the other licence is -- it's on,
24 kind of on hold while we're in the process of shutting that down, but we're mostly using the
25 centre that is in the wing of the main building and then across from the school there's a
26 section of the school building that's kind of just a wing, an L-shape out from the school and
27 that is under the same licence as the other, yes.
- 28 **MS BASIRE:** And then the primary and secondary school are in that main building that you're
29 talking -- that you were just talking about where there's currently a wing that's being used
30 for early childhood?
- 31 **MRS STEDFAST:** No, we have a school building.
- 32 **MS BASIRE:** Yes, that's what I meant.
- 33 **MRS STEDFAST:** Oh, that's not the main building, it's a different building to the school
34 building.

- 1 **MS BASIRE:** Yes, sorry, it was probably my language.
- 2 **MRS STEDFAST:** Sorry.
- 3 **MS BASIRE:** So the school building is separate from the communal kitchen/dining/lounge
4 facilities?
- 5 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yes. Yes, it is, yeah.
- 6 **MS BASIRE:** And that is a primary school and a secondary school?
- 7 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yeah, yes, it is.
- 8 **MS BASIRE:** And how many pupils in the primary and secondary school at the moment?
- 9 **MRS STEDFAST:** At the moment there's about roughly 180, as far as I can remember, a few
10 have been taken off recently so I'm not quite up to date on those numbers. About 180 in the
11 school.
- 12 **MS BASIRE:** So do I understand that you've not taught at the school before, you've
13 predominantly been in early childhood teaching?
- 14 **MRS STEDFAST:** I have predominantly been in early childhood but I have taught at school
15 before.
- 16 **MS BASIRE:** And you were appointed Acting Principal just back in August?
- 17 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yes.
- 18 **MS BASIRE:** Why is it that you're Acting Principal at the moment?
- 19 **MRS STEDFAST:** Because the former principal, our board stood him down due to receiving
20 some allegations from the Gloriavale Leavers' Trust and --
- 21 **MS BASIRE:** I understand there's a number of teachers stood down at the moment as well?
- 22 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yes, there are. Yeah.
- 23 **MS BASIRE:** So how many teachers have you got working presently at the school?
- 24 **MRS STEDFAST:** I've got eight teachers and all of those teachers have a teacher aide with them.
- 25 **MS BASIRE:** So the eight teachers, are they fully qualified teachers?
- 26 **MRS STEDFAST:** On the -- if you look on the Teaching Council register, they are fully
27 qualified. There are some that have a -- they hold a LAT, that's a Limited Authority to
28 Teach.
- 29 **MS BASIRE:** Thank you.
- 30 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yeah.
- 31 **MS BASIRE:** We might, if I get time, ask some questions about the Limited Authority to Teach.
32 But just for now I just want to ask some questions about Māori culture. You touched on
33 that in your evidence and in your statement.

1 Now, I just want to put up a document, and it's document GLO ended 57 and this is
2 Gloriavale Christian School Quality Management System -- that's what it's headed. So I'm
3 not sure, have you seen this document before?

4 **MRS STEDFAST:** No, I haven't. No, I haven't read that document before.

5 **MS BASIRE:** Perhaps, Sophie, can you just put the front page up so she can see what the front
6 page looks like.

7 So it says "Gloriavale Christian School Quality Management System 2021". Now,
8 because you weren't working in the school in 2021, I do accept that this is not something
9 that you were involved in developing. But I just want to go to page 4 and the quote that we
10 just had up on the screen.

11 Now, in this document, which was just last year, the school said:

12 "We have our own unique Christian culture based on the teachings of the New
13 Testament. Although we all have European or Māori ancestry or both, we do not think of
14 ourselves as Europeans or Māori, rather we reject both these cultures as un-Christian since
15 both are based on paganism and self-indulgence with a few perverted versions of biblical
16 ideas mixed in. We accept no denominational labels but we are simply Christians. We do
17 not keep non-biblical traditions amongst ourselves, whether of Māori or European origin.
18 For example, we do not keep Christmas or Easter, or use pagan names for the days of the
19 weeks or the months of the year. Nor do we seek to keep the Māori culture alive amongst
20 ourselves. This is not from any racist motivation whatsoever, but as the scripture says,
21 'There is neither Jew nor Greek, there is neither bond nor free, there is neither male nor
22 female for ye are all one in Christ Jesus.'"

23 I read that out because that seems at odds with what you're telling us is happening in
24 early childhood education where you have said for a number of years that you've developed
25 a bi-cultural model.

26 So is it true that the school that you've just been asked to be Acting Principal for
27 does not seek to keep the Māori culture alive?

28 **MRS STEDFAST:** I'm kind of just getting into the school. Being that we are a private school and
29 we have a very special character, so we have a special character statement, which I haven't
30 actually got my hands on, but in that it is about that we do teach the biblical culture, the
31 culture of the Bible, which -- so it's kind of hard for me to answer, being that I've just come
32 in and I'm still trying to get my head around all these documents and even the way it's run.

1 So we have been trying to get the school to work alongside the early childhood for
2 quite a few years now actually so that there's actually a continuity of learning going from
3 early childhood through, from -- to school and so we've been working on that.

4 So there is that scripture in the Bible that once Christians become -- once you
5 become a Christian, you actually do let go of all the things that, say, like your culture, your,
6 yeah, all those things, you kind of let them go and you take on Christ, you let go of your
7 nature, your natural nature, you take on Christ, so that's where that concept is coming from,
8 where -- that in the -- yeah, you take on Christ so you let go of all the other.

9 So in the school we can teach -- we teach te reo, because that's just another
10 language, there's languages all over the world, and it's part of our, you know, the country
11 we come from. We do, also we will teach some tikanga practices that are not contrary to
12 the Bible but we will not and we probably will not ever teach the whole Māori culture to
13 our children.

14 And the thing about that too is that the Māori culture belongs to the Māori people
15 and I feel they kind of have a possession of it that I don't necessarily want to take away
16 from them. I'll teach my children about it, not necessarily expect them to become part of
17 that culture.

18 So yeah, I'm still getting my head around this statement too. So, sorry.

19 **MS BASIRE:** That's all right, I do understand the difficult position you're in. But you would
20 expect, given that that's an official quality management document in 2021, that up until
21 now there really has been no acknowledgment of Māori culture in the secondary -- the
22 primary and secondary school?

23 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yeah, which is -- it's kind of strange because even my own personal children
24 have come home singing waiata. They -- a number of them know the national anthem in
25 te reo and so I'm wondering how deep, you know, I'm like, well, okay, there has been
26 Māori things and tikanga practices and te reo taught in school.

27 Now, I don't know if people think that's separate from the culture itself. So I don't
28 believe that there has been a very strong focus on the Māori culture in school at all, and I'll
29 have to admit that there are parents who are anti it, because I personally myself have heard
30 comments, that there are individual parents who, yeah, who are struggling with the idea of
31 taking anything Māori on, including language, you know. So, yeah, there's individuals that
32 are quite strong in it. So, yeah.

33 **MS BASIRE:** Thank you for that.

1 The 1997 ERO report said that 13% of the school's roll were Māori and we've been
2 told that originally there were five families who identified as Māori within Gloriavale.
3 Because you have large families in Gloriavale, that counted for quite a lot of people. But
4 four of the families have left and there is only one family still left in Gloriavale. Would
5 you agree with that?

6 **MRS STEDFAST:** I don't know sorry, I don't actually know who you're talking about, but --

7 **MS BASIRE:** That's fine. What I'm going to do is I'm just going to read a quote which might put
8 some light into why your children have come home with some Māori culture, some waiata
9 or some language and yet the school doesn't promote it.

10 So this is witness statement number 5. This witness says:

11 "My experience in the early childhood centres and the school at Gloriavale is that
12 teachers only pay attention to the Māori aspect of our bi-cultural nation when there's an
13 ERO visit occurring. Just before a visit, te reo Māori resources would appear in the
14 classrooms, the child would rote learn a waiata but as soon as the visit was over we'd go
15 back to normal and there would be no focus on learning or understanding different
16 cultures."

17 Has that been your experience?

18 **MRS STEDFAST:** I would say that in the past when I was young before I actually came into the
19 position of secondary manager, because we were just learning it, so it was, yeah, it was
20 quite a difficult thing to get our heads around even, even as a young, even right from the
21 start, as a student teacher, but in recent years that has actually changed quite, quite
22 dramatically, I'll have to say "dramatically", because now it is actually, and there will
23 always be some teachers that are weaker than other teachers. So you'll always have your,
24 say, your te reo champions who - they will be kind of like the team leader in the group or in
25 the centre, even school teachers have strengths, other school teachers- are, like, "I can't
26 learn another language very well", you know.

27 So there'll always be your champions that will push it and we are actually getting
28 more champions in that area as we go on and as we get more professional development
29 around that.

30 So in the past, yes, I did see that happen.

31 **MS BASIRE:** Thank you.

32 **MRS STEDFAST:** Now it's so much better.

33 **MS BASIRE:** This witness goes on to say:

1 "GRO-B" was a teacher in the school and she asked the leaders" - and- I assume by
2 that she meant the leaders of the school - "if her Grade 2 children could sing the
3 New Zealand national anthem both in te reo and English for the community but this request
4 was denied. The message was sent to children that Māori culture and tikanga are
5 unimportant at best and negative at worst. Ironically there are items in the concerts which
6 the community put on for visitors which celebrate cultures from all around the world but
7 still no inclusion of Māori culture."

8 So that is, I understand, a comment from a few years ago. So you're saying that that
9 practice has changed?

10 **MRS STEDFAST:** Well, what my children told me, I had one -- one of my children was in that
11 grade, she said it's because, it had something to do with that there was "killing" or "war", I
12 can't remember which word she used, in the anthem itself, just the anthem itself. So it was
13 a little bit questionable but since then, it's actually changed, so multiple grades have
14 actually learnt the anthem in English and te reo, so -- and about the concerts, well, yeah,
15 I mean, I don't think it was very much thought of, I suppose. And the concerts were just,
16 yeah, whatever, everything so --

17 **MR TEMPLE:** I could --

18 **MS BASIRE:** Another witness -- sorry, yes, Mr Temple?

19 **MR TEMPLE:** Just to add a little bit on to that one. As far as the Bible goes, as far as our
20 teachings go, we cannot say one language is acceptable to God, another language is not
21 acceptable to God. If we say only people that talk English can be Christians, Japanese
22 couldn't be Christians, Samoans couldn't be Christians, Māori couldn't be Christians, but
23 now that -- God doesn't see it that way.

24 Now, there can be individuals, individuals in any culture and any nationality that
25 will have problem with another -- a different culture, a different nationality, but it doesn't
26 mean one is right and the other one is wrong. It's a matter of the humanity of people, if
27 I might put it that way. It's just natural that anywhere it seems like you have got two
28 nationalities together you'll get some degree of prejudice, which you've got throughout the
29 world.

30 But us and our belief in the teachings in the church is no, we're one and the same.
31 Before God, we look at ourselves as before God, how does God see us? No, he sees us all
32 as equals, all right? Before we become Christian, we're all sinners; once we become

1 Christians, we are all Christians regardless of what nationality or what language you speak,
2 it doesn't make any difference, okay?

3 But the humanity of people have a bit of a problem sometimes seeing it that way.
4 But in the church, no, we're all equal and there is nothing sinful about talking Māori. I hear
5 the kids, the pre-schoolers singing something in Māori, it causes me no problem
6 whatsoever, not whatsoever.

7 And -- but there is cultures, like, I was 30 years old before I came a Christian. Well,
8 I had to change a lot of things in my life which had become part of my culture, I had to give
9 those up now if I was going to take on the Christian culture. This is what we aim for, the
10 Christian culture overrides all other cultures and the Christian culture, we should all be
11 aiming towards that culture. But that doesn't mean you've got to leave everything else
12 outside, you can't sing something in Māori now because we're Christians, you would have
13 to say we can't talk English now because we're Christians. That's not the way it is and that's
14 not what is taught in the church.

15 Admittedly, there still can be prejudice among the people here. I was talking to a
16 Māori lady, I went purposely to her and questioned her, she's not a full Māori, she's only
17 half Māori, she's married to a New Zealander, I was asking her some questions about in her
18 life, in her experience, had she received any issues because of prejudice or something. She
19 said, yes, as a young person she did. When she was 10 years old there was instances there,
20 she said, but it's mainly from the school children and children of her own age and her own
21 class that she would get a bit of ridicule from them sometimes. She did say that in the
22 school then if the teachers ever got a hold of anything like that they would condemn it
23 straight away.

24 So it hasn't been taught in our teachings, in the school, or in our church meetings
25 that the Māori are anything less than Europeans or New Zealanders, or anything, but we're
26 all one people, and we're all aiming for the one culture.

27 **MS BASIRE:** I'll just read out one of the witness statements. This is survivor witness statement

28 1. She says:

29 "In Year 5 and 6 I had a teacher who picked on me and another Māori girl in the
30 class. He would talk down to us about our mums. He used to call Māori 'vile heathens' and
31 the like. He singled me out to humiliate me. One time I used te reo and he made me stand
32 in the corner for two to three hours. I was 11 years old when this happened. There was a
33 lot of racism at Gloriavale. We'd be punished if we spoke in te reo. There was definitely a
34 stigma to be Māori or any other culture in there."

1 **MR TEMPLE:** I cannot argue with that, I can't argue with that. I'm not everywhere all the time,
2 every minute of the day. But they're just doing what this lady taught and what is generally
3 taught in the community, the leadership, it is not taught, you know, that Māori is any less
4 than New Zealand and this lady did tell me that if it was in her experience, if anything like
5 that came up in the school, she was a senior sort of teacher, been there for years, if anything
6 like that came up in the school, the lady said, yes, it would be dealt with by the teachers and
7 condemned. That's all that I know of it. I haven't been a school teacher, I haven't taught in
8 the school so anything could have happened and me not know of it.

9 **MS BASIRE:** We have another statement from another survivor, this is witness number 3, she
10 says:

11 "I remember being young and my mother crying about why I was not liked by the
12 leaders. My grandmother said it was because I was Māori and that Hopeful was racist. A
13 lot of things were said to me about being Māori over the years. My grandmother taught me
14 some te reo. Once when I was speaking te reo I was told I was not allowed to speak Satan's
15 language. I do not remember who said that. We were taught that Māori were
16 thieves -- were lazy and thieves. I remember feeling a lot of shame about being Māori
17 when I was younger."

18 So that witness is talking about leaders, including Hopeful Christian. Do you recall
19 what his attitude to Māori were?

20 **MR TEMPLE:** I haven't got any knowledge of being particularly prejudiced towards Māori, or
21 any other race. The Māori girls here, the ones here now, they've all married New Zealand
22 men. Hopeful's granddaughter is married to an Indian and living in India. Whether he
23 made a difference between the two but -- I don't know. I can't say that -- I can't say none of
24 these issues happened because I wasn't everywhere all the time.

25 **MS BASIRE:** The doctrine of not keeping either European or Māori culture alive over the New
26 Testament, that's still your doctrine; is that right?

27 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, it is, the Christian culture comes above all other cultures, the Christian
28 culture, but it's got nothing to do with the language or whether you eat this food or you eat
29 that food, I'm looking at it from a Christian point of view and the way we see God would
30 see it. One culture is not above another culture as far as God sees, as far as God goes, and
31 his judgment will come on one the same as it will come on the other.

32 **MRS STEDFAST:** I think, if I may, sorry, the cultural part would be, say, like the legends, the
33 Māori gods, the teachings about taniwha, etc, we would definitely not teach our children
34 that this is for them. We would teach them that the Bible is for them. Just like if anyone

1 from China came and brought their gods with them, we'd say you need to let go of
2 that -- you can still speak Chinese, even if you wore the same clothes as Chinese, but you
3 need to leave the gods back at that culture and you need to take on the God of the New
4 Testament.

5 Now, I understand that our children, a lot of our children are not what I would call
6 Christians because they have not yet given their lives to God or to Christ. So in that aspect
7 what they take and what they feel would be quite different to what I feel as -- because I've
8 been converted to Christ.

9 So it's quite a foreign concept for a lot of people just in general society. But that
10 cultural part of the teachings of the ancestors, the Māori gods, that we will not, because it
11 conflicts with our belief in the Bible.

12 And I would like to make a statement about what the witness said when the witness
13 said that it was called the devil's language when she spoke te reo. Whoever said that, and
14 she's running it on from Hopeful Christian. That does not mean that Hopeful Christian said
15 it.

16 Now, she didn't clarify, or whoever it was, I don't know if it was a she, did not
17 clarify whether or not that was Hopeful who said it.

18 Now, like I said, I have heard comments like that. They are from individuals who
19 have their own personal standings and beliefs, and they have made that choice to believe
20 that.

21 Now, my grandfather Hopeful, he took his family and they lived amongst the Māori
22 people in maraes, on a marae here, a couple of different marae, because he was
23 evangelising and he was evangelising, taking the Bible and taking Christ's teaching to them.
24 So that's what -- that's where it would collide, because Christ's teachings do collide with
25 Māori concepts of spirituality and stuff. There are so many things that align that we -- it
26 doesn't collide, and we would and will continue to teach those.

27 But where it collides is where we actually can't -- if we're saying we are Christians
28 and we believe in the Bible, we can't teach those things to our children, and anyone who is
29 in Gloriavale, we are supposing, we are supposing that they are there because they want the
30 teachings of the Bible. So that's what we are going to deliver to their children.

31 Now, if they want the other, if they want us to teach their children the Māori
32 ancestry, their culture, then they probably need to find another school that actually will do
33 that, say, because we are a special character school and this is the character of our school,

1 then along with Government, kind of, mandates, we will teach where it goes and as far as it
2 goes before it collides with our faith. So --

3 **MS BASIRE:** Okay. I'll just stop you there and ask you some questions.

4 First of all, a Māori family in Gloriavale would find it very difficult to say that they
5 weren't going to have their children at the school because that would go against the concept
6 of unity; isn't that right?

7 **MRS STEDFAST:** If they chose to home school?

8 **MS BASIRE:** Or take their children to another school.

9 **MRS STEDFAST:** Or take their children to another school. So we're presuming because they
10 sent their children to our school that that's what they want their children --

11 **MS BASIRE:** I'm just looking at what we know about the Gloriavale structure, which everybody
12 lives communally, works communally, goes to school communally -- is that your baby?

13 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yeah, (inaudible).

14 **MS BASIRE:** Well, a child doesn't have a lot of choice in this situation, they're kind of captive in
15 this rural community 70 kilometres away from everyone else, but I'm just saying the
16 parents even would struggle to step out of unity and take their children to another school to
17 learn, for example, to a kaupapa Māori school, that would be out of unity with the rest of
18 the community, wouldn't it?

19 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yes, because the concept of unity is that we are all wanting to head in the
20 same direction. So if they want to move off that path, they can move off that path if they
21 want to. And it does mean they will be out of unity. But if they don't want that direction
22 anymore, they're free to go another one.

23 **MS BASIRE:** So Christianity itself is a European concept and culture that was transported to
24 New Zealand by the missionaries; you would agree that?

25 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yes, it was brought to New Zealand by the missionaries, yeah.

26 **MS BASIRE:** Isn't by putting the New Testament first and not seeking to keep the Māori culture
27 alive effectively promoting a version of European culture over Māori culture?

28 **MRS STEDFAST:** The New Testament was -- it was actually -- it was, it originated from Israel,
29 so it was -- it was -- the Old Testament was for the Jews, the New Testament came in and
30 Gentiles were invited into that salvation. Before that, salvation was just for the Jews. So
31 actually it originated from Israel. So yeah, I mean, it's been adopted and it's gone
32 everywhere, worldwide, so --

33 **MS BASIRE:** But it's a cultural practice that was foreign to New Zealand before the missionaries
34 brought it here?

1 **MRS STEDFAST:** That's right, yeah.

2 **MS BASIRE:** I'm just briefly going to ask some questions about Te Tiriti o Waitangi, or the
3 Treaty of Waitangi. Now, I understand because you're a special character school you're not
4 bound by the Treaty, but there are some aspects that you're encouraged by the education
5 authorities to include in your curriculum; would that be your understanding?

6 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yes, yes, that would be. I don't have great understanding of the school at the
7 moment, I have a bigger understanding of early childhood and they kind of come under a
8 different thing to this private school.

9 **MS BASIRE:** We did have a document which was a document in 2007 which made -- which was
10 given to us from Gloriavale. In that document, ended 12, it said -- I'll just read it out
11 for -- because we're running out of time:

12 "Gloriavale Christian Community School, being a private school, is not an agent of
13 the Crown and therefore has no direct responsibilities under the Treaty of Waitangi other
14 than to recognise the signatory of the Crown of England."

15 It was clear in that document that Gloriavale didn't appear to accept, or even be
16 aware of what we call the two versions of the Treaty, that is the English version and then
17 the Māori version, which translated into English says something different. Are you aware
18 of those differences?

19 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yeah, slightly, I'm not that clear on them, but I am aware.

20 **MS BASIRE:** Do you think anyone in Gloriavale would be aware that the Waitangi Tribunal has
21 found that the Treaty set out agreement between Māori and the Crown where Māori
22 exercised tino rangatiratanga over Māori and the Crown actually exercised kāwanatanga
23 over the British settlers, not that Māori ceded sovereignty to the Crown of England.

24 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yeah, yeah.

25 **MS BASIRE:** That's probably beyond --

26 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yes, there are people who are aware of that, quite a lot of people actually.

27 **MS BASIRE:** Right. I take it, therefore, that Gloriavale doesn't accept the principles of
28 partnership inherent in Te Tiriti and doesn't see that Māori children have a right to their
29 culture, that supersedes your religious beliefs.

30 **MRS STEDFAST:** I wouldn't say Gloriavale even actually really Gloriavale, there's a lot of
31 people in Gloriavale with actually a range of beliefs in that. So that school document was
32 in 2007. I don't even know about that school document. I have not read it, and my guess is
33 that it was written by the principal at the time and as a parent I never saw that document.
34 As an early childhood teacher I never saw that document.

1 I did not know about it, I did not know that statement was there. So yeah, like
2 I said, I'm just -- and so -- and I can't speak for everyone at Gloriavale. I can speak for me
3 and what I know.

4 **MS BASIRE:** We're running out of time, but I just wanted to ask you some questions about
5 people with disabilities. You said in your statement that children with disabilities are well
6 supported now in Gloriavale; is that correct?

7 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yes, yeah. And getting better.

8 **MS BASIRE:** You'd agree that they weren't always supported?

9 **MRS STEDFAST:** I agree, they weren't always supported.

10 **MS BASIRE:** What about adults who are disabled in the Gloriavale community? You must have
11 adults, disabled adults in the community?

12 **MRS STEDFAST:** Yeah, I'd say so, yeah. Yeah, there are.

13 **MS BASIRE:** This might be more of a question for Mr Temple. The document that was a
14 response to a Notice to Produce that we asked you a number of questions, that's document
15 ended 144, you were asked about policies and how well you look after people who are deaf
16 or disabled, and the answer was:

17 "We treat all members of the community equally regardless of race, gender, ability,
18 mental health or sexual orientation. We believe the systems we have in place will
19 adequately protect all people from abuse within the community itself. We are happy for
20 outside agencies such as the Police, OT or Safeguarding Children to advise us of any
21 changes that we need to make to our policies and procedures."

22 And then in that same document you were asked to comment on human rights and
23 how Gloriavale has incorporated international human rights norms and principles into its
24 systems, procedures and policies in respect to provision of care of children and young
25 people and vulnerable adults.

26 Now, your response was:

27 "We are a small farming community on the West Coast so we generally do not
28 spend any time reading international human rights treaties and principles. Having said that,
29 we are conscious of the need to follow all domestic laws. Safeguarding Children helped
30 formulate our child protection policy with input from the Police and Oranga Tamariki and
31 we have considered the Human Rights Act and the Bill of Rights Act."

32 So I just wanted to ask some questions about disability. Has any of the leadership,
33 Mr Temple, been made aware of the UN Convention on the Rights of the Disabled Person?

1 **MR TEMPLE:** The which? The what? I'm sorry, I didn't quite get the last part of that question,
2 sorry.

3 **MS BASIRE:** That's all right. The United Nations Convention on the Rights of Disabled People.

4 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.

5 **MS BASIRE:** Do any of the Shepherds or Servants know about that document?

6 **MR TEMPLE:** I don't particularly know -- I know of the document but I haven't made a study of
7 it. There could be many things in there that I'm not really aware of. But we are definitely,
8 to the best of my knowledge, making provision -- we do have some disabled persons here,
9 some -- a couple of not very well disabled, we have others, you know, with no legs and this
10 type of thing, but they're all, as far as all appearances they've been well catered for.

11 We have one who suffers quite strongly with dementia and he's in quite bad shape,
12 but he's still with his wife and he's got sons and daughters here and they help, they help his
13 wife very much with the care of him and he goes away to a home in Greymouth now and
14 again and spends some time there. So I think as much as can be done, is being done for that
15 person.

16 And the young girl **GRO-B**, she's completely unable to look after herself, but her
17 mother and other girls in the community, there's somebody with her all the time and she's
18 getting a fair bit of help here. And then she has -- her and her husband have taken that girl
19 to Australia a number of times to undergo treatment over there and they're coming up to
20 take her over again. There were some people in New Zealand here that were treating her
21 here in New Zealand, they went to (inaudible) over a period of time now. But all that can
22 be done -- there is a person that comes out there and looks at that, at her every week. Every
23 week a specialist comes out and spends sometime there with her. So I feel that she's getting
24 well looked after.

25 **MS BASIRE:** It hasn't always been the case that disabled people have been well looked after in
26 Gloriavale, is it, though? I just want to talk to you about Prayer Ready, you will remember
27 Prayer?

28 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, that's right. What is the accusation there, that she was not being looked
29 after?

30 **MS BASIRE:** I'll just read out a witness statement, witness statement 5:

31 "Our daughter Prayer was born in 2001 and Hopeful was the first person to tell me
32 she had Down's Syndrome. We were given the clear impression that to produce a child
33 with special needs was a reflection of deficiency in our own spirituality."

1 Do you remember that attitude being around?

2 **MR TEMPLE:** No, I haven't known of it, I haven't known of it. And to my knowledge, the child
3 was with her family. No, I'm sorry, I can't remember of any of that happening. Rachel?

4 **MRS STEDFAST:** I don't know of that attitude.

5 **MR TEMPLE:** No, I don't know of it.

6 **MS BASIRE:** She goes on to say:

7 "Hopeful was opposed to any measures to provide special assistance for Prayer. He
8 told us we were making a public display of ourselves by treating Prayer differently and she
9 should be treated the same way as other children."

10 Was there a philosophy that all children should be treated the same regardless of
11 their disability?

12 **MR TEMPLE:** No, that was never taught, I've never heard that being taught. I would have heard
13 of no matter what the child, who the child is or what problems it has, it still must be treated
14 equal. Now, being equal is being provided for and cared for. And equal doesn't mean that
15 you eat the same food, you go to the same doctor at the same time and things like this,
16 being equal is every need is met.

17 **MS BASIRE:** I'll just read out some more of her statement.

18 **MR TEMPLE:** Carry on.

19 **MS BASIRE:** "A person" -- who we're not going to name -- "who travelled outside the
20 community secretly arranged for us to receive help from a community health worker. We
21 had to do this secretly because we were aware of parents of special needs children in the
22 community who asked for this type of help and it been denied by the leaders."

23 She goes on to say:

24 "Before this person could begin to visit us in the community -- [unnamed
25 person] -- had to groom Hopeful by massaging his ego so he would accept this. The person
26 who came into the community was very helpful in that she always wore long dresses, she
27 was very respectful when she visited so she was able to visit us for four years and her
28 assistance was invaluable."

29 However, she goes on to say:

30 "Because I'd received additional learning -- all of the additional learning from the
31 person who was coming in and Prayer was progressing well, I wanted to be her teacher aide
32 in the school. I was suitably qualified and the community could get funding for my
33 position from the Ministry of Education but Hopeful and Faithful Pilgrim, who was the
34 principal of the school at the time, denied this request. I was told I was not capable of

1 caring for her because I was not strong enough, I wasn't a strong enough disciplinarian.
2 I even went to a teachers' meeting and pleaded with them but – [unnamed person] -- and
3 I were mocked and our request was again denied."

4 She goes on to say:

5 "As soon as she started at school Prayer's learning went backwards, I tried to stress
6 the need for her to have a consistent learning environment but the school kept changing her
7 teachers so Prayer lost a lot of the gains she'd made as she took time to become accustomed
8 to her new classroom routine which took her away from learning."

9 **MR TEMPLE:** I can't comment on that one, I don't know of it, that's all I can say, I don't know of
10 that issue.

11 **MS BASIRE:** Well, another witness, and this came from Louise Taylor's evidence, she was in
12 school with Prayer and her memory was:

13 "In early years Prayer was largely ignored, put down the back of the classroom and
14 given blocks or a pencil and paper and left to fend for herself. In later years, Prayer was
15 expected to perform at the same level as the rest of us and she faced a lot of pressure to stop
16 pretending that she had Down's Syndrome and start applying herself to her work. The
17 thinking seemed to be if they pushed and beat Prayer hard enough they would beat the
18 Down's Syndrome out of her."

19 **MR TEMPLE:** That sounds a bit foreign. But what was going on in the school I know very little
20 about, I had a job, managing a job myself, that took up my time. But all I can say is that
21 sounds a little bit foreign to me, that a child would get treated any differently to any other
22 child, you know, that line, you know what I mean, it's health, say, it's disability say.

23 That's all I can say. Rachel, do you have any?

24 **MRS STEDFAST:** Well, I was in the centre when Prayer was a one- to two-year-old, I was there
25 with her mum and we did, as staff we did training -- sorry. And I witnessed the beautiful
26 relationship that she had with her mum. I witnessed the time and the love that her mum put
27 into her and I admired her so greatly for that. And while she was at the early childhood
28 centres I believe that the staff and the teachers and the centre manager I worked under at
29 the time put so much time and care and love to support Prayer's mum because we
30 understood that she probably would have struggles going through life. And I do know that
31 when she went to school, I don't know if it was straight away, but I started noticing a
32 difference in her and of course I didn't inquire into it, maybe I should have, I was just a
33 young teacher.

1 But I did see sorrow and heartache in her mother when Prayer was mistreated by
2 people and my heart went out to her. Because even myself, I had built a friendship with
3 Prayer and because I -- my personality type is that I am an advocate, and so my passion is
4 to protect the vulnerable. And so to see things happening I didn't have answers because
5 I hadn't done the training that was needed. So I couldn't step in and do things. But now
6 I've had a lot of training and I would step in, I would do something about that. And
7 individual people, I know that individual people would actually mistreat her because she
8 was different.

9 **MS BASIRE:** And that included the teachers, didn't it?

10 **MRS STEDFAST:** I can't say, I wasn't in the classrooms, I was just outside the classrooms.

11 **MS BASIRE:** But we've got a witness statement who saw that happen and you're telling us you
12 saw the difference in Prayer, that child was abused and ill-treated at that school and the
13 really sad thing, and I understand why you're emotional, is then she died, and we've only
14 got three minutes left, so I just want to finish on that point.

15 Prayer was Down Syndrome and she found it hard to swallow, it's one of the
16 physical side effects of her Down Syndrome. There was a time in the community where
17 some of the extended family got an infectious illness and Gloriavale's response was to put
18 them in a room and take away the mechanism, the locking mechanism so they couldn't get
19 out of the room, and Prayer choked on a piece of meat and nobody in that room could get
20 her out. They couldn't get her out the window and they couldn't get the door open and she
21 died.

22 Now, I understand there's probably a conflict in that Prayer's family say that
23 Gloriavale told them that when the coroner came to visit they weren't to say anything
24 negative about Gloriavale and so the official coronial finding is that it was an accident, the
25 family asked -- since left, some of the family has since left and asked the coroner to reopen
26 the case and they haven't.

27 To be fair to you, Mr Temple, I should give you a chance to respond to that and then
28 that will be the end of my questioning.

29 **MR TEMPLE:** I'd say thank you, and receive what Rachel was saying, okay? I couldn't
30 comment on a lot of things simply because I wasn't there, I didn't know. So I would just
31 ask you to receive what GRO-A is saying and I won't deny anything, I only go on what I
32 know, all right? I can apologise for not knowing, maybe I didn't investigate enough,

1 I haven't checked enough, I haven't been observant enough. I'm sorry for whatever
2 happened and what didn't happen. I'm sorry if there was failure there.

3 I feel for the family, I had a Down Syndrome child myself that died at a young age
4 of pneumonia. So I can understand the feelings a little bit along those lines.

5 But I still say, I still say right and wrong will be taught here in this community and I
6 will still say everybody in this community, I don't care who they are, what colour they are,
7 their nationality, they desire or deserve equal treatment, regardless of who they are and
8 what their problem is. That's all I can do, I can't do anything more now. Thank you.

9 **MS BASIRE:** Thank you, Mr Temple. We now just have the opportunity for the Commissioners
10 to ask you or Mrs Stedfast some questions.

11 **CHAIR:** Thank you.

12 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Tēnā kōrua. My name's Anaru Erueti I'm one of the
13 Commissioners. I'd like to start with questions about redress that we talked about earlier
14 today. You noted that there have been small payments of \$1,000 to \$10,000, I think.
15 I wanted to know whether you sought external advice or guidance before you started
16 providing redress to survivors in this way?

17 Did you seek advice? Can you hear me okay? I'll address this to you, Mr Temple.

18 **MR TEMPLE:** Thank you, I'm sorry, my mind went off a little bit, I'm sorry, my mind drifted
19 off, I'm sorry, if you could repeat it. Thank you.

20 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** So I'm asking about, so in evidence earlier today you talked about
21 providing compensation payments to survivors of abuse in your community, sums of
22 \$1,000, I think were the average, and other forms of I think you described it as help, limited
23 amounts of money. And my question is, whether you have sought, as a Shepherd, advice
24 about providing redress to survivors?

25 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, we're talking at the present time with, what were they, the -- Craig, what's
26 his name, do you know? I'm sorry, the name of it, it's a Commission, a Government
27 Commission for this particular reason. I'm sorry.

28 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Okay.

29 **MR TEMPLE:** But anyway, we're having consultation with him and talking about the means and
30 ways of helping leavers from church, financially, it's a very short -- there is very little we
31 can do. If I could say, it was one of the leavers, not so long ago, actually she is one that's
32 having us in court now, but she asked for \$14,000, she asked for \$14,000 for a down
33 payment on a home and I requested it from the trust, the trust says no, we cannot do that
34 because that's a personal benefit and it's a public trust. So we as Christian partners got

1 together, we managed to get \$11,000 and we gave her that, that's all we could get together,
2 so we're faced with that type of situation. We would love to help people more, but we're
3 just hindered with finances.

4 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** I take that point. Are you familiar with our redress report, our
5 report Puretumu Torowhānui that we produced in December last year which talks about this
6 kaupapa of redress?

7 **MR TEMPLE:** No, I'm not familiar with it.

8 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** I think we should get you a copy. One of the points that's
9 emphasised in that report is the importance of independence to ensure that survivors of
10 abuse do not have to come back to the abuser to seek redress in all its forms, whether it's
11 monetary compensation, counselling, therapy, supports. I wonder how you would feel
12 about that, particularly given in your code, I can't remember the name of it, from 1975,
13 about prohibition of going outside of the community for legal redress. Would you be,
14 nevertheless, supportive of that redress being provided by an independent body, a body
15 independent to Gloriavale?

16 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, very much so. We had talked about getting someone like that in this group
17 I'm trying to -- because they come across, they're a government department working out of
18 Greymouth, and we talked with them along these same lines. They're saying that they do
19 help people in situations and that they could be willing to help us in some way as far as
20 finding housing and finding jobs and so forth and so on. They're willing to work with us,
21 we're perfectly willing to work with them as much as we can.

22 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Okay. So, Mr Temple, we've recommended that there be a single
23 redress scheme that's created for all survivors which includes both State agencies and
24 faith-based institutions. So I'm assuming that you wouldn't be allergic to that notion and
25 that the Shepherds would agree with that idea of giving its ease of access for survivors and
26 independence from the Gloriavale community, based on what you've just said.

27 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, that would be no problem at all, we'd love to help them more, we're just
28 hindered because of our financial situation. We're not a rich people by any means. A lot of
29 our finances is getting taken up at the present time on other matters. But anyway, we did
30 have a block of land, we were talking about selling the block of land and putting that
31 money into a reserve account for particularly helping people, doing something like this,
32 because we do want to and we're willing to.

1 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Thank you, Mr Temple. Thank you. I want to ask you too about
2 the way in which leadership is established, the Shepherds, their appointment, and also what
3 you call their supporters, the Servants, I think you called them.

4 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.

5 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** It seems there has been over time a significant number of Māori in
6 your community, is that fair to say, over time?

7 **MR TEMPLE:** There was two families, two families that were brought in quite early on and the
8 biggest number, largest number are not in the community anymore. Some of their children
9 are still in the community, but there's only five, five of the children still in the community
10 married to New Zealanders in the community.

11 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Even now 19% of the schooling it seems, and we heard -- I
12 understand there are five families and four have left, but it seems that over time it has been
13 a significant cohort. But I wondered to what extent they have been represented among the
14 Shepherds or the Servants of Gloriavale?

15 **MR TEMPLE:** No, no, they weren't represented. It's not for any particular reason, not because of
16 their culture, their nationality or anything like that. They're women, both women that came
17 in they had a family but they didn't have husbands, one husband was dead, I'm not sure
18 what happened to the other husband. They were welcomed into the community. I think
19 there's one man among them who's a young fella when they come in, he's grown up now
20 and married to a lady here.

21 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** That's okay, sir, we're just so limited for time. If the answer's no,
22 the answer's no. So on that question about the appointment of the Shepherds, it's not
23 elected, so it's via some divine choice, is that right? Are you able to just elaborate some
24 more about how that decision is made?

25 **MR TEMPLE:** It's made generally by me on the type of the person, their spiritual attributes, their
26 commitment to the community, commitment to this way of life and the way they're
27 showing it in their life. There's examples in the Bible where the apostle Paul in his
28 teaching, and he asked Timothy and Titus, he said they had Titus in that place to teach
29 elders to come up and take the place of leadership and the same with Timothy, it was not
30 elders in the church that come up and take the place of leadership, it's along that example
31 there. These people were appointed by me in the church, not by a vote or something like
32 that.

33 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Thank you, that explains it nicely.

1 I want to come back to the policy document that we had before that was brought up
2 from 2021 which talked about in teaching you would reject both Māori culture and
3 European culture together. But I wonder, Mr Temple, about what in effect is happening
4 there is that in effect it's just the Māori culture that's being rejected because what's being
5 taught in school is in the English language of instruction, and as counsel noted, you're
6 teaching from the Western Bible, irrespective of the talk about Israel, this is a dogma and
7 Christian faith emanated from Western Europe. So it's really the dominance of one culture
8 over another culture here. Would you agree with that?

9 **MR TEMPLE:** I hadn't seen it that way because the Māori are welcomed here as one of us and
10 treated equally with everybody else. So I haven't seen it that way that it's one culture above
11 another. Because to my knowledge and my intentions and my teachings, I know they will
12 be treated equal with anybody else, there will be no difference at all. Now whoever comes
13 to that place of leadership I can't say.

14 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Thank you, Mr Temple. We're really short of time and we need to
15 finish on time, so I have many questions and it's been illuminating but I'll now pass on to
16 my colleagues. Thank you very much, kia ora.

17 **CHAIR:** Thank you.

18 **MR TEMPLE:** I'll pass on to you and your group, I will pass on to you any questions that you
19 want answered, feel free to contact me at any time.

20 **CHAIR:** Thank you, Mr Temple, I was going to ask you if you would be prepared to do that and
21 we're grateful. I've got a couple of Commissioners here who are anxious to ask you just
22 one or two questions each, so if you could just bear with us for another few moments, I'll
23 just hand you over to Paul Gibson.

24 **COMMISSIONER GIBSON:** Thanks, Mr Temple. Sorry to hear about the death of your own
25 disabled child. I just wanted to check my hearing, did you describe your child as "it"?

26 **MR TEMPLE:** Describe the child? It was a young child, a very young child, it was under a year
27 old and it just got pneumonia in the winter time and --

28 **COMMISSIONER GIBSON:** Your son or daughter.

29 **MR TEMPLE:** It was a daughter, and they have a tendency, I understand, to have a weakness
30 there in the lung.

31 **COMMISSIONER GIBSON:** Sorry to hear about that. Can I ask, is there any circumstances
32 where any child, adult or at risk family would be locked in a room now?

33 **MR TEMPLE:** No, no, no, that would definitely be condemned.

34 **COMMISSIONER GIBSON:** That's completely stopped, I'm glad to hear.

- 1 **MR TEMPLE:** It wouldn't be acceptable to be locked in a room, it's against the law now to lock a
2 child in a room, isn't it? It's illegal.
- 3 **COMMISSIONER GIBSON:** And family? And you wouldn't break the law?
- 4 **MR TEMPLE:** No, not a law that I know of.
- 5 **COMMISSIONER GIBSON:** Can I ask today, 2022, to what extent is that the founder, the
6 leader for many years was a convicted sex offender, is that well known throughout the
7 community today?
- 8 **MR TEMPLE:** Throughout the community, yes, yes, I don't think of any reason why they
9 couldn't know of it.
- 10 **COMMISSIONER GIBSON:** And would it be useful to help keep the community recognising
11 that there's 61 young people exposed to some harmful sexual behaviour at the moment, for
12 example this hearing today to be spread through the community so that they get to see and
13 hear some of the truth, some of these issues.
- 14 **MR TEMPLE:** That is well known in the community because the investigation was wide open to
15 everybody in the community and it covered just about every family in the community,
16 (inaudible) reminding the people of what has happened in the past, let's make sure it doesn't
17 happen again.
- 18 **COMMISSIONER GIBSON:** So would you support the information that's happened today,
19 whether it's the videos, whether it's the transcript being shared throughout the community
20 so that the families know and learn about the history of their community?
- 21 **MR TEMPLE:** The transcript here today, what's happening today here, is that what you're talking
22 about?
- 23 **COMMISSIONER GIBSON:** Yes, or the video.
- 24 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, yes, no, that would be no problem, no problem at all.
- 25 **COMMISSIONER GIBSON:** We hear, it sounds like, so many children are at risk, young people
26 are at risk, 61 identified in different ways and you've talked about some processes. You've
27 talked about a number of disabled children, adults at risk there. What additional processes
28 are you putting in place to keep disabled people safe from the kind of abuse which has
29 happened, physical, sexual, over many years at Gloriavale?
- 30 **MR TEMPLE:** We've got policies in place but if somebody has set a policy it's useless, it's just
31 words on paper, but it must be implemented, it must be made a live thing and it's moving
32 and we're pushing it on through to get copies of that in every family, and we teach it and
33 keep it alive. Plus supervision, family units getting closer together, getting closer
34 relationships so they can quickly report something and they'll be willing to report anything,

1 any thoughts or dangers about it, and we've got this leads group there and they are there for
2 that particular reason. People that, anybody can go and report to and do it in
3 confidentiality, and not get harassed because they've reported something, no prejudice
4 shown to them, and they're saying -- we're going to carry on, and we're still working with
5 Safeguarding Children, we're still working with Oranga Tamariki, we're still working with
6 the Police, we're still working with other groups, the START and STOP who come there
7 regularly and talk with us. We're welcoming any help along that line that we can get.

8 **COMMISSIONER GIBSON:** One last question. I see in the information which you've supplied
9 us in advance that of the 600 people within Gloriavale there's nobody identified from the
10 rainbow community, LGBTQI. Are people's preferences, sexual preferences accepted?
11 Has there ever been conversion therapy, and given that it's now illegal, will that ever be
12 contemplated?

13 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, if it ever happened there would be help given. It has only happened once in
14 the community to my knowledge and there was a girl from Australia came over and spent
15 some time with us and her mother was a member of the rainbow community. Now she
16 didn't show any signs at all of being a member of that. But it came out later on, her and
17 another girl, they finished up sneaking away together in the night, and then it was obvious
18 they had been seen in the situation, but yes, they are part of the rainbow community now.
19 That's the only one that I know of.

20 **COMMISSIONER GIBSON:** Are they accepted within Gloriavale?

21 **MR TEMPLE:** Beg your pardon?

22 **COMMISSIONER GIBSON:** Are they accepted within Gloriavale? There's not an attempt to,
23 for conversion therapy of people who express --

24 **MR TEMPLE:** I don't even know where they are now, myself. I don't know where they are. I
25 couldn't even contact them. They just disappeared in the night.

26 **COMMISSIONER GIBSON:** Thanks for your answers.

27 **CHAIR:** Thank you. We've just got one more set of questions for you.

28 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** Thank you, Mr Temple, I'll try and keep them short for you.
29 The first question relates to the leadership of Gloriavale and from the evidence that you've
30 submitted we see that there are ten people in the leadership that are either Shepherds or
31 Servants, that's correct?

32 **MR TEMPLE:** Nine people, yes.

33 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** Nine people?

34 **MR TEMPLE:** Nine people.

1 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** Thank you. And so when decisions are disseminated, they
2 start at the top and you filter it down through the community; is that correct?

3 **MR TEMPLE:** Not entirely, it depends on what the decision is. We have a number of businesses
4 and they all have managers and they're free to work and make decisions in their businesses.
5 The ladies work in the food, the clothing, washing and so forth, they're free to make
6 decisions among themselves, although they will come and ask me for some decisions that
7 are a bit complicated and they're not sure, but they're free, they're perfectly capable of doing
8 their jobs (inaudible).

9 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** Thank you. So operational decisions like that go without
10 saying, but I'm talking more fundamental issues like the very big issue that you've -- where
11 there's been a change within your community around the acceptance of abuse. So is that
12 socialised from the top? So in other words, do you and the other nine leaders, do you
13 actually actively talk about that so that there can be a change of culture within the
14 community? And I see Ms Stedfast nodding there.

15 **MR TEMPLE:** Very much so. Very much so. And in that lead group they're well known in the
16 community that people can go report offences or anything of concern they can go report to
17 them and they can come and report to me.

18 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** Thank you. That then leads to my second question around the
19 apology you issued but specifically to the leavers group where you haven't actually reached
20 out to them, but this is the group that have been particularly harmed, is there intention to do
21 that before the end of this year, to reach out to them?

22 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes.

23 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** To have a meeting so they can hold you accountable if this
24 meeting doesn't take place? Because you've stated a number of times it's your intention to
25 do that.

26 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, we will do that straight away. I'm sure that it's written out, when a person
27 said he would do that, he'd get a notice out to every leaver, there would be some it would be
28 very hard to contact, because we never hear from them. But the ones that we can contact
29 yes, we will, we can't make them big promises --

30 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** Of course.

31 **MR TEMPLE:** -- simply because we have restrictions ourselves.

32 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** But a genuine, authentic effort will be made to reach out?

33 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, there will be, I can promise you that.

1 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** Thank you. My last question really is around the importance
2 of human rights and I really wanted to ask this question to Mrs Stedfast.

3 So I understood then that the special character of the school allowed you to frame
4 your curriculum where you didn't have to teach Māori, you didn't have to teach European
5 culture, so that's actually permitted because of the State's oversight. Is that what I was
6 hearing you -- was that what I was hearing? Did I hear that correctly?

7 **MRS STEDFAST:** I think so, yeah.

8 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** And so the importance, then, of children's rights, is that
9 something that as a community you see as an important value? So I'm talking about the
10 international conventions that New Zealand has ratified, which means as a nation, so you
11 start at the top as a nation, you then break it down to communities, that we have signed up
12 to, the Government signed up to on our behalf. Is that something that is actively promoted
13 and honoured in the Gloriavale community?

14 **MRS STEDFAST:** So more and more it is, and as we learn and as we do training and
15 professional learning and development, we are learning so much more about that. A lot of
16 ignorance has been in the past about all that, but going forward, children are very, very
17 important to us. So yeah, that is definitely an aim.

18 **MR TEMPLE:** Love and care and hope. Love and care and help.

19 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** Which would be consistent with your theology.

20 **MR TEMPLE:** Yes, yes.

21 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** My last point was, again in the evidence that you filed with us
22 we see that you're right, you have been making minor changes to your What We Believe
23 document, the first starting in 1991 when you amended your document so that you could
24 allow your religious leaders to remarry, in this particular case it was Hopeful Christian. I
25 think my point there is, when it pertains to the leaders and presumably the Servants, you
26 move very quickly, but when it pertains to the populace it's very slow. Would you accept
27 that as a general proposition, from all of the evidence that we've seen filed and what we've
28 heard?

29 **MR TEMPLE:** No, no, that's definitely not, we're all equal, there's nothing special about these
30 leaders, they get no special privileges, they all eat the same food, sit at the same table, and
31 everything is the same, a rule like that is applied to everybody the same.

32 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** Thank you, Mr Temple. I'm just really putting that change and
33 I'm putting it against, again, what's been filed in your documents, that relates to

1 Government changes, you rely on Government agencies to make changes that will then
2 force a change in your own community behaviour.

3 So that pertains to changes in the early childhood centre when it comes to sexual
4 abuse allegations, Police investigations. But for the State interference, or for the State
5 presence, the community is very slow to move on behalf of issues that are raised by your
6 community people. That was simply my point.

7 **MR TEMPLE:** Okay, but change is being made. Now, we're trying to change -- we're changing a
8 culture and that does take a little bit of time. But -- changes will be made but it will take a
9 bit of time for them to really shine before the public.

10 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** Thank you, Mr Temple.

11 **MRS STEDFAST:** I would like to just share a little about that, because what you're saying is that
12 the leadership will quickly change something that involves them but they're slow to change
13 something that involves just the population of the community, so to speak.

14 Well, from my point of view, they know about their problems because they are
15 living them. If the community doesn't have a channel to communicate our problems to the
16 leadership, the leadership won't know about them on a general basis. So that's why having
17 the child protection leads in there actually opens up a channel. We also have now
18 established an advisory committee, which has women and young men and, you know,
19 people that are not necessarily in the leadership, but they are often going around the
20 community, finding out these issues, asking these questions, and then feeding back to the
21 leadership because the leaders themselves personally can't just go around everything all
22 day.

23 So it was actually a process of putting more people there to open up those channels
24 to the leadership so that change, so the leaders would know what was happening, and that
25 change could happen for the, you know, general people in the community. So that's a really
26 good change that has happened and we've put in place.

27 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** Thank you.

28 **MR TEMPLE:** Thank you, blessing Rachel. Okay. I'll repeat it again, any of you people have
29 questions you didn't get answered today but you'd like answered, just get them to me and
30 I'll get you an answer back, maybe a more thorough than I have given today, I'll have more
31 time to go and research.

32 **CHAIR:** Yes, and you'll have more chance to think about it as well. We're very grateful for that
33 offer Mr Temple, which we accept.

1 It's brought us to the end of the day and for a long day of evidence. Can I first thank
2 the Gloriavale Leavers' Trust who made opening statements at the beginning. I know that
3 some of the members of that trust have been in the room all day. I'm sure there are others
4 who are watching and I just want to acknowledge that you have afforded us the privilege of
5 hearing from you and I hope that the day has been of some assistance to you.

6 And then may I finish by thanking both of you, our witnesses today, Mrs Stedfast
7 and Mr Temple. I know it's been a long day. And it's not just today that you have provided
8 us with evidence, we have a heap of documents which I know that you've probably spent a
9 lot of time working on and I want to acknowledge the work that's gone into those and thank
10 you very much for your cooperation with the Commission hearing. And finally I wish you
11 a good evening.

12 We're going to end now with a karakia and if you would like to stay and participate
13 in that you are welcome, otherwise we will wish you farewell.

14 **MR TEMPLE:** I would just like to apologise for us taking up your whole day. It is our fault, you
15 can blame us that you had to take up your whole day.

16 **CHAIR:** There is no blame, Mr Temple.

17 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** It was very illuminating.

18 **CHAIR:** We had the whole day set aside for you and I'm glad we've used it to everybody's best
19 advantage so thank you again for your help.

20 So kua mutu aku mahi i tēnei wā. We will now close with a karakia, kei a koe matua.

21 **Waiata Whakataka Te Hau and karakia mutunga by Ngāti Whātua Ōrākei**

22 **Hearing adjourns at 5.17 pm to Monday, 17 October 2022 at 9 am**